## Revue d'Etudes Tibétaines



### Revue d'Etudes Tibétaines

numéro dix-sept — Octobre 2009

ISSN 1768-2959

Directeur: Jean-Luc Achard

Comité de rédaction : Anne Chayet, Pierre Arènes, Jean-Luc Achard.

Comité de lecture: Pierre Arènes (CNRS), Ester Bianchi (Dipartimento di Studi sull'Asia Orientale, Venezia), Anne Chayet (CNRS), Fabienne Jagou (EFEO), Rob Mayer (Oriental Institute, University of Oxford), Fernand Meyer (CNRS-EPHE), Françoise Pommaret (CNRS), Ramon Prats (Universitat Pompeu Fabra, Barcelona), Brigitte Steinman (Université Paul Valéry, Montpellier III) Jean-Luc Achard (CNRS).

#### Périodicité

La périodicité de la *Revue d'Etudes Tibétaines* est généralement bi-annuelle, les mois de parution étant, sauf indication contraire, Octobre et Avril. Les contributions doivent parvenir au moins deux (2) mois à l'avance. Les dates de proposition d'articles au comité de lecture sont Février pour une parution en Avril et Août pour une parution en Octobre.

#### **Participation**

La participation est ouverte aux membres statutaires des équipes CNRS, à leurs membres associés, aux doctorants et aux chercheurs non-affiliés.

Les articles et autres contributions sont proposées aux membres du comité de lecture et sont soumis à l'approbation des membres du comité de rédaction. Les articles et autres contributions doivent être inédits ou leur réédition doit être justifiée et soumise à l'approbation des membres du comité de lecture.

Les documents doivent parvenir sous la forme de fichiers Word, envoyés à l'adresse du directeur (jeanluc.achard@sfr.fr).

#### Comptes-rendus

Les livres proposés pour compte-rendu doivent être envoyés à la *Revue d'Etudes Tibétaines*, 22, avenue du Président Wilson, 75016 Paris.

#### Langues

Les langues acceptées dans la revue sont le français (en priorité), l'anglais, l'allemand, l'italien et l'espagnol.

La *Revue d'Etudes Tibétaines* est publiée par l'UMR 8155 du CNRS, Paris, dirigée par Alain Thote.



## Revue d'Etudes Tibétaines

numéro dix-sept — Octobre 2009

Fabienne Jago	u
---------------	---

Liu Manqing: A Sino-Tibetan Adventurer and the Origin of a New Sino-Tibetan Dialogue in the 1930s

page 5

#### Henk Blezer

A Preliminary Report on Investigations into (*Bon nyid*) 'Od gsal and Zhi khro bar do in Earlier Zhang zhung sNyan rgyud and sNyan rgyud Literature

Page 21

#### Karen Liljenberg

On the history and identification of two of the *Thirteen Later Translations* of the Dzogchen Mind Series

Page 51

#### Kurt Keutzer & Kevin O'Neill

A Handlist of the Bonpo Kangyur and Tengyur

page 63

Sommaire des anciens numéros

page 129

## Liu Manqing: A Sino-Tibetan Adventurer and the Origin of a New Sino-Tibetan Dialogue in the 1930s

#### Fabienne Jagou<sup>1</sup> Member of the École française d'Extrême-Orient

he young lady who departed from Nanjing to Lhasa in 1929 against the will of her family and who endured the hardship of a year's travel through the gorges of Khams and the snowy mountains peaks of Tibet is known by her Chinese name: Liu Manqing (1906-1941). A few decades ago, parents used to tell their children her story, and Liu Manqing's name is still on their minds many years later. Many contradictory accounts about Liu Manqing's personal life are still told, making her life a story, if not an epic, then at least an extraordinary legend.

In 1929, Liu Manqing was 23 years old. In China, the government of Nanjing, with Chiang Kai-shek (1887-1975) at its head, has just been founded. The era of the warlords was finished, at least in theory, and the Republican government was ready to implement its ideas about the unification of the five nationalities (Han, Manchus, Tibetans, Mongols and Muslim Turks). In Tibet, the 13th Dalai-lama (1876-1933), the spiritual and temporal head of the Tibetan government since 1895, had closed his country to foreigners including British and Chinese since the failure of his national reforms at the end of the 1920s.<sup>2</sup> In a context of the status quo between China and Tibet, the Sino-Tibetan margins (the Tibetan province of Khams, Eastern Tibet or the future Xikang province of China: Western China) can be considered a link, or transitional zone between the two countries and their cultures thanks to its geographic position and to its people, educated in Chinese and able to understand both cultures and both languages. The Chinese who wanted to study Tibetan religion or to travel in Tibet had understood this point well. By their travel and their dialogue with Tibetan people they were able to construct a politics of communication between Khams, Central Tibet and China proper and so between Tibet and China. The wish to renew a new dialogue came also from Tibetans. When Liu Manqing went to Lhasa, members of the Khams pa elite also went to

Fabienne Jagou, "Liu Manqing: A Sino-Tibetan Adventurer and the Origin of a New Sino-Tibetan Dialogue in the 1930s", Revue d'Etudes Tibétaines, no. 17, Octobre 2009, p. 5-20.

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> This paper has been presented at the Xth Seminar of the International Association for Tibetan Studies, St Hugh's College, University of Oxford, 6-12 September 2003. I would like to thank the Tibetans I met in Oxford who knew stories about Liu Manqing, Peng Wenbin and Peter Zarrow for their insightful comments.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> A Chinese mission came to Tibet in 1919, followed by a British one led by Charles Bell in 1920. In 1919, the Chinese government ordered the Gansu province government to send representatives to Tibet to meet the 13<sup>th</sup> Dalai-lama and the 9<sup>th</sup> Panchen-lama in order to reinforce the Chinese influence in the Tibetan capital. This mission arrived in Lhasa on 24 November 1919, and stayed there more than five months. Spencer Chapman, *Lhasa, the Holy city*. London: Readers Union Ltd. 1940. p. 2; Huang Yusheng, *Xizang difang yu zhongyang zhengfu guanxi shi*. Lhasa: Xizang renmin chubanshe, 1995, p. 226.

Nanjing searching for the Chinese government's support, as well as the Tibetans from Central Tibet who disagreed with the policies of the 13<sup>th</sup> Dalai-lama.<sup>3</sup> Many people were then on the move, building up dynamic and negotiative features of Sino-Tibetan relations.

Liu Manqing was of Chinese nationality, although she was born in Lhasa (of a Chinese father and a Tibetan mother), and she lived in Nanjing as part of the Khams pa community there. She symbolizes the young half–Tibetan, half-Chinese generation that was able to handle the question of the China-Tibet relationship in a more objective and constructive manner. As such, Liu had to manage her beliefs in Chinese policies towards Tibet and her wishes to help Tibet as well. We will see that her first trip to Tibet revealed a kind of Chinese as well as Tibetan nationalism.

Liu's trip was considered an extraordinary one at the time: she was a young lady who left Nanjing, the Chinese capital, to go to Lhasa, the Tibetan capital, with a Tibetan man as an escort. She was the first foreign lady ever to be received by the 13th Dalai-lama, not only once but twice during her first trip in 1930.4 Her heroic travels were noticed among her Chinese contemporaries in Republican China, and later among scholars from the People Republic of China and Western countries. No written Tibetan testimony seems available today, but Liu is remembered as a heroine by the Tibetan people. Peng Wenbin wrote: "the story of Liu Manqing can be studied in many ways and might become many stories and a few publications." This paper will focus on the politics of travel, i.e., the role of Liu Manqing in Sino-Tibetan relations and the significance of her mission as part of a revival of a Tibetan international policy. Neither the literary value of her account, nor questions of identity or gender will be analyzed in this paper. Liu Manqing's own writings will be our main source to analyze her motives (the nationalism question) as well as her travel activities (the heroine legend).

Liu Manqing wrote three books. Two were related to Tibet while the third dealt with education in the Chinese borderlands. Travel accounts were fashionable at the beginning of the twentieth century and book titles had to be original to attract readers. The fashion came from the review *New Asia (Xinyaxiya)*. In its third volume, editorial commentary called upon readers to transform their view of the peripheries from the cliché imaginary of desolation to an appreciation of their 'limitless mysteries' and 'inexhaustible treasures'. It called for photographs of the landscapes and peoples of those regions, so that readers could become more familiar to them.<sup>6</sup> And we could

For example the case of the 9<sup>th</sup> Panchen-lama (1883-1937) who left Tibet to China in 1923. Cf. F. Jagou, *Le 9e Panchen Lama (1883-1937) Enjeu des relations sino-tibétaines.* Paris: École française d'Extrême-Orient, 2004.

Others women travelers went to Tibet during the first half of the twentieth century: Liu Manqing met the well-known Belgian traveler, Alexandra David-Néel, who went to the Tibetan provinces of A mdo and Khams at the very beginning of the century. Other women traveled to Khams included the American Anne R. Taylor at the end of the nineteenth century and the Chinese Feng Yunxian, who traveled to Khams in the 1930s. All of them failed to reach Lhasa, the Tibetan capital. Others ladies might have traveled in these Tibetan areas that we still do not know about.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Personal communication.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> P. Duara, Sovereignty and Authenticity. Manchukuo and the East Asian Modern. Lanham: Rowman & Littlefield, 2003, p. 199.

really speak of a frontier travel literature related to the northwest and southwest. Liu Manqing's travel diary, Expedition in a Carriage to Xikang and Tibet (Kang Zang yaozheng), met the conditions for success. Its title was original but misleading since she actually traveled by foot.8 Indeed, she had to find a way to show that her journey was overland through Khams and not through India.9 This travel account is divided into two parts. The first describes her travels to Tibet via the Chinese province of Sichuan in 1929-1930. It is divided into sixty-two chapters that recount chronologically as well as by subject the steps of her journey. She writes about the difficulties of travel while describing what she saw and heard. The second part, a supplement or addendum (xuji), narrates her last trip to Tibet via the Chinese province of Yunnan in 1938. This part is far shorter with only nine chapters. Her aim was to describe another route to Tibet. 10 Finally, she gives her opinion on the conduct of Chinese officers on the Sino-Tibetan borders, criticizing their lack of respect for the doctrine of Sun Yat-sen (1866-1925). Both parts end with details of her itineraries and information about the length of the legs of her journeys.

As a consequence, the book met with success, had gone through three editions in China by 1938, and was translated into Tibetan, Mongol, Japanese, English, Hindi and Latin during the Republican period. More recently, it has been republished in Japan in 1986, in Taiwan in 1987 and in China in 1998. The consequence of the book met with success, had gone through three editions in China in China in 1938, and was translated into Tibetan, Mongol, Japanese, English, Hindi and Latin during the Republican period. The control of the con

Tibet (Xizang), Liu's second book (1934), is a rather short (sixty pages) introduction to Tibetan culture. Its fourteen chapters address subjects such as geography, the real situation of Tibet, nomadic life, cuisine habits, dresses, weddings, and so forth. It does not refer to the author's own travel experience at all.

Her last publication was very different from the first two. *Education in the Chinese Border Areas* (*Bianjiang jiaoyu*), published in 1937, marks the political and social influences Liu Manqing experienced after her Tibetan sojourns and her involvement in Tibetan policy discussions.

#### A young lady's courage

No doubt the trip that Liu Manqing made from Nanjing to Lhasa via Dar rtse mdo from 15 July 1929 (the date of her departure from Nanjing) to 3

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> See for example, Peng Wenbin, "Allegorizing the Local on the Borderland: Ai Wu's *Nanxingji* and National Subjectivity." *Inner Asia*, vol.4, n°1, 2002, special issue: *Traveling cultures and histories: nation-building and frontier politics in Twentieth Century China*.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> Printed by Wang Yunwu and He Bingsong in Shanghai in 1938 (3<sup>rd</sup> edition).

As Duara writes, "Indeed, to travel from China to Yunnan, it was best to take a boat to Vietnam and cross back into Yunnan on the French railroad; to travel to Xinjiang one had best take the trans-Siberian railroad and go through Soviet territory; Tibet was most accessible *via* India; and so on." *op. cit.*, p. 188-189.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> Foreword of Kang Zang yaozheng xuji, p. 141.

Huang Jingwan, foreword to *Kang Zang yaozheng*. The Japanese version is available: *Xikang Xizang ta cha ji*, Tokyo: Gaizao she, 1939.

Josei tensi chibetto wo iku. Tokyo: Baishuishe, 1986; Kang Zang yaocheng, Taibei: Nantian (Yazhou minzu kaogu congkan), 1987; Guomin zhengfu nu mi shi fu Zang jishi, Peking: Minzu chubanshe (Minguo bianjiang youji xindu congshu), 1998.

February 1930 (the date of her arrival at Lhasa) was harsh.<sup>13</sup> But her determination was high and her ability to speak Tibetan was an important advantage in the process which allowed her to think about a mission to Tibet. However, this process is quite hard to detail; there are a lot of blanks in the biographical accounts at our disposal. Most of the accounts were included in Liu's own diary or were based on it by her prefacers (Rtse dbyangs sgrol dkar, alias Jiang Weixin, and Huang Jingwan). In Chinese travel accounts, travelers most often revealed less of their personal information and travel agendas; that kind of information was considered trivial compared with such topics as encountering important persons or spectacular scenery.<sup>14</sup>

Liu Manqing's first act of heroism was to convince Chiang Kai-shek, then President of the Republic of China, to be allowed to go to Tibet. Our first tentative assessment concerns the way Liu Manqing became the interpreter of Blo bzang Pa sangs, then the abbot of one of the Wutai Shan monasteries in the Chinese province of Shanxi and envoy of the 13th Dalai-lama to the new Chinese Republican government in 1929. 15 We know little about either the meeting or the Abbot's mission. But Chiang Kai-shek was very impressed by Liu's interpreting work, and he offered her a job in the government as a reward. 16 Liu Manqing could have been satisfied with her fate. But, a few months later, she asked her director Gu Yingfen to allow her to go to Tibet in order to examine the situation there. With Gu's encouragement, to support her request to the government she wrote that she wanted to thank the Republican government for giving her a job and wished to see her native place again. These motives may have seemed sufficient to the Chinese government, as officials agreed and nominated Khang Itag rgyal mtshan (chin.: Kongdang Jiangcheng), a secretary of the second degree, to accompany her to Tibet. Presumably the Republican government was not so much interested in Liu's feelings as in the chance to acquire some Tibetanspeakers to give them more solid information about conditions in Tibet. Yet both Liu Manqing's initiative and the government's consent seem unexpected. Nothing had prepared Liu Manging to become either a member of the Chinese government or an envoy of the Chinese Republican government to Tibet.

Yudhona, to give Liu her Tibetan name, was born in Lhasa in 1906 to a Tibetan mother and a Chinese (*Han*) father. Her father seems to have been a member of the Manchu *yamen* in Lhasa.<sup>17</sup> She and her family left Tibet for Darjeeling in Sikkim when the Chinese were ordered to leave Tibet before the 13<sup>th</sup> Dalai-lama returned there from British India in 1912. Her parents

<sup>6</sup> She became a secretary of the first degree at the civil office of the State Council (*xingzheng yuan wen guan chu yi deng shujiguan*). In practice, this was a low position.

On the return trip, she went back to Nanjing via India and arrived in the Chinese capital on 7 August 1930.

Peng Wenbin, personal communication.

Liu Manqing, p. 1; Huang Yusheng comp., op. cit., p. 230.

Xirao Nima, *Guomin zhengfu nu mi shi fu Zang jishi*, Peking: Minzu chubanshe (Minguo bianjiang youji xindu congshu), 1998, introduction, p. 6: Liu Huaxuan, Liu Manqing's father, was the secretary to the Manchu commissioner in Tibet. The British thought she was the daughter of Lian Yu, the Manchu commissioner in Tibet from 1906 to 1912, begotten with his Tibetan wife; cf. IOR/L/PS/10/1088, file 1792/1930, telegram of Lieutenant-Colonel C.T. Daukes to the Foreign Secretary, 19/2/1930.

opened a shop in Darjeeling. Six years later in 1918 Liu, then twelve years old, and her family left Darjeeling for Peking. She entered a Chinese primary school (*Beiping shili di yi xiaoxue dushu*), and, according to one of her biographers, her ability was so high that while she only spoke Tibetan when she joined the school, she became fluent in Chinese in six months. She then got a diploma from a women's normal school (*Tongzhou nuzi shifan xuexiao*). Her studies could have stopped there because her father decided she should be married. She obeyed him, but then divorced and renewed her studies. She entered a medical school (Daoji Hospital) to study nursing, because, according to her biographer, she wanted to be useful to the Tibetan people. Liu gives no details about Tibetan medicine in her account. Actually, the emphasis on her medical schooling may have been added later to embellish Liu's own story and her willingness to go to Tibet.

#### The Khams pa connection

As a first hypothesis, we can argue that Liu Manqing's family helped her to become well known in China's Tibetan community. The only detail about her maternal side we get is about her grandmother whom Liu met in She'erpo near Dar rtse mdo. Liu describes her grandmother as very poor, and obviously very surprised and happy at meeting her granddaughter for the first time. The detail is important because it means that Liu Manqing was a Khams pa on her mother's side, and in all likelihood this was important for her integration into the Nanjing Khams pa community.<sup>19</sup>

As a matter of fact, many Tibetans who received an education in Chinese as well as in Tibetan circulated in the Mongolian and Tibetan Affairs Commission sphere of influence; most of them came from 'Ba' thang. Liu Manging does not mention them much, referring to only one of them: Skal bzang tshe ring (chin.: Gesang Zeren or Wang Tianhua, 1899-1941). Skal bzang tshe ring is a representative example of the Tibetan youth of the time. From 'Ba' thang, he confronted the Tibetan and Chinese struggle over the region and its impact on the area's development. He also benefited from the opening of an American missionary school and eventually became an important member of the Mongolian and Tibetan Affairs Commission. As he himself wrote, he was the first Tibetan to join the Nationalist Party (Guomindang) and to be a delegate on behalf of Tibet or Xikang in the Republican government's third to the sixth plenary sessions. Skal bzang tshe ring attended both the public school established by Zhao Erfeng and also the missionary-run West China Primary School (huaxi xuexiao). Liu Manqing became very interested in the experience of the American missionary school in the district of 'Ba' thang. She praised Dr. Shelton who first rented a piece of land and began to construct a hospital, a school and a church in the town. According to Liu, Dr. Shelton's 'Ba' thang school taught both Chinese and Tibetan, thus producing a Tibetan elite.<sup>20</sup>

Actually, the teaching of nursing began in China in the 1930s, therefore it is quite difficult to determine whether Liu Manqing was a nurse.

We know little about her father. His name was Liu Huaxuan or Liu Rongguang, and his nickname was Zang.

 $<sup>^{20}</sup>$  Liu Manqing, p. 44-45.

In any case, because of "some incompatibilities," Skal bzang tshe ring left for Yunnan before being admitted into the Xikang Officers Training Institute.21 Like Liu Manqing after him, he was noticed by the Chinese government when he served as an interpreter during a Sino-Tibetan meeting in Nanjing and because he was very close with the 9th Panchen-lama. 22 Dai Jitao, president of the Examination Yuan and close adviser to Chiang Kaishek, was interested in frontier affairs and Tibetan Buddhism and recommended him to the Mongolian and Tibetan Affairs Commission, which appointed him as Commissioner and head of the Tibetan Affairs Division in 1927. He held that post when Liu Manqing left for Tibet in July 1929. Skal bzang tshe ring's political career became increasingly important in the Nationalist Party and his movement for the independence of Khams is well-known.<sup>23</sup> His political involvement could have helped Liu Manging when she returned to Nanjing in August 1930 and became an important member of the China Tibetan community and a specialist on frontier affairs for the Chinese government.24

However, Liu Manqing did at least first mention Skal bzang tshe ring's leading role in the Khams pa community of Nanjing. She noticed that forty to fifty Tibetans from Khams province came to study in Nanjing following Skal bzang tshe ring's example. The supplement to her book, written in 1938, gives details about the nomination of Skal bzang tshe ring as chief of the Nationalist Party branch of Xikang (Xikang sheng dang bu) and his propaganda work as a member of the Xikang government. She praises his work as a propaganda agent on the border, giving evidence of the welcome he received from local chiefs. Liu Manqing and Skal bzang tshe ring did in fact work together. Liu Manqing conducted many propaganda projects after her return from Tibet. Indeed, it seems that the aftermath of her trip was much more important than the trip itself regarding her commitment to the policies of the Chinese government toward Xikang province.

Upon her return to China, Liu Manqing became the founder of and an activist in many new Tibetan or border associations.<sup>26</sup> From a practical point

Skal bzang tshe ring wrote that he ran away to Yunnan without giving any explanation. Actually after he qualified from the West China Primary School, he entered a business school which did not suit him. That is why he left for Yunnan. Gesang Zeren, "Bian ren chu yan (Humble Speeches of a Frontier Person)". In Shen Yunlong, ed. Jindai Zhongguo Shiliao congkan Xubian (Supplements to the Series of Historical Date of Modern China). N°11 (reprint). Taibei: Wenhai chubanshe (The Culture Sea Publishing House), 1974, p. 3; Ren Yimin, Sichuan jin xian dai renwu zhuan. Chengdu: Sichuan sheng shehui kexueyuan, 1985, p. 295.

When Gongdeng tashi, representative of the 9<sup>th</sup> Panchen-lama, was on a mission to Nanjing through Khams in 1926, Skal bzang tshe ring served as his interpreter and accompanied him to the capital. Cf. Gesang Zeren, *op. cit.*, p. 5.

Gesang Zeren, op .cit.; Peng Wenbin, "Frontier Process, Provincial Politics and Movements for Khampa Autonomy During the Republican Period". In L. Epstein, ed. Khams pa Histories. Visions of People, Place and Authority. Leiden: Brill, 2002, p. 64.

It is hard to determine the nature of the relationship between Skal bzang tshe ring and Liu Manqing. According to informants, Liu Manqing and Skal bzang tshe ring were married first but as they could not get a child, then Skal bzang tshe ring married Liu Manyun who gave birth to two children. Some sources mention that they were married after she joined the Chinese government, Ren Yimin, op. cit. p. 296.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> Liu Manqing, p. 155.

In 1931, she and a group of scholars and officials founded the Association of the Border Areas of China (*Zhongguo bianjiang xuehui*). On 7 October 1931, she created the Nanjing

of view, the members of these associations acted as investigators for the Mongolian and Tibetan Affairs Commission. They were also propaganda agents. We have two detailed examples of Liu Manqing's actions at this time.

The first was her attempt to go to Lhasa again. In May 1932, Liu left Nanjing by way of Hong Kong. She wanted to go to Tibet to comfort the Tibetan people and to inform them about the resistance of the Chinese Republican government against the Japanese. At this time, the 'Ba' thang uprisings had just begun and the roads were closed and unsecured. The fighting between the army of Central Tibet and Skal bzang tshe ring lasted three months from mid-April to mid-July 1932, and Liu Manqing was there at the moment. We do not know how much Liu Manqing was involved in the 'Ba' thang uprising, but I doubt her presence there was an accident. In any case, she found a way to transmit a letter from the Chinese government and gifts to the 13<sup>th</sup> Dalai-lama. And when a report entitled "Report on the administration of all Tibet" (*Gao quan Zang guanmin shu*) from the 13<sup>th</sup> Dalai-lama to the Republican government just arrived in Nanjing, she received a personal letter from the Tibetan leader regretting she was not able to come to Lhasa at this time:

"Last time you came to Lhasa from far enduring hardship to praise for the cordial Sino-Tibetan relationship. I praise you for having often helped Tibet after returning to Nanjing. Unfortunately this time, I sincerely regret that fighting broke out in Khams. But, I think you understand the reasons of this conflict and that as soon as you will go back to Nanjing you will make a report to the government. Your wish to come to Lhasa has been impeded by the fighting but I hope you will be able to come again in a time of peace. I especially appointed Paizhang Dingceng to communicate with you, he is trustworthy and you can give him all the letters and things you would like him to bring back to Tibet."<sup>27</sup>

The third attempt of Liu Manqing to go to Lhasa was related to "the team of Khams pas, representatives of Chiang Kai-shek, giving comfort to the front lines (*Xikang minzhong weilao qian xian Jiang shi daibiao tuan*)." The members of this team first tried to collect donations from Tibetans living in China. They went to Chongqing where their propaganda job must have been successful because they received many donations (especially gold or silver jewels) from Tibetans living in Sichuan.<sup>28</sup> Then they decided to go to Tibet to

Khams pas and Tibetan Compatriots Association for Resistance to the Japanese and National Salvation (*Kang Zang lu Jing tongxiang kang Ri jiuguo hui*). She also took part in the fourth popular assembly. In 1932, she represented Tibet at the Assembly of Reconstruction. Further studies will be done to analyze the identity of these groups and to determine if they were Guomindang or independent groups. She and Blo bzang rgyal mtshan, the representative of the 9<sup>th</sup> Panchen-lama in Nanjing, worked out a "project to improve Tibetan and Mongolian education, religion, political and military affairs in order to resist to the Japanese." In November 1937, Liu Manqing founded and became the president of the "propaganda team of Khams pas and Tibetans dedicated to the resistance against enemies *Kang Zang minzhong kangdi fu nan xuanchuan tuan.*" In the summer of 1938, Liu Manqing and Khams pas like Skal bzang tshe ring, founded a new group, "The Team of Khams pas, Representative of Chiang Kai-shek, Giving Comfort to the Front Lines *Xikang minzhong weilao qian xian Jiang shi daibiao tuan.*"

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Xirao Nima, *op. cit.*, p. 17.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> Gezang Zeren, op. cit., p. 1.

collect other donations. In October 1938, two teams went to Tibet.<sup>29</sup> Their propaganda work was divided into three stages: first, to question the people; second, to give gifts; and third, to explain the policy of resistance against Japan first to the regent Rwa sgreng (Reting, regent from 1934 to 1941), the officials and the aristocrats, then to the clergy, and finally to the commoners. They made speeches in mosques (Liu Manqing was Muslim)<sup>30</sup> and in primary schools. They showed propaganda films three times: in the palace of Reting, in the house of Tsha rong (1886-1959), and in the residence of the Mongolian and Tibetan Affairs Commission agents in Lhasa. The result of this mission is quite hard to know; apparently Liu was given no encouragement by the Tibetan government.

However, Liu's main achievement was her book, which was a 268-page report about *Education in the Border Areas*. This report, containing twenty-one chapters in three parts, includes theories about education, a statement about education in the border areas of China (Gansu, Ningxia, Qinghai, Chahar, Suiyuan, Mongolia, Khams and Central Tibet, and Xinjiang) and a reform project to improve education. We do not know whether the government actually used this report. At the time, the Chinese Republic was coming under full-blown Japanese attack and was about to retreat to the southwest.

#### Liu Manqing's audiences with the 13th Dalai-lama

Liu Manqing's stay in Lhasa gives some indication about the purposes of her trip and her goals for Sino-Tibetan relationships. While her behavior suggests that her aim was to show that she was received by the aristocratic and official segments of Tibetan society, her writings tends to embellish her role as a political envoy of the Chinese government. Her observations about the Tibetan political situation in 1930 are superficial or entirely lacking. Apparently, Liu did not notice that Tibet had just undergone a political and religious crisis. She does not refer at all to the 13th Dalai-lama's proclamation of the independence of Tibet in 1912, or to his efforts to raise an army. She also fails to mention the opposition of the religious segment of Tibetan society to the founding of the army because its members were becoming too powerful. Religious elements opposed military reform so violently that members of the Tibetan government (Tsha rong, commander in chief of the army, minister and director of finance, for example) were degraded and the 13<sup>th</sup> Dalai-lama gave up his reform project. As a matter of fact, when Liu Manging arrived in Lhasa, the policies of the 13<sup>th</sup> Dalai-lama had become oriented toward the preservation of the traditional Tibetan Buddhist polity, and he had abandoned attempts to give Tibet a place between the two powerful countries of China and the British Imperial India.

Arriving in Lhasa on 3 February 1930, Liu Manqing was welcomed by priests and Tsha rong, the now ex-chief commander of the Tibetan army, ex-

The first team, composed of four members (Xiao Pinzhang, Li Jianhou, Rang Zhuo, and Guo Xiangqiu) left Nanjing on 28 November 1938. They went to Lhasa through Yunnan and arrived there in January 1939. The second team, headed by Liu Manqing and Zhu Ma went through Burma and India and arrived in Lhasa on 2 February 1939. Both teams stayed there six months, until 7 June 1939. Cf. Xirao Nima, op. cit., p. 18.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>30</sup> Li Tieh-tseng, *Tibet, Today and Yesterday*. New York: Bookman associates, 1960, p. 161.

minister and ex-director of finance, a man who still had much influence in Lhasa. Tsha rong became her adviser during her stay there. He taught her Tibetan customs (for example, she learnt how to do traditional religious prostrations with him but finally renounced its performance in front of the dalai-lama) and rules (e.g., that Tibetan aristocrats would not speak to her before she met the dalai-lama, and how to present a petition to the dalailama). She waited almost two months before meeting the dalai-lama. During this time she went to the Mosque to listen to teachings, concluding that the dalai-lama was still tolerant toward foreign religion, and then went to her father's Lhasa house. Liu also noticed that at the time the Tibetans were hostile to a British presence in Lhasa and concerned about the activities of Wangfel Laden La (Liandian in Chinese, 1876-1937), a Sikkimese agent for the British in Lhasa. Waiting for the 13<sup>th</sup> Dalai-lama's answer, she describes the administrative structure of the Tibetan government, the festivities for the New Year (5 March) and especially the military parade. Finally, Liu Manging met the 13<sup>th</sup> Dalai-lama twice on 28 March and 25 May 1930.

Liu Manqing transcribed her interview with the 13<sup>th</sup> Dalai-lama in a way that embellished the aim of her mission to Tibet and her own responsibilities. We will first give the content of these interviews and then analyze them to determine if Liu's trip was an official mission and if the Chinese government had given her the responsibility to negotiate on its behalf.

On 28 March 1930, during her first interview with the dalai-lama, the Tibetan leader was surprised to learn that they could communicate without the help of an interpreter and asked her several times if she could converse in Tibetan. Their exchange was rather informal: the dalai-lama asked about her stay and accommodations in Lhasa and her family. They also discussed her education, and the dalai-lama questioned Liu about education in China, wanting to know if many Tibetans got into Chinese schools. For her part, Liu informed the dalai-lama about the creation of the new Republican government in Nanjing, emphasizing that government policy followed the Three Principles of the People of Sun Yat-sen, the leader of the Chinese Revolution of 1911, and the pacific coexistence of the five nationalities.<sup>31</sup>

On 25 May 1930, Liu Manqing went again to Nor bu gling kha, the summer palace of the dalai-lama, to say farewell to the dalai-lama and wanting him to determine the date of her departure from Lhasa. Apparently this time, the 13<sup>th</sup> Dalai-lama had greater confidence in Liu and gave her the responsibility of transmitting an oral message to Chiang Kai-shek.<sup>32</sup> It appears that the 13<sup>th</sup> Dalai-lama freely gave Liu his opinion on various important matters of Tibetan politics. He began by claiming that the relationship between China and Tibet had been deadlocked until Liu's trip. He told her that he had been pleased to see that China wanted to renew good relations with Tibet by nominating Liu as an envoy to convey the salutations of the new Chinese government. The dalai-lama also showed that he was aware of the Chinese situation and said he prayed everyday for peace in China. Then, he made some requests on various subjects. First, he hoped that the Chinese government would appoint an official to negotiate with the Khams pas because he was afraid of the reactions of the Tibetan

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>31</sup> Liu Manqing, p. 44-47.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>32</sup> In Tibet, oral messages are more important than written ones.

armies based on the border if China sent soldiers. Second, he vowed that Tibet could restore good relationships with Nepal without the interference of China. Third, he expressed his anxiety about the 9<sup>th</sup> Panchen-lama's peregrinations in Mongolia. Fourth, he felt threatened by the British occupation of India. Fifth, he asked China to send an other representative to explain its policies to the Tibetan people as Liu Manqing had to go back to China. Finally, the 13<sup>th</sup> Dalai-lama promised to choose both a representative with full authority to negotiate with China and young Tibetans to go to China and study there.<sup>33</sup> He also asked that China send to Tibet craftsman with tools such as looms for weaving cloth.<sup>34</sup>

Do these political difficulties exposed by the Tibetan leader also emerge in the observations made by Liu during her stay in Lhasa? Between her two audiences, Liu met high officials of the Tibetan government. She met two men who were at the peak of their power: Lung shar (1880-1938) and Tsha rong, who were then favorites of the 13th Dalai-lama and had once held high positions in the Tibetan government. There were rivalries between them. Lung shar precipitated the end of Tsha rong's career and became commander-in-chief of the Tibetan army in his place. Kun 'phel lags, the third favorite of the 13th Dalai-lama also benefited from the destruction of Tsha rong. He became sole director of the mint, paper currency and ammunitions factory Grwa bzhi las khungs (from 1925 to 1927 Tsha rong and Kun 'phe lags had headed it). Nonetheless, Tsha rong remained a man with much influence in Lhasa. Liu Manqing did not meet Kun 'phe lags. In fact, she made no observations of any political significance, although she took many pictures of the members of the government she met. She did have insights into which Tibetan officers were pro-British or pro-Chinese, as it was usual at the time to categorize people as soon as the question of Tibet was raised. She noticed that while Tsha rong had adopted the English style of furniture, food, and tea, his relations with Laden la were not good.<sup>35</sup> Liu was astonished at having Lung shar receive her dressed in Manchu robes and with the old Manchu manners.36 This contrasts with the British view, which expected that Lung shar would be pro-British because of his travels in England and Europe;<sup>37</sup> in fact, his political opinions were more complicated and he became the founder of the Tibetan Republican party.

On the orders of the 13<sup>th</sup> Dalai-lama, the ministers submitted the names of seven monks and seven laymen officers for selection to be deputed to China. Ultimately, however, the idea to dispatch representatives to China was abandoned. IOR/L/PS/10/1088, file 3942/1930, telegram from C.T. Daukes, British envoy at the Court of Nepal to the Foreign Secretary of His Majesty's Government in India, 21/5/1930.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>34</sup> Liu Manqing, p. 119-120.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>35</sup> Liu Manqing, p. 98-99.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>36</sup> Liu Manqing, p. 101-102.

Lung shar accompanied the four Tibetan students who went to England supported by the British government in 1914. He was received by the King George V and Queen Mary during his stay there. He traveled to France, Germany, the Netherlands and Belgium. T.W. Shakabpa, *Tibet, a Political History*. New York: Potala, 1976, p. 249-250; H. Stoddard, *Le mendiant de l'Amdo*. Nanterre: Société d'ethnographie, 1985, p. 381-382.

#### Liu Manqing's political activities

Upon her return to China, Liu Manqing received a warm welcome from her contemporaries. She was considered "an extraordinary women who showed great courage" (*xin wei jinguo zhi xiong ye*) because of the difficulties of travel that she faced on her trip and because of her meetings with the 13<sup>th</sup> Dalailama. She was also qualified as "an eminent woman" (*yun wei nu zhong qiaochu*), <sup>38</sup> and was regarded as a reincarnation of the two Tang princesses Wencheng and Jincheng<sup>39</sup> or "a Chinese Hero". <sup>40</sup> Lin Sen (1868-1943), then president of the Chinese Republic, praised her by giving her a reward which said:

"This is a certificate of merit bestowed on Liu Manqing, who, upon approval of the Civil Office of this government, traveled ten of thousands of li to and from Tibet in one year, earnestly spreading the government's concern and care and who, without shame, had the ability to face conditions during her trip. The government gives her this reward and expresses its encouragement."  $^{41}$ 

Although Huang Jingwan, who wrote the preface to one of her books, emphasized the results of her trip, writing that "thanks to Liu Manqing, Tibet and China became closer after ten years without active relations," these flattering terms emphasized her behavior as a traveler more than her actions as an envoy of the Republican government. No one at the time judged the mission of Liu Manqing to be an official one. Of course, as we can see in her writings, she was a member of the Republican government and worked as an observer and an investigator in Khams and in Lhasa. But the way she exchanged letters with the Chinese government prove that she was not on an official mission: she wrote to her superior in the Civil Office in the Republican government, Gu Yingfen, but neither to the Mongolian and Tibetan Affairs Commission nor to Chiang Kai-shek. This point was also expressed by Lung shar, who was, with the dalai-lama, one of the addressees of the letter that Liu Manging brought from China. Lung shar asked her for information about this unknown Gu Yingfen, who had signed the letter. 42 Actually, it appears that Liu Manging herself helped to maintain a certain ambiguity about her mission: for example, she told the Yul phyogs so so'i gsar 'gyur me long, Tibetan newspaper printed in Kalimpong, that she was the bearer of a dispatch from Chiang Kai-shek and then specified that she was not the bearer of a reply. 43 Also, on her way back to China when Liu

<sup>38</sup> Huang Jinwan, preface. 1933.

Liu Manqing, 1933, foreword. Chinese historiography considers that the weddings of the Chinese Tang princesses Wencheng and Jincheng to the Tibetan kings Srong btsan sgam po in 641 and Khri Ide gtsug btsan in 710 respectively marked the beginnings of Sino-Tibetan relationships.

C.Y.W. Meng, "Miss Liu's Mission to Tibet." *China Weekly Review*, LIV (Sept. 6, 1930), p. 22, subtitled "Miss Liu—China's Hero." Wu Zhongxin, the president of the Mongol-Tibetan Affairs Commission from 1936 to 1954, thought otherwise, arguing that the comparison of Liu to Wencheng and Jincheng was a bit exaggerated as Liu "after all, is a romantic lady." Xirao Nyima, *op. cit.*, p. 20.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>41</sup> Xeirab Nyima, « A Special Envoy of the Nanjing Regime », *China's Tibet*, 1991, p. 42.

Liu Manqing, p. 102.

<sup>43</sup> IOR/L/PS/10/1088, file P938/23, telegram from J.L.R. Weir to the Foreign Secretary of His Majesty in India, dated Camp Lhasa, 16/8/1930: transmission of an interview given

stayed in Kalimpong and Calcutta she visited the British Consul-General several times; he knew nothing of the nature of her travels. For this reason the British Consul-General became suspicious and believed that she was on a secret mission for the Chinese government's Mongolian and Tibetan Affairs Commission. In fact, as we have noted above, Liu Manqing asked to go to Tibet on her own and the Chinese Republican government allowed her to leave her official duty to fulfill this wish. However, as she was an official, she benefited from a five thousand *yuan* donation and military security from the government. It seems that she had no power to enter into negotiations.

However, Liu Manqing's trip to Lhasa may have prompted the official mission of Dkon mchog 'byung gnas (1883-1944), Tibetan abbot of the Yonghegong temple in Peking. Dkon mchog 'byung gnas was entrusted to discuss political questions, including Tibet's status, with the Lhasa authorities. As such, he went on an official mission from 7 November 1929 (almost four months after Liu Manqing's departure from Nanjing) to 16 January 1930 (three weeks before Liu arrived in Lhasa). He traveled to Lhasa by way of India. They met in Lhasa, but Liu Manqing gives no details about him except that he was from the same family as Tsha rong.

It was Chiang Kai-shek who initiated the mission. He entrusted Dkon mchog 'byung gnas with the mission of transmitting a letter on his behalf to the 13<sup>th</sup> Dalai-lama. In this letter, Chiang made proposals to the 13<sup>th</sup> Dalai-lama that would have permitted China to control Tibet. These included the payment of salaries by China to the dalai-lama, the Tibetan ministers and to soldiers; China's helping Tibet in case of foreign invasion; that the 13<sup>th</sup> Dalai-lama should become a member of the Republican Party and that he should establish representative offices in China. This last point was agreeable; the 13<sup>th</sup> Dalai-lama entrusted Dkon mchog 'byung gnas with the mission of creating an Office of Tibet in Nanjing. In this way, the Chinese Republican government representative became the 13<sup>th</sup> Dalai-lama's representative as well. Tibet had now a representative in China with full authority.

Broadly speaking, Liu Manqing's trip also prompted a new British mission to Lhasa, just as the Gansu mission had made the Bell Mission a virtual inevitability in 1919 and 1920 respectively. Liu Manqing's stay in Lhasa was carefully watched by Laden La, the Sikkimese agent for the British in Tibet, who was in the Tibetan capital throughout the first half of 1930. As a matter of fact, after many years of deterioration in Tibeto-British relationships, the dalai-lama invited Lt. Colonel Weir (1883-1950), the British Political Officer in Sikkim, to visit Lhasa in 1930. Moreover, perhaps to

by Liu Manqing to the editor of the Tibetan newspaper Yul phyogs so so'i gsar 'gyur me long, dated 27/6/1930.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>44</sup> IOR/L/PS/10/1088, file P5626, note from the 7/8/1930.

Dong Shufan, Minguo shi san nian yilai zhi Zhongguo guomindang yu Xizang. Taibei: Mongolian and Tibetan affairs commission, 1985. p. 16-18; Thub bstan sangs rgyas, rGya nag tu Bod kyi sku tshab don gcod skabs dang gnyis tshugs stangs skor gyi lo rgyus thabs bral zur lam History of the Tibet representative office in China, 1982, p. 17-18.

Since F.M. Bailey, the British Political Officer in Sikkim, had come to Lhasa in 1924, no British officer went on a mission to Lhasa. After the crisis in Lhasa in 1925, the British influence there declined because the British failed to obtain Chinese agreement to the 1914 Simla Convention. They failed to supply arms and ammunitions to the Tibetan army,

counter some of the impact of Liu Manqing's feminity, the dalai-lama allowed Mrs. Weir to accompany her husband.<sup>47</sup> Although it did not entirely eradicate Tibetan suspicions about British intentions, Weir's 1930 Lhasa mission was successful in at least restoring a dialogue between British India and Tibet.

Liu Manqing's trips to Lhasa paved the way for a new Sino-Tibetan relationship by demonstrating that it was possible to go to Tibet and be received by the dalai-lama. Liu acted as a kind of unofficial *de facto* spokesman for the Republican government, as she believed in its policies, Sun Yat-sen's Three Principles of the People, and wanted to present this view to the dalai-lama. However, the fact remains that her mission was a personal one and no one in China had entrusted her with the duty of transmitting any official messages from head officials of the Chinese state. However, after her trip she did indeed engage in the kind of official propaganda work that she wanted her readers to think she had been doing all along. Liu was convinced that the Three Principles of Sun Yat-sen could be of help to the Tibetan people.

The claim for dialogue and *channels* for such dialogue have been part of the rhetoric of present-day Sino-Tibetan relations, as well as the tactics employed by both sides in the politics of image management, in order to promote openness and a will to negotiate or reconciliate. Liu Mangqing's story reminds us of the multiplicity of the means of communication and the interconnectedness of the personal with the official, giving us a glimpse of the then-volatile relations between China and Tibet.

#### **Bibliography**

Chapman Spencer, *Lhasa*, the Holy city. London: Readers Union Ltd. 1940.

Dong Shufan 董樹藩 , *Minguo shi san nian yilai zhi Zhongguo guomindang yu Xizang* 民國十三年以來之中國國民黨与西藏 (The relations between China Nationalist Party and Tibet since 1924). Taibei: Mongolian and Tibetan affairs commission, 1985.

Duara Prasenjit, Sovereignty and Authenticity. Manchukuo and the East Asian Modern. Lanham: Rowman & Littlefield, 2003.

Gesang Zeren 格桑澤仁, "Bian ren chu yan 邊人芻言(Humble Speeches of a Frontier Person)". In Shen Yunlong 沈雲龍, ed. *Jindai Zhongguo shiliao congkan xubian 近代*中國史料叢刊續編 (*Supplements to the Series of Historical Date of Modern China*). N°11 (reprint). Taibei: Wenhai chubanshe (The Culture Sea Publishing House). 1974.

Huang Yusheng 黃玉生 , Xizang difang yu zhongyang zhengfu guanxi shi 西藏地方与中央政府關係史 (History of the relations between Tibet and the Chinese central government). Lhasa: Xizang renmin chubanshe, 1995.

bringing an end to the reform movement in Tibet. A. McKay, *Tibet and the British Raj. The Frontier Cadre* 1904-1947. London: Curzon Press, 1997, p. 110.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>47</sup> A. McKay, op. cit., p. 120.

Jagou Fabienne, Le 9e Panchen Lama (1883-1937) Enjeu des relationssinotibétaines. Paris: École française d'Extrême-Orient, 2004.

Li Tieh-tseng, *Tibet, Today and Yesterday*. New York: Bookman associates, 1960.

Liu Manqing 劉曼卿, Kang Zang yaozheng 康藏軺征 (Expedition in a Carriage to Xikang and Tibet). Shanghai: Shangwu, 1933.

Liu Manqing 劉曼卿 [1<sup>st</sup> ed. 1933], Kang Zang yaozheng 康藏軺征 (Expedition in a Carriage to Xikang and Tibet). Reprint Taibei: Nantian (Yazhou minzu kaogu congkan), 1987.

Liu Manqing 劉曼卿, Guomin zhengfu nu mi shi fu Zang jishi 國民政府女密使赴藏紀實 (Historical narrative of the Guomindang secret women agent to Tibet), Peking: Minzu chubanshe (Minguo bianjiang youji xindu congshu), 1998.

Liu Manqing, Josei tensi chibetto wo iku. Tokyo: Baishuishe, 1986. Liu Manqing 劉曼卿, Xizang 西藏 (Tibet), 1934.

Liu Manqing 劉曼卿, Bianjiang jiaoyu 邊疆教育 (Education in the Chinese Border Areas). Shanghai: Shangwu, 1937.

McKay Alex, *Tibet and the British Raj. The Frontier Cadre* 1904-1947. London: Curzon Press, 1997.

Meng C.Y.W., "Miss Liu's Mission to Tibet." *China Weekly Review*. LIV (Sept. 6, 1930). p. 22.

Peng Wenbin, "Allegorizing the Local on the Borderland: Ai Wu's *Nanxingji* and National Subjectivity." *Inner Asia*, vol.4, n°1, 2002, special issue: *Traveling cultures and histories: nation-building and frontier politics in Twentieth Century China*, personal communication.

Peng Wenbin, "Frontier Process, Provincial Politics and Movements for Khampa Autonomy During the Republican Period." In L. Epstein, ed. *Khams pa Histories. Visions of People, Place and Authority*. Leiden: Brill, 2002, pp. 57-84.

Ren Yimin 任一民, Sichuan jin xian dai renwu zhuan 四川近现代人物传 (Biographies of Sichuan personalities from modern and contemporary periods). Chengdu: Sichuan sheng shehui kexueyuan, 1985.

Shakabpa Wangchuk, Tibet, a Political History. New York: Potala, 1976.

Stoddard Heather, *Le mendiant de l'Amdo*. Nanterre: Société d'ethnographie, 1985.

Thub bstan sangs rgyas, rGya nag tu Bod kyi sku tshab don gcod skabs dang gnyis tshugs stangs skor gyi lo rgyus thabs bral zur lam (History of the Tibet representative office in China), 1982.

Xeirab Nyima, « A Special Envoy of the Nanjing Regime », China's Tibet, 1991, pp.39-42.

Xirao Nima 西繞尼瑪, Guomin zhengfu nu mi shi fu Zang jishi 國民政府女密使 赴藏紀實 (Historical narrative of the Guomindang secret women agent to Tibet), Peking: Minzu chubanshe (Minguo bianjiang youji xindu congshu), 1998, introduction.

#### Glossary

Beiping shili di yi xiaoxue dushu 北京市立第一小學讀書

Bianjiang jiaoyu 邊疆教育

Chahar 察哈爾

Chiang Kai-shek 蔣介石

Chongqing 重慶

Dai Jitao 戴季陶

Daoji yiyuan 道濟醫院

Feng Yunxian 馮雲賢

Gansu 甘肅

Gao quan Zang guanmin shu 高勸藏官民書

Gesang Zeren 格桑澤仁

Gongdeng tashi 貢等塔什

Gu Yingfen 古應芬

Guomindang 國民黨

Guo Xiangqiu 郭祥秋

Han 漢

Hong Kong 香港

huaxi xuexiao 華西學校

Huang Jingwan 黄警頑

Jiang Weixin 蔣唯心

Jincheng 金成

Kang Zang lu Jing tongxiang kang Ri jiuguo hui 康藏旅京同鄉抗日救國會 Kang Zang minzhong kangdi fu nan xuanchuan tuan 康藏民眾抗 敵赴難宣 傳團

Kang Zang yaozheng 康藏軺征

Kongdang Jiangcheng 孔黨江稱

li 里

Liandian 連典

Lian Yu 聯預

Li Jianhou 李劍侯

Lin Sen 林森

Liu Huaxuan 劉華軒

Liu Manqing 劉曼卿

Nanjing 南京

Ningxia 寧夏

Paichang Dingceng 排長丁曾

Qinghai 青海

Rang Zhuo 讓桌

Sichuan 四川

Suiyuan 綏遠

Sun Yat-sen 孫中山

Tang 唐

Tongzhou nuzi shifan xuexiao 通州女子师范学校

Wang Tianhua 王天華

Wencheng 文成

Wutai Shan 五台山

Wu Zhongxin 吴忠信

Xiao Pinzhang 蕭品璋

Xikang 西康

Xikang minzhong weilao qian xian Jiang shi daibiao tuan 西康民眾慰勞前 線蔣士代表團

Xikang sheng dang bu 西康省黨部

Xingzheng yuan wen guan chu yi deng shujiguan 行政院文官處一等書記官 Xinjiang 新疆

xin wei jinguo zhi xiong ye 新為巾幗之雄也

Xinyaxiya 新亞西亞

Xizang 西藏

xuji 續記

Yonghegong 永和宮

yuan 元

Yunnan 雲南

yun wei nu zhong qiaochu 允為女中翹楚

Zhongguo bianjiang xuehui 中國邊疆學會

Zhu Ma 竺瑪

\*

# A Preliminary Report on Investigations into (Bon nyid) 'Od gsal and Zhi khro bar do in Earlier Zhang zhung sNyan rgyud and sNyan rgyud Literature<sup>1</sup>

Henk Blezer, Leiden, IIAS 1999<sup>2</sup>

n this article, I shall give a preview of ideas that I intend to discuss in greater detail in a monograph that I am presently<sup>3</sup> preparing on possible Bon origins of Tibetan speculations regarding a post-mortem state of 'reality as it is'.<sup>4</sup> At this early stage, before attempting a (relative) chronology<sup>5</sup> of the materials on the subject that are extant in Buddhist and Bon traditions, I here will try to accommodate my discussion of Bon (*Zhang zhung*) sNyan rgyud material in a wider background of Buddhist speculations, in the hope that this will allow the characteristics of these specific Bon rDzogs chen speculations to stand out more distinctly. Occasionally, I shall refer to relevant results from earlier researches on the kar gling zhi khro, the peaceful and wrathful deities according to Karma gling pa, and on chos nyid bar do, the intermediate state of 'reality as it is', and also, where necessary, provide, more or less in the manner of an update, additional Buddhist

\_

I should like to extend my sincere thanks to several colleagues who have provided thoughtful comments and useful references, especially Bryan Jare Cuevas and Dan Martin. I also owe a particularly large debt of gratitude to Geshe Namgyal Nyima Dagkar, who in the beginning of 1998 kindly assisted me for three months of painstaking work. With his characteristic energy, dedication and sharp intellect he helped straighten out both readings and meanings of several earlier Bon bar do-texts. Namgyal Nyima's valuable contribution will be even more conspicuous in the text-editions that, as separate publications, will accompany the mentioned forthcoming book on Bon-origin of Tibetan speculations regarding a post-mortem state of 'reality as it is'. [This research and attendance at the seminar were facilitated by a fellowship at the International Institute for Asian Studies, 1997–2000.]

<sup>[</sup>This article was originally contributed to the proceedings of the Eighth Seminar of the International Association for Tibetan Studies, which convened in Bloomington, Indiana, late July 1998. Because of obstacles largely beyond the powers of the convenor of that seminar, the proceedings have not yet seen the light of day. Since several colleagues have already worked and quoted from this article in the form that had it in 1999, when it was submitted for the IATS proceedings, I decided it would be best to reproduce the article as it is, without additions and with only very minor emendations [meta-communications, such as this note, appear in square brackets]. I am of course aware that some of the information may now appear antiquated, certainly after subsequent publication by Philippe Cornu (Ph.D. thesis 2006), David Germano (2005; based on his paper for the IATS 8 seminar), Cuevas (2000/2003), and others. For a proper genealogy of knowledge, it seems nonetheless useful to make this article available for future reference in the form in which it has informally circulated ever since its first submission, with all the shortcomings of a preliminary report—which it was originally intended to be, ten years ago. The editors of RET have most kindly agreed to make it accessible for publication. I should like to thank my colleague Jean-Luc Achard and the other editors of RET, for finally resolving the issue of access to my early work on this topic. I should also like to thank the convenor of the Bloomington IATS, Elliot Sperling, for graciously condoning this breach of IATS procedure.]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> [The adverb "presently" here as elsewhere pertains to the years 1998/99, when this article was written.]

<sup>4 [</sup>See postscript.]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Considering the insecurities with regard to dates in early Bon and also rNying ma traditions, this chronology will necessarily be a relative one. I propose to take the stage of development of the concept of an intermediate state of 'reality as it is' as something like a 'Leitfossil'.

materials from both rNying ma and 'bKa' (b)rgyud'<sup>6</sup> traditions that are relevant to the theses of this article and the wider research objectives. Due to the limits of this article, I cannot present or discuss in detail the Tibetan text of the relevant passages. We have to content ourselves with a general survey, leaving the finer points, as they emerge from a detailed discussion of the concrete texts, for the mentioned forthcoming monograph.

When perusing the following discussion about *bar do* systems of diverse rNying ma, Bon and 'bKa' rgyud' traditions, I should like to recommend referring to the conspectus of classifications of *bar do*-s appended below, this may help to keep track of correspondences, divergences and distinctive features in the plethora of *bar do* speculations addressed. It is not an analytical tool, also not quite a Rorschachtest, but a visual aid designed to assist surveying the mass of data and search for meaningful patterns.

#### 1-1. Embedding in Previous Research

In recent research [1993-97], I attempted to trace a conceptual history of the tantric Buddhist concept of *zhi khro* in a *chos nyid bar do* with some reference to Bon equivalents of a *(bon nyid) 'od gsal* (clear light of 'reality as it is') and *zhi khro bar do.*<sup>7</sup> Almost all of the descriptions of *chos nyid bar do* that I am aware of do at least refer to, and at times even explicitly describe, a *zhi khro maṇḍala.*<sup>8</sup> As far as my evidence now goes, the first Buddhist text that features a full description of a *zhi khro maṇḍala* in relation to *(chos nyid) bar do might* be the fairly well-known *Kar gling zhi khro* text, called *Chos nyid bar do'i gsal* [or *gsol*] 'debs thos grol chen mo.<sup>9</sup> Yet I should point here to an undated *rNying ma'i rgyud 'bum* text, the *Man ngag snying gi dgongs pa rgyal ba'i bka' zhes bya ba'i rgyud*, which might be earlier (which in its present redaction I doubt is the case) or at least preserve an earlier form of the core materials (which seems quite likely). A preliminary discussion of this interesting text has appeared elsewhere.<sup>10</sup> Here I will only briefly resume that discussion and then proceed with other rNying ma materials.

#### 1-2. Intermezzo I, Some More rNying ma Material

A brief update is necessary on material contained in the *rNying ma'i rgyud 'bum.*<sup>11</sup> First of all, I should like to mention the *Man ngag snying gi dgongs pa rgyal ba'i bka' zhes bya ba'i rgyud (MNg)*, unfortunately anonymous and not yet dated. About half of the eight-chapter version of the *MNg* consists of phrases it shares almost verbatim with the *Bar do thos grol Chos nyid bar do'i gsal 'debs thos grol chen mo (ChB)* and *Srid pa bar do'i ngo sprod gsal 'debs thos* 

<sup>6 [</sup>The scare quotes indicate that some traditions claimed by bKa' rgyud pa-s precede their historical formation.]

See Blezer 1997.

So far, I am aware of only a few exceptions, the concrete titles will be mentioned later.
 Page-numbers pertain to the Kalsang Lhundup-edition (1969), for further bibliographical references, see Blezer (1997), pp. 133 and 136.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> See reference below.

My sincere thanks go to Bryan Jare Cuevas for pointing me to most of these additional texts.

grol chen mo (SB) texts. The exact chronology is difficult to establish, not in the last place because the editions of the MNg do not seem to be homogenous products, they rather appear rough edged collations and probably not all chapters are of the same date. I attempted a preliminary comparison of the Mng with the ChB and SB elsewhere, in a separate article, forthcoming in the 1998 yearbook of the IIAS. In brief, my main conclusion is that comparison of the Mng with the ChB & SB allows us hypothetically to posit and to an extent even 'reconstruct' an earlier source (or redaction) on which both the MNg and the ChB & SB have drawn or from which they might have developed. I shall not attempt to summarise in one paragraph the finer points, which took about fifty pages to lay out in some (read: preliminary) detail.

This much as to possibly earlier evidence than the *ChB* for a full description of *zhi khro* in a separate *bar do*. A next point would be that some texts in the *rNying ma'i rgyud 'bum* and *rNying ma'i rgyud bcu bdun* do not, as in most of the Buddhist descriptions of *chos nyid bar do* that I am familiar with, directly refer to *zhi khro* in this context. The *bar do* discussions in the texts listed below are rather brief, so the absence of an explicit reference to *zhi khro* might at times be due to mere conciseness rather than to dogmatic intent. Unless indicated otherwise, all texts are from the Taipei edition, *casu quo* the *mTshams sbrag rNying ma'i rgyud 'bum*.

#### Several texts do not mention *zhi khro*:

- No reference at all in the very brief *Rin po che 'phags lam bkod pa'i rgyud*<sup>14</sup>. The text refers to *chos nyid gsal ba'i bar do*. A list of six *bar do-s* is presented: *rang bzhin gnas pa'i bar do, ting nge 'dzin gyi bar do, skye shi gnyis kyi bar do, de bzhin srid pa'i bar do, rmi lam gnyid kyi bar do, chos nyid gsal ba'i bar do<sup>15</sup>. The skye shi gnyis kyi bar do is briefly characterised as: skye shi gnyis kyi bar do la//ye shes ngo yis 'dzin mdzad na//mun khung sgron me bteg pa bzhin//mtshon pa'i tshig gis don rtogs pas//rten 'brel 'dzom pa'i ye shes kyis//rmongs pa'i mun pa sangs par 'gyur//.<sup>16</sup>*
- No direct reference in the sKu thams cad kyi snang ba ston pa dbang rdzogs pa rang byung chen po'i rgyud<sup>17</sup>. The text refers to chos nyid rang snang bar do. A list of four bar do-s is presented: rang bzhin gnas pa'i bar do, chos nyid rang snang bar do, rmi lam 'dzin pa'i bar do, srid par 'khyams pa'i bar do<sup>18</sup>. The rang bzhin gnas pa'i bar do is briefly characterised as: rang bzhin gnas pa'i bar do la| /chos nyid gsang ba'i don rtogs nas| /ma chags shes rab pha rol phyin| /de nas lus 'di bor ba dang/ |...<sup>19</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> [Now published as Blezer (2003, cf. also 2001).]

<sup>[</sup>But now see also an impressive and very detailed Ph.D. thesis by Philippe Cornu (2006), who managed to date a version of the text to before Klong chen pa (1306/8–63), which, depending on the precise dates of Karma gling pa in the fourteenth century, might support at least a slightly earlier date for the MNg.]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> Vol. LIV (Tib.Vol. *ka*), no.4504 (= *gTing skyes* no.64), pp. 120/837(3) – 124/863.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> P. 123/858(5f).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> P. 123/859(7) – 860(2).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> Vol. LVI (Tib.Vol. *da*), no.4740 (= *gTing skyes* no.143), pp. 1/2 – 43/298(1).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> P. 3/17(1f).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> P. 3/17(2f).

- sPros bral don gsal chen po'i rgyud and Thig le kun gsal chen po'i rgyud.<sup>20</sup> The texts refer to chos nyid 'od gsal (gyi) bar do. A list of four bar do-s is presented: rang bzhin dag pa'i(/ dag gi) bar do, ting nge 'dzin gyi bar do, chos nyid 'od gsal (gyi) bar do, srid pa'i bar do.<sup>21</sup> The rang bzhin dag pa'i bar do is briefly characterised as de la rang bzhin bar do ni/ |da lta'i 'khrul snang 'di nyid yin/ |).<sup>22</sup> The first text is said to be a gter ma of Guru chos dbang (1212–70), ultimately attributed to Padmasambhava, dGa' rab rdo rje?, 'Jam dpal bshes gnyen, Śrīsiṃha, and Padma(?). The bar do-section is, so far as I checked, identical to the one in the second title. The second title is attributed to dGa' rab rdo rje?, 'Jam dpal bshes gnyen, Śrīsiṃha, and Vairocana.

#### Some texts do mention zhi khro,

- Nyi ma dang zla ba kha sbyor ba chen po gsang ba'i rgyud, in the rNying ma'i rgyud bcu bdun.<sup>23</sup> Four bar do-s are treated in the several chapters, rang bzhin gnas pa'i bar do, 'chi kha bar do, srid pa'i bar do and chos nyid bar do. This text has been discussed elsewhere.<sup>24</sup>
- Chos thams cad kyi don bstan pa rdzogs chen thig le nyag gcig ye nas bya rtsal bral ba (= Theg pa'i spyi phud klong chen rab 'byams kyi rgyud).<sup>25</sup> The text refers to chos nyid zhi khro'i bar do. A list of four bar do-s is presented: skye gnas bar do, 'chi kha sdug bsngal bar do, chos nyid zhi khro'i bar do, srid par 'khyams pa'i bar do.<sup>26</sup> The text is said to be a gter ma of rDo rje gling pa (1346–1406).

Texts that, like the *Bar do lnga'i ngo sprod*,<sup>27</sup> do not mention a *chos nyid bar do* are also extant in the *rNying ma'i rgyud 'bum*, some examples are:

- rDzogs pa chen po bar do gsang ba'i rgyud.<sup>28</sup> A list of five bar do-s is presented: rang bzhin gnas kyi bar do, ting nge 'dzin gyi bar do, rmi lam dag gi bar do, skye shi dag gi bar do, srid pa dag gi bar do.<sup>29</sup> The skye shi dag gi bar do is, like in the Bar do lnga'i ngo sprod, defined as a bar do of dying: 'chi ba'i dus su shes par bya/ /. The text is attributed to Śrīsiṃha and rDo rje yang dbang gter.
- Byang chub sems kyi man ngag rin po che sgron ma 'bar ba'i rgyud.<sup>30</sup> A list of four bar do-s is presented: rang bzhin gnas pa'i bar do, skye shi gnyis kyi bar do, ting 'dzin snga phyi bar do, srid pa dag gi bar do.<sup>31</sup> The rang bzhin gnas pa'i bar do is clarified as: kun bzhin sdong po bcud la bor/ sbrul gyi rkang lag 'byung ba bzhin/ and the skye shi gnyis kyi bar do is here

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> Vol. LVI (Tib.Vol. *pa*), no.4757 (= *gTing skyes* no.110), pp. 229/2 – 270/288(6).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> P. 3/17(1f).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> P. 3/236(6).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> Vol. II, pp. 153–233, esp. p. 220, l.2 – p. 227, l.6.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> Orofino (1990), Blezer (1997).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> Vol. LV (Tib.Vol. *nya*), no.4643 (= *gTing skyes* no.65), pp. 301/290(3) – 343/586(7).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> P. 339/558(4f).

A text from the *Ka dag rang 'byung rang shar-*cycle associated with *Rig 'dzin rgod kyi ldem 'phru can* (1337–1408), the text claims an 8<sup>th</sup> c. AD origin.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> Vol. LIV (Tib.Vol. *nga*), no.4558, pp. 465/526(6) – 465/531(7).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> P. 465/527(4–6).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>30</sup> Vol. LIV (Tib.Vol. *ca*), no.4587, pp. 543/267(1) – 553/338(6).

P. 548/305(3-5).

associated with thog ma'i ye shes ngos gzung la//dwa phrug ma dang phrad pa bzhin/ /. The text is attributed to Vimalamitra and sNyags Jñāna(kumāra).

I should also briefly like to discuss an interesting text from the Ma ni bka' 'bum<sup>32</sup> that omits a chos nyid bar do, the Thugs rje chen po'i bar do mun gsal sgron me'i zhal gdams.<sup>33</sup> Per Sørensen dates this text no later than 1150–60.<sup>34</sup> Among the six bar do-s listed (rang bzhin gnas pa'i bar do, skye shi'i bar do, shes pa snga phyi'i bar do, rmi lam gyi bar do, 'chi kha'i bar do, srid pa'i bar do)<sup>35</sup> we find rang bzhin gnas pa'i bar do and skye shi'i bar do listed together, both of which, elsewhere, frequently refer to an intermediate state of life. The rang bzhin gnas pa'i bar do is unambiguously explained as the process of straying from gzhi'i gnas lugs, the fundamental natural state. 36 The skye shi'i bar do clearly refers to a regular  $bar\ do$  of life in which one can practice under the guidance of a compassionate  $bla\ ma.^{37}$  A similar feature we shall also encounter in the mGur'bum, <sup>38</sup> texts by Yang dgon pa (1213–58) and in the Bon Zhang zhung snyan rgyud text, the Bar do 'od lnga ngos bzung ba'i man ngag, all of which will be discussed below.

The term *shes pa snga phyi'i bar do* refers to clarifying conceptual thinking as wisdom, to let conceptual thought liberate of itself and arise as wisdom.<sup>3</sup> A substantial discussion of this bar do, or at least of bar do-s with similar names and descriptions, appears in a text attributed Mi la ras pa (1040/53-1123/35), the Lam blo nas good pa bar do ngo sprod kyi gdams pa zab mo, and in the Bar do lam khyer 'khor 'das rgyun gcod kyi gdams ngag (which does not refer to an author, but until further notice I will assume it is also attributed to Mi la ras pa), both are discussed below.

But the most remarkable feature of this text is that the srid pa'i bar do is divided into three parts, each associated with one of the buddhakāya-s, the first week with *chos sku* (pertaining to those of the highest capacities), the second with longs sku (pertaining to those of mediocre capacities), and the third onward with *sprul sku* (pertaining to those of the lowest capacities).<sup>40</sup> Usually, that is, in rNying ma texts that feature chos nyid bar do (rdzogs sku) and a bar do of dying (chos sku), the srid pa'i bar do would be associated with sprul sku, or, like we frequently find in 'bKa' rgyud' texts—no (after-death) chos nyid bar do present—it would pertain to rdzogs sku (the bar do of entering a womb would then be associated with sprul sku; the bar do of dying, of course, again, with chos sku). The text continues with a very elaborate presentation of srid pa'i bar do, discussing each consecutive week of seven,

A text from the *Gab pa mngon phyung*, brought to my attention by Dan Martin.

The title is taken from the colophon.

Sørensen (1994), p. 586, thanks to Dan Martin for pointing me to Sørensen's discussion. I consulted the Dharamsala-edition in two volumes, Vol. II, p. 365, l.6 – p. 387, l.2. On p. 375, l.6 – p. 376, l.2, Dharamsala 1995.

P. 376, 1.2 – p. 379, 1.6.

P. 379, l.6 - p. 380, l.5.

The mgur are said to derive from Mi la ras pa, but were compiled much later by the madman from gTsang, gTsang smyon He ru ka Sangs rgyas rgyal mtshan (1452-1507), and are not of uniform antiquity.

P. 380, 1.5 – p. 381, 1.2. P. 383, 1.5 – p. 385, 1.3.

the last part, from the fourteenth day onward, pertains to *sprul sku* and those of the lowest capacities, (*dbang po tha ma*).

An interesting point, to which I shall return a little later, is that in this rNying ma material a 'chi kha'i bar do is not always referred to by that name; actually, often it is not even (explicitly) mentioned at all. In the rDzogs pa chen po bar do gsang ba'i rgyud, for instance, it is, like in the Bar do lnga'i ngo sprod, referred to by another name, skye shi dag gi bar do (or skye shi bar do, successively). This *skye shi bar do* does in this case not have the meaning of an intermediate phase of life, which, at least among 'bKa' rgyud pa-s', would be a more usual denotation. Instead rang bzhin gnas pa'i bar do here apparently covers a bar do of life. Especially amongst rNying ma pa-s, rang bzhin gnas pa'i bar do is indeed a standard reference to a phase of life. In other texts the process of dying seems to be subsumed under the heading for a phase of life, that is, under rang bzhin gyi bar do or skye shi'i bar do. But other variation also exists. Later, when briefly updating 'bKa' rgyud' material, we shall see that Phag mo gru pa (1110–70), following La va pa, describes rang bzhin gnas pa'i bar do quite unambiguously as 'chi kha'i bar do. Apparently a bar do of dying was often thought to be associated with, or implied in, an intermediate phase of life, eventually even borrowing the designation(s) for such a bar do of life as a specific reference to the process of dying.

#### 1-3. Further Embedding in Previous Research

After this first intermezzo, allow me to continue accommodating my current work a little further in previous research. The Bon zhi khro bar do as described in the sNyan brgyud bar do thos grol gsal sgron chen mo<sup>41</sup> seems, at least as far as the dates of textual fixation/discovery are concerned (Dam pa rang grol, born 1149 AD), to predate the description of a chos nyid bar do in the ChB (Karma gling pa, 14<sup>th</sup> AD). The sNyan rgyud bar do thos grol texts are highly ritualistic, more so than the somewhat more theoretical Buddhist ChB, but both put equally much emphasis on the description of a zhi khro maṇḍala. In general, though, there does not seem to be much overlap between the Buddhist and Bon Bar do thos grol texts. In my Kar gling Zhi khro, I concluded that a comparison of the maṇḍala-s of the ChB (and the Zhi khro nges don snying po)<sup>42</sup> and the sNyan rgyud bar do thos grol texts, given that only the most generic similarities occur, does not yield enough common ground for establishing any sound hypothesis concerning a positive affiliation between these texts. Moreover, also apart from the descriptions of the maṇḍala-s, the ChB and the sNyan rgyud bar do thos grol texts do not suggest much of a relation of borrowing (or shared resources), that is, except for a rather conspicuous match in the summarising prayer formulas that conclude the descriptions of the groups of deities in the *mandala-s* of both. As I reported there, these prayers seem to derive from a probably older version, as it might have been preserved in the Bar do 'phrang sgrol gyi smon lam. 43 In both instances the prayers show signs of editing and deviate from the

Cf. other recensions of this text, called *Zhi khro bar do 'phrang grol gyi thos grol las byang bag chags rang grol* and *sNyan rgyud thos grol bar do 'phrang grol chen po*; see bibliography.

By Ngag dbang kun dga' bstan 'dzin (1680–1728), for further data, see Blezer (1997), p. 3.
 For bibliographical references see Blezer (1997), p. 187.

version preserved in the *Bar do 'phrang sgrol gyi smon lam*. The shared prayers do not suggest a direct borrowing either way but rather a common source. I have not yet been able to pinpoint a source text beyond the *Bar do 'phrang sgrol gyi smon lam* (and I am not sure if I ever will).

Even though there is a rather strong connection between the Buddhist chos nyid bar do (and the Bon zhi khro bar do) and zhi khro maṇḍala-s, I nevertheless tried to be prudent in my Kar gling Zhi khro not to overstate the link between the chos nyid (/bon nyid) bar do and zhi khro maṇḍala-s in general. This is mainly because I suspect that those of the bar do variants which feature a more explicitly described maṇḍala might represent relatively late developments. To be more precise, even though most of the Buddhist chos nyid bar do descriptions that I am familiar with do at least refer to a zhi khro maṇḍala (so far I found only a few exceptions, mostly in very brief descriptions), I do think that certainly as far as older Bon literature and a (bon nyid) 'od gsal gyi bar do is concerned it would be incorrect to identify the introduction of a maṇḍala with the conception of a (bon nyid) 'od gsal gyi bar do as such.

#### 2-1. Present Research, Bon (Zhang zhung) sNyan rgyud Material

In my current<sup>44</sup> research, I investigate early Bon texts on *bon nyid* and *zhi khro bar do*. The larger hypothesis of my project, in which the preliminary research results presented here are instrumental, is to provide a history of ideas and, as part of that, evidence for a possible temporal precedence of Bon *(bon nyid) 'od gsal gyi bar do* over Buddhist *chos nyid bar do* speculations (at the moment the most likely hypothesis).

For this article, I shall specifically focus on texts from (*Zhang zhung*) sNyan rgyud traditions. Besides the sNyan rgyud bar do thos grol texts that I discussed in an earlier publication, I am also looking at other relatively early sNyan rgyud texts on these bar do-s, amongst others the Ma bcos gnyug ma'i don bstan pa'i gdams pa and Bar do 'od lnga ngos bzung ba'i man ngag (13<sup>th</sup> AD), <sup>45</sup> at a sNyan rgyud rig pa gcer mthong text, to wit, the Bar do dus kyi sgron ma (12<sup>th</sup> AD), <sup>46</sup> and at an old and better known *Zhang zhung snyan rgyud* text, the sGron ma drug gi gdams pa (traditionally dated to the 8<sup>th</sup> AD, but may be even

<sup>44 [</sup>See introduction above.]

<sup>45</sup> One manuscript edition available, the texts were most probably recorded in the 13<sup>th</sup> AD; see bibliography.

Two manuscript editions are available. The *Bar do dus kyi sgron ma* was apparently committed to writing in the 12<sup>th</sup> c. AD. One manuscript is reproduced in an edition of the *sNyan rgyud rig pa gcer mthong-*cycle, attributed to Bon zhig khyung nag (1103–83); see bibliography. The orthography and grammar of this text are exceptionally poor. Many passages show corruption in transmission. Interestingly enough these not only pertain to scribal errors that conform with the particular script in which these manuscripts tend to be written but they also often involve remarkable "phonetic" mistakes that could indeed be indicative of an oral transmission. If I may I should like to add that both the corruptions and the poor command of orthography and grammar provide interesting information regarding the people and traditions transmitting these rare texts. The other manuscript was reproduced in *Rare Bonpo Texts Belonging to the Abhidharma and sÑan rgyud rig pa gcer mthon Cycles*; see bibliography. The two manuscript editions differ very much and do not seem to relate directly.

as late as the 11<sup>th</sup> c. AD?)<sup>47</sup> and its two commentaries *sGron ma'i 'grel pa nyi 'od rgyan* (12<sup>th</sup> AD)<sup>48</sup> and *sGron ma drug gi dgongs don 'grel pa.*<sup>49</sup> Furthermore some brief *bar do* discussions are included in other *Zhang zhung snyan rgyud* texts, like the *Byang chub sems kyi gnad drug ces bya ba'i lag len,*<sup>50</sup> *'Khor lo bzhi sbrag*<sup>51</sup>, *Man ngag le'u brgyad pa.*<sup>52</sup>

#### 2-1-1. Zhi khro

As far as I can see now, evidence indeed confirms that (possibly) older conceptions of a (bon nyid) 'od gsal gyi bar do do not focus on a zhi khro maṇḍala, actually, the ones that I have examined so far do not even mention 'visions' of such a maṇḍala for this bar do (at least not directly)—though I noticed that a reference to, most probably geometric, luminous forms and maṇḍala-s (so, not zhi khro maṇḍala-s!) does occur in the 'Khor lo bzhi sbrag. <sup>53</sup> More evidence will be reviewed later. This might then differentiate the Bon zhi khro bar do of the Bon Bar do thos grol texts on a relative scale from an, in origin, (probably) older and more 'generic' concept of a bon nyid ('od gsal gyi) bar do, the first possibly being a later, more specific elaboration of the latter. I must state emphatically that the provisional dates connected with a written fixation of the material examined would at this stage not encourage, nor even allow, such a hypothesis. According to tradition (and as far as I can see this may well be true), <sup>54</sup> some (Zhang zhung) sNyan rgyud texts have been transmitted orally for some time.

In general the *chos nyid bar do* as it is presented in the *Nyi zla kha sbyor* and some of the (other) *rNying ma'i rgyud 'bum* texts mentioned, in many respects—e.g. the point of arising of an 'experience' of luminosity at death, the focus on generic 'experiences' of *sgra 'od zer gsum* rather than on an (elaborately described) *zhi khro maṇḍala*—shows more resemblance to early Bon presentations of a *(bon nyid) 'od gsal gyi bar do* than to that of the *chos nyid bar do* as we find it described in the *ChB*.

Also partly edited and translated by Orofino (1990); compiled by Uri bsod nams rgyal mtshan (died 1133 AD); see bibliography.

See esp. p. 447, 1.4 – p. 448; attributed to Bla ma Ya ngal (gong bkra ba chen po); see bibliography.

See esp. p. 462, l.4 – p. 464; thanks to dGe bshes rNam rgyal Nyi ma brag dkar and Donatella Rossi for bringing this interesting text to my attention; see bibliography.

See esp. p. 500, l.1 – p. 501; also said to have been received in vision by Gyer spungs chen po snang bzher lod po from Kun tu bzang po in the form of Ta pi hri tsa; see bibliography.
 On this text see Karmay (1998), pp. 85–102, esp. pp. 97f.

Compare for instance the *Bar do dus kyi sgron ma* (1972), p. 219, ll.6f., this is part of an elaboration on *sgra 'od zer gsum* at death, and the *Bar do dus kyi sgron ma* (1976), p. 368, l.10 – p. 369, l.1.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>47</sup> Partly edited and translated by Orofino (1990); traditional claim 8<sup>th</sup> AD: it is said to have been received in vision by Gyer spungs chen po snang bzher lod po from Ta pi hri tsa; see bibliography.

Probably somewhere in the late 13<sup>th</sup> c. AD, written by 'Og blon sgom chen bKra shis shes rab for Bru sgom rgyal ba g-yung drung (1242–1290)? See bibliography.

#### 2-1-2. Doubling of 'Od gsal 'Experience'

This issue moreover seems to relate to a perceived 'inconsistency' in Buddhist chos nyid bar do traditions regarding the supposed position of an 'experience' of 'od gsal, which I already briefly noted in my Kar gling Zhi khro, i.e., whether the (first) confrontation with (the) clear light (of death) is placed at the end of the 'chi kha'i bar do or at the beginning of the chos nyid bar do.55 If the former is the case, like, e.g., in the ChB and Klong chen pa's (1306/8-63) 'Chi kha'i bar do'i gsal 'debs, 56 different forms are distinguished, in this case a 'chi ba'i and chos nyid kyi 'od gsal. The disparity regarding this between texts like the Nyi zla kha sbyor,<sup>57</sup> but also other rNying ma'i rgyud 'bum texts<sup>58</sup> and the *ChB*, reflects a difference in focus. The *Nyi zla kha sbyor* is apparently more geared toward generic 'experiences' of sound, light and rays, sgra 'od zer gsum, and has the 'od gsal/ chos nyid 'experience' as a central theme in the *chos nyid bar do*. In the *ChB*, on the other hand, the emphasis has shifted toward highly diversified 'experiences' of zhi khro, while featuring the first 'experience' of ('chi ba'i) 'od gsal in another, the 'chi kha'i bar do (which, regarding the stages of dissolution at death, seems a logical position for such an 'experience'). The disruption of a more coherent description of a chos nyid bar do in (seven) stages by the insertion of a fully described zhi khro maṇḍala in the ChB is, as I noted earlier, 59 still very much apparent in the redaction of the text.

The (Zhang zhung) sNyan rgyud presentations of the arising of a vision of kun gzhi in the context of death that I have seen also do not show such an

<sup>55</sup> Blezer (1997), pp. 104f.

The 'Chi kha'i bar do'i gsal 'debs by Klong chen pa dri med 'od zer (1306/8–63), in his sNying thig ya bzhi. Even though the text cites the Nyi zla kha sbyor, a thun mong du 'char ba'i 'od gsal and a lhun grub rin po che'i (snang ba longs spyod rdzogs pa'i sku'i) 'od gsal are distinguished (in the first and second bar do-s respectively).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> See bibliography, pp. 153–233, esp. p. 203, l.6 – p. 220, l.1, and p. 220, l.2 – p. 227, l.6.

Taipei-edition (see bibliography), discussed in more detail above:

<sup>-</sup> Rin po che 'phags lam bkod pa'i rgyud, see esp. p. 123/858(5f), p. 123/859(3–5), and p. 123/859(7) – 860(2); no specific 'chi kha'i bar do mentioned, just a generic skye shi gnyis kyi bar do (without the specific meaning of a bar do of dying like e.g. in the Bar do lnga'i ngo sprod; see Blezer (1997), p. 37);

<sup>-</sup> sKu thams cad kyi snang ba ston pa dbang rdzogs pa rang byung chen po'i rgyud, see esp. p. 3/17(1f), p. 3/17(2f & 3–5), and p. 7/44(3) – 45(1); no specific 'chi kha'i bar do mentioned, just a generic rang bzhin gnas pa'i bar do (though briefly referring to leaving the body behind (de nas lus 'di bor ba//...) but without the specific meaning of a bar do of dying such as in the text of Phag mo gru pa discussed later);

<sup>-</sup> Chos thams cad kyi don bstan pa rdzogs chen thig le nyag gcig ye nas bya rtsal bral ba (= Theg pa'i spyi phud klong chen rab 'byams kyi rgyud), see esp. p. 339/558(4f), p. 339/559(4f & 6f) & 560(3f & 5f), p. 340/561(3) – 565(1), and 340/565(2) – 341/569(7), a 'chi kha sdug bsngal gyi bar do is mentioned;

<sup>-</sup> sPros bral don gsal chen po'i rgyud, esp. p. 262/236(5f, 6 & 7) and pp. 262/237(6ff), no specific 'chi kha'i bar do mentioned, just a generic rang bzhin dag pa'i bar do (without the specific meaning of a bar do of dying like e.g. in the Slob dpon chen po la ba pa'i bar do rnam pa gsum of Phag mo gru pa discussed later), the bar do-section is identical to the one in:

<sup>-</sup> Thig le kun gsal chen po'i rgyud, see esp. p. 292/443(5f & 7) and pp. 292/444(6ff).

I must repeat here that considering the brevity of the *bar do*-discussions and the absence of a specific *'chi kha'i bar do* in most of these texts, I should rather not give too much weight to this evidence.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>59</sup> Blezer (1997), pp. 124f.

awkward double reference. In the commentaries to the *sGron ma drug gi gdams pa*, for instance, more elaborate and explicit descriptions are appended to a brief reference to the last dissolution at death, <sup>60</sup> but the elaboration on *kun gzhi* is not explicitly separated from the *bon nyid 'od gsal* descriptions that follow, in the sense of being viewed as a 'first arising' clearly set apart from a 'second one', so, here too, a double reference does not feature prominently. I shall review some more evidence later.

A most interesting point is that the commentaries, the *sGron ma'i 'grel pa nyi 'od rgyan* and the *sGron ma drug gi dgongs don 'grel pa*, reserve a special name for this last phase of dying, they style this phase *ye shes kyi bar do*, <sup>61</sup> as if it were another, separate *bar do*, which is however not counted or listed, that is to say, it is most probably a descriptive designation rather than a separate category. It does, however, resonate with the casual way in which, as we shall see later, in the *Bar do 'od lnga ngos bzung ba'i man ngag* a *bon nyid 'od gsal gyi bar do* is distinguished at the beginning of a *srid pa'i bar do*, while it does, in fact, not appear in the list of *bar do-s* of this text. <sup>62</sup>

#### 2-1-3. Bar do of Dying and Bar do of 'Reality as It Is'

Needless to say, textual evidence supports that a *kun gzhi/ 'od gsal-*like 'experience' as such would indeed conclude the process of dying. What might be more worthy of mention here is that a *bon nyid* or *chos nyid bar do* may well be a specific elaboration on a theme from that (last) part of a *bar do* of dying, elaborating and projecting a *kun gzhi/ 'od gsal* 'experience' into 'the' after-death state (originally: *bar ma do'i srid pa, srid pa'i bar do*) as an 'experience' of *bon nyid/ chos nyid*, which in due course came to be distinguished as a separate (*bon nyid*) 'od gsal/ chos nyid kyi bar do.

This already reflects clearly in the names used in Bon texts for an intermediate state of reality as it is, to wit, bon nyid 'od gsal (gyi) bar do, but too, and more pregnantly, in the above designation 'od gsal gyi bar do,<sup>63</sup> and also in the concrete descriptions of that bar do. That name would, e.g., in 'bKa' rgyud' texts, rather be associated with a bar do of dying.

The above hypothesis moreover receives support from the curiously casual reference to a bon nyid 'od gsal gyi bar do in the Bar do 'od lnga ngos bzung ba'i man ngag (13<sup>th</sup> AD?).<sup>64</sup> The Bar do 'od lnga ngos bzung ba'i man ngag lists six bar do-s (gnas pa gzhi'i bar do, skye shi gnyis kyi bar do, rmi lam bag chags kyi bar do, nyams su len pa ting nge 'dzin gyi bar do, mi rtag 'gyur ba 'chi kha'i bar

See the references to the *sGron ma drug*-commentaries above, see also the *sGron ma'i 'grel* 

63 See for instance the *sGron ma'i 'grel pa nyi 'od rgyan* on p. 349, ll.1&5, the *Byang chub sems kyi gnad drug ces bya ba'i lag len* on p. 447, l.6, and the *'Khor lo bzhi sbrag*, p. 462, ll.4f.

See p. 289, l.4, the *sGron ma'i 'grel pa nyi 'od rgyan* comments on this phrase on p. 345, l.6 – p. 346, l.1 and the *sGron ma drug gi dgongs don 'grel pa* on p. 411, ll.3–5.

pa nyi 'od rgyan on p. 349, 1.4.

The Byang chub sems kyi gnad drug ces bya ba'i lag len also briefly describes a (bon nyid) 'od gsal gyi bar do on p. 447, 1.4 – p. 448, 1.1. See also The 'Khor lo bzhi sbrag, which like the sGron ma drug gi gdams pa has a more elaborate version on p. 462, 1.4 – p. 464, 1.1. I should like to note here that the Byang chub sems kyi gnad drug ces bya ba'i lag len and the 'Khor lo bzhi sbrag do speak of 'od gsal gyi bar do, instead of, or, as far as the latter is concerned, alongside, a bon nyid 'od gsal gyi bar do.

A more elaborate discussion regarding this date will follow in my forthcoming book on the intermediate state of reality as it is.

do, and shi nas pha rol 'phos pa srid pa'i bar do)<sup>65</sup> but does not include a bon nyid 'od gsal gyi bar do in the list, while later, almost on an aside, such a bar do is nevertheless distinguished at the end of the bar do of dying and the beginning of the srid pa'i bar do.<sup>66</sup>

Another interesting point is the inclusion of *gnas pa gzhi'i bar do* next to *skye shi gnyis kyi bar do* in the same list, a phenomenon that we also find in the Buddhist *Thugs rje chen po'i bar do mun gsal sgron me'i zhal gdams* (*Gab pa mngon phyung, Ma ni bka' 'bum*), but that is also present in 'Mi la ras pa's' *mGur 'bum* and in Yang dgon pa's *Bar do 'phrang sgrol*. The *gnas pa gzhi'i bar do* here does not refer to *rang bzhin gnas pa'i bar do* as a *bar do* of life, but to a process of straying from *kun gzhi.*<sup>67</sup> This meaning might, in a more general sense, well be implicit in the designation *rang bzhin* of *rang bzhin gnas pa (gzhi)'i bar do* as such. There is moreover no doubt that *skye shi'i bar do* refers to a phase of life here.<sup>68</sup>

Lastly, I should like to point out briefly that this texts features an oblique reference to *zhi khro'i lha* in the description of *'chi kha'i bar do* when referring to the relevant preparatory practices one could or should do while still alive.<sup>69</sup>

Compare the list of bar do-s in the Bar do 'od lnga ngos bzung ba'i man ngag to the slightly different set of bar do-s listed in the 12<sup>th</sup> c. AD(?) Bar do dus kyi sgron ma<sup>70</sup> (to wit: rang bzhin gnas pa'i bar do, ting nge 'dzin gyi bar do, rmi lam gyi bar do, skye shi'i bar do, bon nyid 'od gsal gyi bar do, and srid pa'i bar do).<sup>71</sup> Noteworthy is that one edition (the 1976 one) reads a curious 'jig rten gyi bar do instead of ting nge 'dzin gyi bar do (maybe a convergence with the 'jigs pa dus kyi bar do mentioned later?).

In this text, too, rang bzhin gnas pa gzhi'i bar do and skye shi'i bar do appear in the same list. Unlike in the Bar do 'od lnga ngos bzung ba'i man ngag, however, rang bzhin gnas pa gzhi'i bar do here seems to refer to a phase of life,<sup>72</sup> while skye shi'i bar do here clearly refers to a phase of dying;<sup>73</sup> the name 'chi kha'i bar do is not mentioned.

Also interesting is a reference to four more bar do-s that are not included in the discussion here (chags pa gzhi'i bar do, gnas pa tshe'i bar do, 'jigs pa dus kyi bar do, stong pa srid pa'i bar do).<sup>74</sup> This set of four bar do-s is discussed in the sNyan rgyud rig pa gcer mthong gi gzhung.<sup>75</sup> The texts then proceeds to explain (only) four bar do-s of the first list further, to wit, rang bzhin gnas pa'i bar do, skye shi'i bar do, bon nyid 'od gsal gyi bar do, and srid pa'i bar do.

When we follow the text of the *Bar do dus kyi sgron ma* from the description of *skye shi'i bar do* as it continues into the first part of *bon nyid 'od gsal gyi bar do*,<sup>76</sup> no such awkward double reference to *kun gzhi* or 'od gsal

```
65 P. 345, ll.1–3.
```

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>66</sup> P. 356, ll.2–7.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>67</sup> See the description on p. 345, l.3 – p. 346, l.1.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>58</sup> Cf. p. 346, ll.1f.

See p. 346, l.6 – p. 347, l.3.

See a very helpful article by Achard (1998) on Bon zhig khyung nag (1103–83) and the Rig pa gcer mthong, which is the cycle that this text belongs to.

P. 377, l.9 (1976) and p. 236, ll.3f (1972).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>72</sup> P. 378, l.1 (1976) and p. 236, l.6 (1972).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>73</sup> P. 378, l.2 (1976) and p. 237, l.1 (1972).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>74</sup> P. 377, ll.9f (1976) and p. 236, ll.4f (1972).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>75</sup> P. 440, 1.2 – p. 442, 1.2.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>76</sup> P. 378, l.3 – p. 379, l.9 (1976) and p. 237, l.1 – p. 239, l.5 (1972).

arising occurs. Moreover there is a tantalising brief reference to deities ('bring gis <'od Inga> rigs Inga longs spyod rdzogs pa'i sku rnams shes par<sup>77</sup> bya'o), stating that mediocre (no derogatory connotation implied) practitioners should understand the five lights as the rigs Inga, note well, it does not state that these five classes of deities would be arising as visions (a similar reference also appears in a Bon text from a different rDzogs chen tradition, the Bar do'i ngo sprod kyi gdams pa in the Yang rtse klong chen cycle discovered by gZhod ston dngos grub grags 'bar in 1088)!<sup>78</sup> This clearly shows at which point deities might have entered such a bar do, i.e., at the description of the 'experiences' of coloured lights; even the redaction of a relatively late text like the ChB still clearly shows how the insertion of a full description of the manḍala explodes a more coherent series of (seven) stages that describe general 'experiences' of luminosity (which features in most of the Buddhist and Bon descriptions).<sup>79</sup>

It is fascinating to see how the (*Zhang zhung*) sNyan rgyud material adduced above in its peculiarities addresses and provides hints at possible developments, and at times even clarifies problems in later Buddhist presentations, like, for instance, in the *ChB*. But up to now this has very much been a finger painting session, allowing a large distance to the concrete historical contexts of the concepts that appear in these several texts. Most of the details of transmission and the concrete points of exchange still remain to be established at this point. What I hope to have made clear so far is that a bird's eye view of speculations on the subject reveals a framework and some directions in which to start working out further details. Especially with regard to the double reference to 'od gsal, as an 'experience' that the process of dying culminates in and as an important ingredient for speculations on an intermediate state of 'reality as it is', a closer examination of descriptions of the last phases of dying in 'bKa' rgyud' material will be revealing.

#### 2.2 Intermezzo II, 'bKa' rgyud' Material

If one is interested in the position of 'od gsal in relation to bar do, a closer look at the writings of early bKa' rgyud pa-s and their ancestors is indispensable. In 'bKa' rgyud' texts, against a background of various versions of chos drug, we find very clear and elaborate descriptions of a 'chi kha'i bar do (though not necessarily under that very name) and 'od gsal 'experiences'. Not rarely 'od gsal 'experiences' are divided there into (two/three) separate categories.

In general, 'bKa' rgyud' material in its *bar do* presentations strikes me as fairly faithful to *abhidharma*. Both the descriptions and the classification of *bar do-s* are strongly reminiscent of presentations in texts like the *Abhidharmakośabhāṣya*, quite often they have incorporated literal quotes. As I have noted elsewhere, <sup>80</sup> the most remarkable feature of early 'bKa' rgyud' discussions of *bar do-s* that I have been able to consult so far is that a *chos* 

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>77</sup> Emend: *rnam shes par*.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>78</sup> See the *Bla med rdzogs pa chen po yang rtse klong chen gyi khrid gzhung cha lag dang bcas pa'i gsung pod*, edited by Sherab Wangyal, Vol. I, p. 673, l.4 – p. 674, l.1, Dolanji 1973.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>79</sup> See Blezer (1997), pp. 124f.

See Blezer (1997), pp. 28f., esp. n.128, based on a few telling samples (*Mi la ras pa'i mgur 'bum* and a version of the *Nā ro pa'i rnam thar*).

nyid bar do as a separate phase does not seem to be distinguished, the chos nyid bar do rather seems to be a specific rDzogs chen development. The additional evidence adduced here has confirmed my earlier impressions, but more, early material needs to be studied to be absolutely sure. Typically one will find a trio of bar do-s (one or two with regard to death and dying), and even though the nomenclature is not always consistent, the material I have examined so far fits well into Vasubandhu-s scheme of (pūrvakālabhava,) mṛtyu- or maraṇabhava, antarābhava and upapattibhava. Moreover the bar do-s are often characterised or distinguished on basis of the practices of (especially) the chos drug they are associated with (but also by the kind of subtle body being purified and, of course, the buddhakāya being realised, which is, in turn, related to the level of the practitioner). Descriptions of the stages of dissolution at death are most elaborate in texts of 'bKa' rgyud pa-s' and the stages are usually spelled out meticulously; a bar do of dying and 'experiences' of 'od gsal seems to be very much in focus.

Apart from the texts adduced in my 'Kar gling Zhi khro' (mainly the Chos drug gi man ngag, 'Mi la ras pa's' mGur 'bum and Nā ro pa's rNam thar)<sup>81</sup> I should like to adduce some more early but also some later material here. The first text that I should like to discuss is attributed to Khyung po rnal 'byor (probably 11<sup>th</sup>–12<sup>th</sup> AD), to wit, the Bar do rnam gsum gyi zhal gdams.<sup>82</sup> A list of three bar do-s appears: skye shi'i bar do, rmi lam bar do, and srid pa bar do.<sup>83</sup> This text features a listing of (four) phases of dissolution of gross and subtle (states of) conceptual thought that deviates from the regular scheme of three (snang mched thob gsum),<sup>84</sup> the last phase, i.e. nye bar thob pa, is, as far as my present knowledge goes, usually not distinguished. We do find a distinction of 'od gsal into sgom pa'i 'od gsal and rang bzhin gyi 'od gsal, but both clearly pertain to a phase of dying, so there is no doubling of an 'od gsal 'experience' over different bar do-s.<sup>85</sup>

Mi la ras pa (1040/53–1123/35) is supposed to have written a text specifically on *bar do*, to wit, the *bDe mchog snyan brgyud kyi lam blo nas gcod pa bar do ngo sprod kyi gdams ngag zab mo<sup>86</sup>* and the *Lam blo nas gcod pa bar do ngo sprod kyi gdams pa zab mo*, but the authorship particularly of the latter is not completely clear. The colophon of the first-mentioned version identifies the text as an instruction by Mi la ras pa to Ras chung rdo rje brags pa (1084–1161). There is no clear indication of authorship in the second version, even though I remain alerted by this datum, I shall, as for now, rely on the attribution of the other version. Like in the *mGur 'bum*, the classification of *bar do-s* is not demarcated very clearly. The term *bar do* seems to be used somewhat more fluidly and metaphorically here for all kinds of transitional situations. Even though three *bar do-s* appear as a basic pattern, other *bar do-s* 

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>81</sup> See Blezer (1997), pp. 26–31.

See bibliography.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>83</sup> P. 264, ll.2f. This list is briefly explained on p. 264, ll.3–6 when the basis of purification is explained.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>84</sup> P. 266, 1.1.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>85</sup> P. 268, 1.5 – p. 270, 1.2, explaining *nye bar thob pa*.

<sup>86</sup> See bibliography.

Other edition of the same text; see bibliography.

See the colophon, after the colophon title on p. 73, l.3 (i.e. on p. 73, l.3 – p. 76, l.2) the text is identified as an instruction by Mi la ras pa to Ras chung rdo rje brags pa (1084–1161), see esp. p. 76, l.2.

are also distinguished. Thus we can, for instance, find three familiar-sounding bar do-s listed and discussed briefly, to wit: skye shi'i bar do, bag chags rmi lam gyi bar do, and snang mun srid pa'i bar do, 89 all in relation to the first category of a more generic classification of bar do-s into three main groups: lus ldan gzhi'i bar do, nges shes rtags kyi bar do, and ngo sprod 'bras bu'i bar do. 90

With regard to the other headings all kinds of further types of 'bar do' are mentioned as well, some of these are of the more familiar kind, for instance srid pa 'chi ka ma'i bar do,91 but also more curious and at times confusing categories appear, like a chos nyid bar do, 92 which here, quite clearly, pertains to being introduced to chos nyid while being alive and not to a phase immediately after death. The skye shi shes pa snga phyi'i bar do is associated with the conceptual vacuum between two thoughts (shes pa snga phyi gnyis kyi bar ...). 93 Such a shes pa snga phyi gnyis kyi bar do also appears in the Bar do lam khyer 'khor 'das rgyun gcod kyi gdams ngag, which will be discussed anon, but it is especially prominent in the Thugs rje chen po'i bar do mun gsal sgron me'i zhal gdams, which we discussed at the end of the presentation of rNying ma material. The classification is rather complicated; I shall not discuss it here. Three types of 'od gsal are distinguished, 'chi ka'i 'od gsal, rang bzhin gyi 'od gsal, and 'bras bu'i 'od gsal, all of these pertain to a bar do of dying.94 The text furthermore describes a snang mun srid pa bar do,95 an 'od gsal 'experience' is not described for this phase. A (rigs mthun) mngal gyi bar do is also discussed.<sup>96</sup>

See also another text in the same volume, the *Bar do lam khyer 'khor 'das rgyun gcod kyi gdams ngag* (as said, I found no indication of the author). Here we find a related discussion with a similar free use of the term *bar do*. There is no separate listing or discussion, but the basic distinction seems to be again into three, *skye shi'i bar do, rmi lam bar do, srid pa bar do. Srid pa 'chi ka ma'i bar do* is also mentioned sa is *shes pa snga phyi'i bar do*. The last-mentioned *bar do* features more prominently in the previous text and, as said, especially in the *Thugs rje chen po'i bar do mun gsal sgron me'i zhal gdams*, discussed above.

In the *Bar do'i dmar khrid*<sup>99</sup> sGam po pa (1079–1153) distinguishes three *bar do-s*: a so-called 'first', 'second' and 'third'. They correspond to a *bar do* of dying (associated with understanding 'od gsal), to a *srid pa'i bar do* (associated with understanding *sgyu lus*) and to a *bar do* of being reborn (associated with closing the door of the womb, *mngal sgo 'gag pa*). <sup>100</sup> sGam po pa appends this division to a quote from the *bKa' yang dag pa'i tshad ma zhes bya ba mkha' 'gro ma'i man ngag*, which is attributed to Ti lo pa (988–1069). <sup>101</sup>

```
89 P. 100, 1.2 – p. 101, 1.3.
90 P. 100, ll.1f.
91 E.g. on p. 103, 1.2.
92 E.g. on p. 103, 1.3.
93 See p. 105, ll.3ff.
94 P. 111, l.5 – p113, l.1, esp. the last two lines.
95 For the snang mun part in the name of this bar do see, for instance, p. 116, l.2.
96 P. 115, ll.4f, discussed further on p. 121, ll.1ff.
18id., pp. 129–142.
198 E.g. p. 137, l.2.
199 In his collected works, see bibliography.
100 P. 54, l.7 – p. 55, l.2 (see also p. 55, ll.2–4).
101 P. 53, ll.4f (see also ll.5f).
```

That text indeed clearly discusses such a threefold *bar do* system in the preceding part (which is absent in the anonymous *bsTan 'gyur* version, see bibliography); but there is some reason for doubt about the direct attribution to Ti lo pa. <sup>102</sup> In the *Bar do'i dmar khrid* we find a distinction into the clear light realised in meditative practice and the ground luminosity that dawns at death, which in other texts is usually classified as son and mother clear light. *'Od gsal* is not differentiated here any further.

Another text attributed to sGam po pa, the *Bar do'i man ngag*, <sup>103</sup> also distinguishes three *bar do-s*, <sup>104</sup> but distinguishes the 'experiences' of luminosity of the second *bar do* as a separate category of 'od gsal, rang bzhin gyi 'od gsal. It thus distinguishes three 'od gsal 'experiences': goms pa'i 'od gsal, bsam gtan gyi 'od gsal, and rang bzhin gyi 'od gsal ba. <sup>105</sup> Here we see a distinction similar to that in the *ChB* and *Klong chen pa's 'Chi kha'i bar do'i gsal 'debs*, one 'od gsal 'experience', the rang bzhin gyi 'od gsal, is associated with the *bar do* following the phase of dying, in this case, of course, the *srid pa'i bar do*.

In sGam po pa's Bar do bzhi gdams  $pa^{106}$  we find a minimal list of three bar do-s that is reminiscent of the one associated with Nā ro pa  $(1016-1100)^{107}$  (skye shi'i bar do, rmi lam bar do, and srid pa bar do).  $^{108}$  In another text, the Bar do gsum gyi gdams pa lags,  $^{109}$  this scheme is indeed explicitly associated with Nā ro pa and described more elaborately.  $^{110}$  These two texts show the difference between the classifications attributed to Nā ro pa and Ti lo pa; compare also the system attributed to La va pa below.

We should also have a brief look at texts by Phag mo gru pa (1110–70) (quoting La va pa) and Zhang g-yu brag pa (1123–93).<sup>111</sup> In his collected works, Phag mo gru pa, like sGam po pa, also distinguishes three *bar do-s*, the first associated with *'od gsal*, the second with *sgyu lus*, the third with closing the door of the womb (*mngal sgo 'gag pa*).<sup>112</sup> He follows a classification attributed to La va pa.

Apparently, the text got corrupted at the enumeration of *bar do-s*, there seems to be evidence of a conflation of different schemes. Unfortunately, I do not have the text at hand, let alone different versions to consult, so the following must necessarily remain very tentative. There seems to be a scheme of three *bar do-s* discussed in which the first *bar do*, designated as a *bsgom pa'i bar do*, apparently refers to a *bar do* of life in which practice and

Many thanks to Dan Martin for identifying this text as the source; the quote is on f.9r, l.6 – f.9v., l.1, Kalimpong 1962, I-Tib-75. The preceding part, f.9r, ll.2–6, esp. l.2, clearly identifies the system of three *bar do-s* as indeed deriving from Ti lo pa. Yet the colophon indicates that the text was not actually *written* by Ti lo pa, but by Nā ro pa (1016–1100) (and Mar pa (1012–99)), which should leave some room for doubt.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>103</sup> Vol.II, pp. 344–348.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>104</sup> P. 344, 11.5–7.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>105</sup> P. 344, l.7 – p. 345, l.1.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>106</sup> Vol.II, p. 418, ll.3–6.

 $<sup>^{107}\,</sup>$  See Blezer (1997), pp. 27f., see also the following text.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>108</sup> P. 418, ll.3f.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>109</sup> Vol.II, pp. 428f.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>110</sup> P. 229, ll.1–3.

Thanks again to Dan Martin for pointing me to these texts and sharing an electronic and a photocopied version, and for providing bibliographical data.

photocopied version, and for providing bibliographical data.

See bibliography. Since I do not have the original text at hand right now I have to rely on Dan Martin's e-text. See Vol. III, ff.209–211.

purification can take place. A second bar do is mentioned, a srid pa'i bar do, which is divided into three: rang bzhin gnas kyi bar do, sgyu lus bsgoms pa'i bar do, and mngal gyi grong khyer dgag pa, two of which, to wit, the ones pertaining to an 'intermediate state' proper and a phase of being reborn, one would indeed expect being expounded here. The text then continues discussing these three subdivisions, never finishing the main enumeration. Though such a subdivision of bar ma do'i srid pa or srid pa bar do seems well possible in theory (but also in a concrete text, e.g., Thugs rje chen po'i bar do mun gsal sgron me'i zhal gdams), I suspect that conflation has occurred. What immediately comes to mind is the quite common differentiation of individual capacities regarding bar do (practice) into three categories, to wit, practitioners of a best, mediocre and lower capacity. This may here have erroneously been read as another distinction into three bar do-s, which, as we saw above, 'bKa' rgyud pa-s', here and elsewhere, believe to hinge upon the very issue of capacity.

Such a differentiation into different capacities, in general, is used very frequently in *bar do* discussions. In 'bKa' rgyud' tradition it seems to be rather common to make a distinction into a superior class that should focus on 'od gsal, a mediocre class that should concentrate on sgyu lus, and an inferior class that should attempt to close the door of the womb. Anyway, regarding the seemingly poor transmission of the text, I am not sure whether what is here ascribed to Phag mo gru pa is actually faithfully representing a set of *bar do-s* of La va pa.

A most curious point is that the *bar do* of dying is, as was briefly mentioned above in Intermezzo I, clearly designated as *gnas pa'i gzhi'i bar do* here

Zhang rin po che, in his  $N\bar{a}$  ro pa'i bar do'i gdam ngag la bar do rnam pa gsum, <sup>114</sup> adheres to the minimal tripartite bar do classification that by now is already familiar from  $N\bar{a}$  ro pa (*skye shi bar do, rmi lam bar do, srid pa'i bar do*) and lists them with due reference to  $N\bar{a}$  ro pa. <sup>115</sup>

In the *Bar do 'phrang sgrol* texts contained in the collected works of Yang dgon pa rgyal mtshan dpal (1213–58)<sup>116</sup> we can find a longer list of six *bar do-s: rang bzhin gnas pa'i bar do, rnam smin skye shi'i bar do, ting nge 'dzin bsam gtan gyi bar do, bag chags rmi lam gyi bar do, lugs zlog 'chi ka'i bar do, and lugs 'byung srid pa'i bar do. <sup>117</sup> Like in the Bon texts, the <i>Bar do 'od lnga ngos bzung ba'i man ngag* and *Bar do dus kyi sgron ma*, a *rang bzhin gnas pa'i bar do* is listed together with a *skye shi'i bar do*. Apparently, like in the *Bar do 'od lnga ngos bzung ba'i man ngag* (but unlike in the *Bar do dus kyi sgron ma*), here too, the former seems to refer to straying from (or being established in) *kun gzhi*<sup>118</sup> and the latter to an intermediate phase of life. <sup>119</sup> The same phenomenon also occurs in the *mGur 'bum* attributed to Mi la ras pa and in the *Thugs rje chen po'i bar do mun gsal sgron me'i zhal gdams*.

See, e.g., Zhang Rin po che in the  $N\bar{a}$  ro pa'i bar do gdam ngag la bar do rnam pa gsum, f.182r, l.5 – v, l.1.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>114</sup> See bibliography.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>115</sup> F.181v, ll.4f.

<sup>116</sup> See bibliography.

See the Bar do 'phrang sgrol gyi gzhung gdam pa (see bibliography). On p. 563, l.5 – p. 564, l.3.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>118</sup> See pp. 564, l.4ff.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>119</sup> Pp. 567, ll.6ff.

Yang dgon pa, in his description of dying, clearly refers to the arising of 'od gsal but does not distinguish several types, as sGam po pa does. <sup>120</sup> The Bar do 'phrang sgrol texts by Yang dgon pa provide an elaborate discussion of the last phase of death and an 'experience' of 'od gsal, but, from the present perspective, not too many new ideas are added to the stock that is already extant in earlier texts and which Yang dgon pa (partly) draws upon. <sup>121</sup>

#### **Conclusions**

A bon nyid and chos nyid bar do 'experience' after death is obviously (thematically) connected to a 'chi ba'i 'od gsal 'experience' and can, as I already indicated in my Kar gling Zhi khro, 122 be seen as an enlargement of the very first part of the more archaic concept of a bar ma do'i srid pa or srid pa'i bar do. The increased focus of attention was probably largely due to the prominence of practices dealing with bon nyid / chos nyid / kun gzhi 'od gsal. Later still, more elaborate visions of zhi khro may have been introduced under the influence of certain tantric and rDzogs chen practices, 123 giving rise to, for instance, a specific zhi khro bar do in Bon speculation and the chos nyid bar do as we know it from the ChB.

Moreover, at the moment it does not seem unlikely to me that the doubling of the 'od gsal 'experience' in the ChB is due to the time and circumstances of compilation of this highly composite text, developing at a time when speculations on chos nyid bar do and zhi khro bar do (and, of course, on a 'chi kha'i bar do and cognates) were already common knowledge, and combining a version of a bar do of dying—I am inclined to look at 'bKa' rgyud' traditions here (which the allotted space for this article does not permit me to present now)—that includes explicit reference to 'od gsal 'experience' with a fully developed zhi khro bar do-like chos nyid bar do that, of course, also features a reference to 'od gsal/ chos nyid, but has re-focused on a description of zhi khro. All this apparently without being any longer aware of the fact that a 'zhi khro bar do' as such derives from descriptions of chos nyid kyi 'od gsal, which thematically are again strongly indebted to the 'od gsal episodes from descriptions of the process of dying; thus juxtaposing two similar topics. This would—unless, of course, the diversification of 'od gsal would be doctrinal and intended rather than a result or by-product of compilation—support the eclectic nature of the ChB as compared to, for instance, the Nyi zla kha sbyor. It also suggests a later date of fixation, which, I guess, not many would doubt anyway), and would further underline the conclusion already forwarded in my *Kar gling Zhi khro*, <sup>124</sup> that the *ChB* shows many signs of editing and compilation. <sup>125</sup>

 $<sup>^{120}\,</sup>$  See pp. 600, l.2ff. and p. 606, l.2ff.

An interesting text in this collection, which also deserves to be briefly mentioned here, is the *Bar do 'phrang sgrol gyi lo rgyus tshe rings ma'i zhus len* (see bibliography), it presents some historical considerations.

With reference to Back (1979).

Regarding which I shall not elaborate here, as this will be the subject of subsequent research to be published in later work. See also Germano (1994).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>124</sup> See Blezer (1997), e.g. p. 93.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>125</sup> [See publication, then forthcoming, now published as Blezer (2003).]

In this conclusion I also should like to summarise the general listings of *bar do-s* as they have surfaced in the texts discussed and referred to in this article. This is, of course, by no means a complete and exhaustive conspectus of *bar do* speculations between the eighth and fourteenth centuries (especially *bar do* discussions conceived during and shortly after the fourteenth century are poorly represented), but it might, its limited scope notwithstanding, nevertheless serve to indicate some lines in the variance perceived so far and reveal some directions for further hypotheses and research. Some general features do indeed seem to stand out. Again, kindly refer to the conspectus in the appendix when reading the following discussion.

Most of the possibly early  $^{126}$  presentations in the rNying ma'i rgyud 'bum and rNying ma'i rgyud beu bdun, tend to list four or five bar do-s. They typically include a bar do of life and death and a bar do of death is sometimes (two out of five) included here; more often than not (three out of five) a ting nge 'dzin gyi bar do is included; less often (two out of five) a rmi lam bar do; also a chos nyid bar do is often included (three out of five); a srid pa'i bar do here as in other texts is usually mentioned. These texts always prefer a designation like rang bzhin gnas pa'i bar do for an intermediate state of life. For a bar do of death the designation skye shi bar do is preferred (two out of three texts that explicitly list such). Moreover, in those texts that most probably constitute the earliest material, zhi khro are quite often (two out of three) not explicitly mentioned—but, as noted before, because of the concise nature of some of the presentations we should not attach too much weight to this evidence. I should moreover like to point out that the classification of the Bar do lnga'i ngo sprod<sup>127</sup> matches the one presented in the rDzogs pa chen po bar do gsang ba'i rgyud very well. The Rin po che 'phags lam bkod pa'i rgyud was not taken into account here, but it might well be an early text; based on its general characteristics; however, I provisionally arranged the brief discussion in this text with fourteenth century material. The sPros bral don gsal chen po'i rgyud and the Thig le kun gsal chen po'i rgyud, which, as far as I checked, feature identical descriptions, are weighed as one.

In possibly later (12<sup>th</sup> – 14<sup>th</sup> ÅD?) rNying ma presentations we find four to six *bar do-s* listed. A *chos nyid bar do* is usually present (three out of four) and *zhi khro* are, at least, referred to. A *ting nge 'dzin gyi bar do* (and possible cognates) and a *rmi lam gyi bar do* appear in half of the sampled texts and moreover appear together. Remarkable is the appearance of the locution *skye gnas* in the designation for a *bar do* of life (two out of four), a phrase that in the *mGur 'bum* is connected with a *bar do* of birth. A *bar do* of death is now more consistently styled *'chi kha'i bar do* (three quarters of a desperately small sample of four). While the list in the *Rin po che 'phags lam bkod pa'i rgyud*—I have no clue yet as to the date of this text, I have arranged it into this group purely based on the characteristics of its *bar do*-list—comes quite close to the *ChB*, the list in the *Chos thams cad kyi don bstan pa rdzogs chen thig le nyag gcig ye nas bya rtsal bral ba* (= *Theg pa'i spyi phud klong chen rab 'byams kyi rgyud*) matches the system in the *sNying thig ya bzhi* of Klong chen pa very well (what's in a name). But I have to emphasise here once more that

<sup>126</sup> Traditionally dated to the 8<sup>th</sup> c. AD, though some, first and foremost Germano, have tentatively suggested to move most of these to the 11<sup>th</sup> c. AD?

From the *Ka dag rang 'byung rang shar-*cycle, which is associated with Rig 'dzin rgod kyi ldem 'phru can (1337–1408) but claims an 8<sup>th</sup> c. AD origin.

the narrow sample of texts, and, not in the last place, the at times conjectural ordering of them, does not allow reliable conclusions regarding the groups of texts that have been put together here (read: but might not deserve to be grouped together at all). The relation to other (more convincing) groups, however, might, regarding the suggested dating, still be of some relevance here.

The Ma ni bka' 'bum text, the Thugs rje chen po'i bar do mun gsal sgron me'i zhal gdams, shows in its listing of bar do-s a strong affinity with 'bKa' rgyud' material:

- A *bar do* of life is styled *skye shi'i bar do*; this would be the only rNying ma text that I know of that does this.
- It describes rang bzhin gnas pa'i bar do as a bar do of straying from gzhi'i rang bzhin.
- And, lastly, it gives a prominent place to *shes pa snga phyi'i bar do*, a *bar do* which so far I only encountered in 'bKa' rgyud' texts.

This might make the (indeed likely) attribution of the *Gab pa mngon phyung* to rNying ma and *rDzogs chen* circles in Sørensen (1994, p. 586) stand in need of a small footnote.

In Bon (*Zhang zhung*) sNyan rgyud texts that present a list of bar do-s, especially in the Bar do 'od lnga ngos bzung ba'i man ngag, we find a remarkable and quite surprising affinity to later bKa' rgyud material (as represented, for example, in Yang dgon pa's work). There are several arguments in favour of this:

- The ambiguity of the presence of a bon nyid 'od gsal gyi bar do—not listed but still described in the Bar do 'od lnga ngos bzung ba'i man ngag (as far as its dating goes it should be closely contemporary with Yang dgon pa)—suggests interesting relationships to bKa' rgyud traditions, which, as said, also do not list a chos nyid bar do.
- The presence of a *bar do* of straying from *kun gzhi* in both traditions. As far as I can see now, this *bar do* of straying from *rang bzhin* occurs most frequently in 'bKa' rgyud' material (but again note the curious position of the *Thugs rje chen po'i bar do mun gsal sgron me'i zhal gdams* in this respect).
- The resemblance is moreover born out by the concrete *bar do* lists in the *Bar do 'od lnga ngos bzung ba'i man ngag* and in Yang dgon pa's *Bar do'i 'phrang sgrol* texts.
- The use of the name *skye shi bar do* for a *bar do* of life in the *Bar do 'od lnga ngos bzung ba'i man ngag* also clearly points to writings of 'bKa' rgyud pa-s' (the *Thugs rje chen po'i bar do mun gsal sgron me'i zhal gdams,* again, uniquely complies).
- Last but not least, the resemblance receives very convincing support from remarkably detailed descriptions of the stages of dissolution at death, which, at such an early date, seem to figure very prominently in exactly these two traditions (a closer investigation of *Kālacakra* presentations on the subject of dying and *rtsa rlung yoga* seems a most worth-while investment in this respect, actually a quite obvious step, I should say).

The list of bar do-s in the Bar do dus kyi sgron ma seems to align better with the Rin po che 'phags lam bkod pa'i rgyud and the ChB, though Yang dgon pa here too provides a fine match.

So, some remarkable points indeed, seem to have come out of this survey. The earliest Zhang zhung snyan rgyud material examined so far does not provide explicit lists of bar do-s nor distinguish too many of them (only the sGron ma drug and commentaries present a modest group of three bar do-s). Later presentations do present more elaborate lists. But then, quite surprisingly, the nature of these later bar do lists and also parts of the concrete descriptions (especially of the Bar do 'od lnga ngos bzung ba'i man ngag) are quite distinct from the earlier descriptions and point in other directions than one would initially have expected, that is, for instance, not only to rNying ma but also to 'bKa' rgyud' traditions! So, the earliest texts tend to show convergence with rNying ma material and late medieval material tends to show some measure of affinity with roughly contemporaneous bKa' rgyud traditions. Many more texts need to be examined, not in the last place also from other Bon traditions on bar do, in order to be able to draw any more definite conclusions, but the evidence adduced so far does give some very interesting suggestions and directions and focus for further research, I dare say.

In 'bKa' rgyud' material, typically, two sets of three bar do-s are listed: one associated with La va pa (and Ti lo pa), the other with Nā ro pa. Most frequent are references to a bar do of death (six out of nine), a srid pa'i bar do (in all instances) and less frequently a bar do pertaining to rebirth (five out of nine), a bar do of life (five out of nine) and a bar do of dream (also five out of nine). Lists of six bar do-s also occur, such are, for instance, the list(s) attributed to Mi la ras pa (1040/53 1123/35), but these lists are not very clear and consistent; as I noted earlier (above and Blezer 1997:28f), the term bar do seems to be used rather freely in the mGur 'bum, but also in the Lam blo nas gcod pa bar do ngo sprod kyi gdams pa zab mo; these two texts, perhaps connected with Mi la ras pa, have been weighed as one. This total number also occurs in the late presentation of Yang dgon pa, which features a consistent list of six bar do-s (by the way, his are the only bKa' rgyud texts that I know of that list ting nge 'dzin gyi bar do).

In general, the most characteristic features of the 'bKa' rgyud' material examined are that a *chos nyid bar do* as a phase after death is not listed in any of the texts and that most of the texts list a *bar do* of birth. The latter does not appear in texts of other traditions (as far as the sample goes). In the Buddhist *Bar do thos grol*, for instance, it appears as part of the *srid pa'i bar do*. The 'bKa' rgyud' texts are very detailed in their descriptions of stages of dying. Another typical feature is that a *bar do* of life is always referred to as *skye shi bar do*, while the designations for a *bar do* of death vary widely. Lastly, I should like to point to the fact that *rang bzhin bar do* here does not refer to a *bar do* of life but rather to a *bar do* of straying from *rang bzhin*, and also, and most curiously, to a *bar do* of death (La va pa, Phag mo gru pa).

So, to summarise, the main hypotheses that I am currently forwarding are that in the earliest layers of speculation a bon nyid ('od gsal gyi) bar do and a chos nyid kyi bar do, true to their name, focused (in contrast to the presentation of a chos nyid bar do in the ChB) on an 'experience' of bon nyid chos nyid | 'od gsal rather than on a zhi khro maṇḍala, the latter being a later

and more specific elaboration, in which case in a Bon context the term *zhi khro bar do* was preferred (though the Buddhist term *chos nyid zhi khro'i bar do* does occur in the *Chos thams cad kyi don bstan pa rdzogs chen thig le nyag gcig ye nas bya rtsal bral ba* (= *Theg pa'i spyi phud klong chen rab 'byams kyi rgyud*)). The conspicuous absence of (direct) references to *zhi khro* in the *bon nyid* ('od gsal gyi) bar do descriptions of the (*Zhang zhung*) sNyan rgyud texts that were examined so far would suggest a greater antiquity for the concept employed there as compared to that/those in most of the Buddhist *chos nyid bar do* descriptions that I am familiar with. And, however evident that might seem, I should also like to point out once more that, considering the fact that an 'od gsal 'experience' would conclude a bar do of dying, the bon nyid/ chos nyid bar do can be seen as an elaboration on or projection of 'od gsal 'experiences' into the beginning of a phase after death.

#### [Postscript]

The original, longer and more detailed study—of which this article is a mere summary—includes extensive quotes and also collations of the main versions. It was slated to appear around 2000. Due to organisational work on the Ninth Seminar of the IATS in Leiden (late June 2000) and its voluminous proceedings, publication has been delayed. Meanwhile, Philippe Cornu, with admirable stamina, has taken up work on a post-mortem state of 'reality as it is' in Bon and Buddhism. He continued the investigations and followed up suggestions for future research, in my thesis and elsewhere, including the present article. This resulted in a truly impressive 1200-page Ph.D.-thesis and recently in a paper, presented at an international Bon conference in *Shenten Dargye Ling*, Blou, France, 2008, forthcoming in *East & West*. I applaud academic synergies, especially when work is done well and conscientiously. <sup>128</sup>

Echoing Germano's own words: his work also contributes much of importance to this discussion—reportedly even more in its unpublished parts—even though it may be somewhat flawed in its emphasis on the historical debt of these ideas to the earlier Great Perfection—and especially sNying thig—materials (2005:5); but perhaps we should be more careful than to use such rash qualifications (without further discussion ...). His angle indeed easily induces reification of a retrospective snying thig rubric and commitment to a Seminal Heart-centered view of the period and phenomena, which also pervades some other publication on the topic; a point of departure that may relate to the history of research interests (thesis). Intellectually and occasionally also exegetically these analyses and perspectives on past Great Perfection trends, almost in a teleological manner, seem to anticipate on Klong chen pa's writings, as a 'natural' culmination of rDzogs chen developments, or as Germano puts it: "the triumph of the Seminal Heart synthesis" (2005:27); this in spite of his more recent cautionings "that the category Great Perfection came to constitute a vast

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>128</sup> Under these circumstances, it of course does not make sense anymore to pursue the publication project as I had originally planned it. *Deo volente*, some of my unpublished materials may still appear in updated and rewritten form in publication on continuity and change in Bon ideas, under grateful reference to Cornu and others.

meta-rubric concealing the heterogeneity of an extremely diverse array of traditions" (2005:7)—needless to say, I could not agree more.

Naturally, I also agree with Germano's reminder of the "importance of commitment to a broader historical analysis of early treasure traditions for the assessment of the significance of particular doctrinal, ritual, and rhetorical elements in individual texts" (2005:28). Yet, working hypotheses regarding a probable history of ideas should not, vice versa, become used as a priori for the study of individual cases, at the exclusion of other possible framings; one would risk overlooking the evidence that does not suit one's points of departure. To avoid such methodological circularities, I should not advise to start from following, adjusting, or even construing grand narratives for later rDzogs chen doxographical categories (indeed deriving from those same categorisations!) before having studied individual texts in their own right, in in-depth case studies without making any such assumptions, and also not before understanding when, how and why exactly emic doxographical categories were designed the way they are. As Germano is aware, projecting doxography onto history, explicitly or implied, usually is a fragile exercise, fraught with difficulty. Also, assuming that developments that in retrospect, in a certain light, appear similar may also historically relate, before or without ascertaining the interface of exchange in greater philological and historical detail, while often an unavoidable starting point (such as also in this article in fact), is risky as well.

For example, I do not think we should start from subsuming what came to pass in the early community around Karma gling pa, under a grand scheme of developments epitomised by Klong chen pa's writing. It may well turn out to be true, one day, but the work needed to establish that affiliation or crossover at the present moment still needs to be done. For many Kar gling treasures it is unclear what exactly his contribution was. Central and probably early texts in his revelation do not fit *rDzogs chen* doxographical categories well. Also, Man ngag gi sde doctrinal affiliations of later additions, by his followers and family, should not be written into his record. We do not even know when exactly he lived. His dates quoted in secondary sources go back to the sexagesimal cycle in which his birth date is roughly located (1327–87, probably based on Dudjom Rinpoche) and do not indicate his life span. The scant available biographical sketches of him suggest that he was precocious and died young: he probably was pushing daisies before pushing 60. Moreover, I have discussed pre-existing, poorly organised materials that provide substantial overlap with work attributed to Karma gling pa (Blezer 2003). Those materials clearly predate Klong chen pa; in fact, Cornu (2006) shows that the latter also quotes from such a text in several of his works. We would therefore be ill advised to start from the assumption that Karma gling pa's revelations represent a consolidation of that 'triumph', epitomised by Klong chen pa. However seductive grand unified theories are, we should not lose sight of refractory philological and historical detail; in fact, one should, as a matter of methodological principle, probably specifically venture out and look for the cracks in theory, rather than attempt to find confirmation of preconceived notions.

The early evidence that we now have for a *bar do* of 'reality as it is', also from Bon traditions, recommends a very cautious approach. It seems advisable to evaluate the impact of continuity and change in expertise on death, dying, and funerary rites and on a *bar do* of 'reality as it is' based on

its own merits, rather than to frame it according to a retrospective grand narrative of the *Werdegang* of dominant trends in the Great Perfection. Appreciating that *sNying thig* is deeply constituted by funerary expertise is one step removed from considering the possibility that some developments subsumed under *rDzogs chen* such as *sNying thig* materials may have a (more) significant pedigree in expertise on death and dying and maybe were even sparked off by that—*in casu* this may even provide a more impartial and balanced angle on the problematic. The long history of continuity and change in thanatology in these cultural areas may provide more firmly grounded and relevant alternative framing: expertise on death and dying as a *Leitfaden*, shaped by the interests of the day. Much will be in the eye of the beholder, but the fact that thanatology, or even just *bar do* discourse, encompass much wider phenomena than the mentioned *rDzogs chen* trends should alert us. In fact, doctrinally speaking, *bar do-s*, are *not* for (serious) rDzogs chen pa-s at all.

But rather than arguing for alternative framings, I should recommend bottom-up case studies of individual textual traditions and avoid starting out by first trying to 'read' these cases from historicising perspectives that follow traditional doxographical sensibilities: one could thus easily miss or gloss over important distinctions. sNying thig may resume, posthoc, under its name, some earlier developments relating to death and dying: say, Germano's funerary Buddhism, which now, inversely, is largely considered a main feature of sNying thig, at the cost of other strands of intellectual history that it forms a relevant and integral part of. That is the nature of history: it is always someone's history. The world according to Shar rdza or the world according to Klong chen pa. The history of death-related ideas, such as a bar do of 'reality as it is', in any case ought to be as much about their autonomous development as it is about their emergence in literature classified as sNying thig. I am wary of framing, and particularly of emic framings, and have been from the very start of my analyses in casu (cf. 1997 Ph.D. thesis); some may indeed construe this reservation as a flaw, but I consider it a methodological point of departure, that eventually may reveal something new, something that we do not already know from religious doxography or other forms of received wisdom. When publishing my full research materials, I hope to show in more detail why it may not always be wise to make the history of such *rDzogs chen* rubrics the main framework for understanding the topic studied; a discussion which I could only summarily preview here.

I am again completely with Germano (2005), when he cautions us against ordering *rDzogs chen* history of ideas according to doxographical categories of late canonical collections, as if they were chronological categories. While later hierarchical classifications do usually suggest or at least imply relative chronologies, its individual categories do not necessarily neatly map unto a diachrony, they largely are posthoc (mostly 18<sup>th</sup> c. AD) scholastic classifications and hierarchically organise developments that at least are partly synchronic and are more deeply involved with co-existing, reactive, factional identities than with implied historical antecedence per se (see, e.g., Germano's evaluation of the "Crown Pith's [*sPyi ti*, HB] reactionary orientation").]

### BIBLIOGRAPHY TIBETAN SOURCES

#### BON

Chandra, L., and Namdak, Lopon T. (1968) facs., History and Doctrine of the Bon-po Niṣpanna-yoga (original Tibetan texts on the transmission, teaching, rites and deities of the Rdzogs chen zhan zhun school of the Bon-po's) in Śatapiṭaka Series, Indo-Asian Literatures, Vol.73, New Delhi 1968:

- rDzogs pa chen po zhang zhung snyan brgyud kyi brgyud pa'i bla ma rnam thar, pp. 1–130;
- rDzogs pa chen po zhang zhung snyan brgyud las sgron ma drug gi gdams pa, pp. 269–92;
- rDzogs pa chen po zhang zhung snyan brgyud las sgron ma'i 'grel pa nyi 'od rgyan, pp. 293–354;
- rDzogs pa chen po zhang zhung snyan brgyud las sgron ma drug gi dgongs don 'grel pa, pp. 355–422;
- rDzogs pa chen po zhang zhung snyan brgyud las byang chub sems kyi gnad drug ces bya ba'i lag len, pp. 433–48;
- rDzogs pa chen po zhang zhung snyan brgyud las 'khor lo bzhi sbrag, pp. 449–64;
- rDzogs pa chen po zhang zhung snyan brgyud las man ngag le'u brgyad pa, pp. 479–501.

### Miscellaneous (*Zhang zhung*) sNyan rgyud texts:

- sNyan rgyud thos grol bar do 'phrang sgrol chen po in Bonpo Popular Canonical Texts, pp. 321–429, Dolanji 1974 (LTWA Acc.No. 808);
- sNyan brgyud bar do thos grol gsal sgron chen mo, in Zhi khro sgrub skor, pp. 605–91, Delhi 1967;
- Bar do dus kyi sgron ma and sNyan rgyud rig pa gcer mthong gi gzhung in sNyan rgyud rig pa gcer mthong, Bon-po oral transmission precepts granted by Srid pa rgyal mo to Bon zig khyung nag (1103–83), pp. 215–44 and pp. 405–50, Dolanji 1972;
- Bar do dus kyi sgron ma in Rare Bonpo Texts Belonging to the Abhidharma and sÑan rgyud rig pa gcer mthon Cycles, pp. 367–83, Dolanji 1976;
- Ma bcos gnyug ma'i don bstan pa'i gdams pa and Bar do 'od lnga ngos bzung ba'i man ngag both in Zhang zhung snyan rgyud kyi rnam thar chen mo sogs dang brgyud phyag bcas kyi gsung pod, A collection of texts of the Bonpo Žan Žun sÑan rgyud precepts of rDzogs chen practice, reproduced from a manuscript from the Samling Monastery in Dolpo (northwestern Nepal) by Yongs 'dzin sangs rgyas bstan 'dzin, pp. 335–44, pp. 344–59 successively, Dolanji 1974;
- *Zhi khro bar do 'phrang grol gyi thos grol las byang bag chags rang grol,* in *dBang ldan zhu yi ring lugs kyi zhi khro'i sgrub skor,* Vol. II, pp. 249–330, Dolanji 1975 (I-Tib 75-903251, IASWR microfiche number SB 774).

Several old *gTer ma* texts from gZhod ston dngos grub grags 'bar (according to the *bsTan rtsis* discovered 1088), not belonging to the (*Zhang zhung*) *sNyan rgyud* tradition are interesting to mention here too. In the *Bla med rdzogs pa chen po yang rtse klong chen gyi khrid gzhung cha la dang bcas pa*, Dolanji 1973, we find:

- Bar do'i ngo sprod kyi gdams pa, Vol. I, pp. 667–725.

And in the *rDzogs pa chen po zab lam gnad kyi gdams pa bsgrags pa skor gsum ma bu cha lag dan bcas pa*, Dolanji 1973, two other short texts on *bar do* discovered by gZhod ston are included:

- *Bar do'i gdams pa,* pp. 611–14;

- sMar byan bar do'i gdams pa, pp. 615–18.

#### **BUDDHIST**

rNying ma'i rgyud bcu bdun, Collected Nyingmapa Tantras of the Man ngag sde Class of the A ti yo ga (rDzogs chen) (reproduced from a set of prints from A 'dzom blocks preserved in the library of bDud 'joms rin po che by Sanje Dorje), three volumes, edited by Sanje Dorje, New Delhi 1973–77 (NG17):

- sKu thams cad kyi snang ba ston pa dbang rdzogs pa rang byung chen po'i rgyud, Vol. III, pp. 235-258;
- Nyi ma dang zla ba kha sbyor ba chen po gsang ba'i rgyud, Vol.III, pp. 153-233.

Texts from the *rNying ma'i rgyud 'bum*-section of the Taipei-edition of the Tibetan Tripitaka (Taipei 1991):

- sKu thams cad kyi snang ba ston pa dbang rdzogs pa rang byung chen po'i rgyud, Vol. LVI (Tib.Vol. da), no.4740 (= gTing skyes no.143), pp. 1/2 43/298(1);
- Chos thams cad kyi don bstan pa rdzogs chen thig le nyag gcig ye nas bya rtsal bral ba (= Theg pa'i spyi phud klong chen rab 'byams kyi rgyud), Vol. LV (Tib.Vol. nya), no.4643 (= gTing skyes no.65), pp. 301/290(3) 343/586(7), a gter ma of rDo rje gling pa (1346-1406);
- Thig le kun gsal chen po'i rgyud, Vol. LVI (Tib.Vol. pa), no.4759 (= gTing skyes no.81), pp. 271/296(6) 299/492(5), attributed to dGa' rab rdo rje?, 'Jam dpal bshes gnyen, Śrīsiṃha, Vairocana;
- *sPros bral don gsal chen po'i rgyud*, Vol. LVI (Tib.Vol. *pa*), no.4757 (= *gTing skyes* no.110), pp. 229/2 270/288(6), a treasure text of Guru chos dbang (1212-70), attributed to Padmasambhava, dGa' rab rdo rje?, 'Jam dpal bshes gnyen, Śrīsiṃha, Padma?;
- Byang chub sems kyi man ngag rin po che sgron ma 'bar ba'i rgyud, Vol. LIV (Tib.Vol.ca), no.4587, pp. 543/267(1) 553/338(6), attributed to Vimalamitra and sNyags Jñāna(kumāra);
- Man ngag snying gi dgongs pa rgyal ba'i bka' zhes bya ba'i rgyud (Man ngag), in Taipei edition, Vol. LVI (Tib.Vol. pa), no.4766 (= gTing skyes no.84?), pp. 311/580(6) 315/607(5), cf. the Dilgo Khyentse gTing skyes edition, Vol. V, pp. 314–52, Thimphu 1973;
- rDzogs pa chen po bar do gsang ba'i rgyud, Vol. LIV (Tib.Vol. nga), no.4558, pp. 465/526(6) 465/531(7), attributed to Śrīsiṃha and rDo rje yang dbang gter;
- *Rin po che 'phags lam bkod pa'i rgyud*, Vol. LIV (Tib.Vol. *ka*), no.4504 (= *gTing skyes* no.64), pp. 120/837(3) 124/863.

*gDams ngag mdzod,* A Treasury of Instructions and Techniques for Spiritual Realisation, compiled by 'Jam-mgon Kon-sprul Blo-gros-mtha'-yas, reproduced from a xylographic print from the Dpal-spuns blocks, edited by N. Lungtok and N. Gyaltsan, Delhi 1971:

- bKa' yang dag pa'i tshad ma zhes bya ba mkha' 'gro ma'i man ngag, Vol. V, pp. 69–89.
- Cf. bKa' yang dag pa'i tshad ma zhes bya ba mkha' 'gro ma'i man ngag, Kalimpong 1962.
- Cf. also bKa' yang dag pa'i tshad ma zhes bya ba mkha' 'gro ma'i man ngag in the Taipei edition of the sDe dge bsTan 'gyur (Tôhôku 2331), Vol.28, p. 243/541.3 243/545.3), NB. this is a different and much shorter text as the above.

Ma ni bka' 'bum, two volumes, Vol.II, Dharamsala 1995:

- Thugs rje chen po'i bar do mun gsal sgron me'i zhal gdams, p. 365, l.6 p. 387, l.2;
- sBrul pa'i rgyal po'i 'pho ba'i zhal gdams, p. 387, l.2 p. 391, l.2;

- *dBang po rab bar do med pa'i lam khyer*, p. 554, l.1 – p. 554, l.6;

- dBang po 'bring bar dor sangs rgya ba'i zhal gdams, p. 554, 1.6 p. 556, 1.1;
- dBang po tha ma'i lam khyer 'da' kha 'chi brod kyi gdams pa, pp. 556, ll.1–5.

Khyung po rnal 'byor (probably 11th-12th AD);

Bar do rnam gsum gyi zhal gdams, in Šans-pa Bka'-brgyud-pa Texts, A Collection of rare manuscripts of doctrinal, ritual, and biographical works of scholars of the Šans-pa Bka'-brgyud-pa tradition from the monastery of Gsan-snags-chos-glin in Kinnaur, Vol. I, pp. 263–86, Sumra H.P. 1977.

*Mi la ras pa* (1040/53–1123/35),

- bDe mchog snyan brgyud kyi lam blo nas gcod pa bar do ngo sprod kyi gdams ngag zab mo, in Rare Dkar-brgyud-pa Texts from the Library of Ri bo che Rje drun of Padma bkod, edited by Tseten Dorji, pp. 47–76, Tezu Arunachal Pradesh 1974;
- Lam blo nas gcod pa bar do ngo sprod kyi gdams pa zab mo, in mKha' 'gro snyan brgyud kyi yig rnying, edited by the fourth rGyal dban 'Brug chen IV, Padma dkar po, Dookchen Thoosay Rinpoche, Vol.II, pp. 99–128, Darjeeling 1982 (other edition of the same text, there is no indication of authorship in this version); and another text in the same volume,
- Bar do lam khyer 'khor 'das rgyun gcod kyi gdams ngag, ibid., pp. 129–42 (no indication of the author).

sGam po pa bsod nams rin chen (1079–1153), Collected Works (gSung-'bum) of sGam po pa bsod nams rin chen, in Lahoul Shashin Learned Works Library and Publishing House Series, Vol. V, edited by Khasdub Gyatsho Shashin from a manuscript from the bKra shis chos rdzong Monastery in Miyad Lahoul, 2 volumes, Vol. II, Delhi 1975:

- rJe dags po lha rje'i gsung/ dmar khrid gsang chen/ bar do'i dmar khrid/ 'pho ba'i dmar khrid zhal gdams dang bcas pa (Vol. II, pp. 32–58);

- Bar do'i man ngag (Vol. II, pp. 344–8);

- Chos dags po lha rje'i gsung/bar do bzhi gdams pa (Vol. II, p. 418, ll.3–6);
- Chos dags po lha rje'i gsung/ 'pho ba'i gdams pa (Vol. II, pp. 418–28);
- Chos rje dags po lha rje'i gsung/ bar do gsum gyi gdams pa lags (Vol. II, pp. 428f.).

*Phag mo gru pa* (1110–70), *bKa' 'bum*:

- Slob dpon chen po la ba pa'i bar do rnam pa gsum, in: Phag mo gru pa rdo rje rgyal po, bKa' 'bum (Collected Works) (a photocopied version of a 'golden manuscript' (written in gold ink), privately acquired in Tibet

by Dan Martin) four volumes, Vol. III, ff.209–11 (the manuscript was constructed under the patronage of 'Bri gung kun dga' rin chen (1475–1527)).

Zhang rin po che (1123–93), bKa' 'bum:

- Nā ro pa'i bar do'i gdam ngag la bar do rnam pa gsum, in Zhang g-yu brag pa brtson 'grus grags pa, bKa' 'bum (Collected Works), Vol. IV, ff.181–6 (microfilm of a six-volume manuscript kept at Samdo Monastery in Nepal, this nearly complete set is found in the Nepalese National Archives microfilm collection from running numbers L4686 through L4697, which is equivalent to the reel numbers L448/2 through L450/4).

Yang dgon pa rgyal mtshan dpal (1213–58), the Collected Works of Yan dgon pa rgyal mtshan dpal, three volumes, edited by Kunsang Thobgey from a Ms. preserved at Pha jo ldins Monastery, Thimphu 1976:

- Bar do 'phrang srol gyi lhan thabs sbas pa gnad kyi gter mdzod, Vol. II, pp. 1–51;
- Bar do 'phrang sgrol gyi lo rgyus tshe rings ma'i zhus len, Vol. II, pp. 531-49:
- Bar do'i bsdus don, Vol. II, pp. 551–9;
- Bar do 'phrang sgrol gyi gzhung gdam pa, Vol. II, pp. 561–644;
- Bar do 'phrang sgrol gyi brnga skad gsang ba'i lde mig, Vol. III, pp. 53–61;
- Bar do 'phrang sgrol gyi gtam rgyud, Vol. III, pp. 63–79;
- Bar do 'phrang sgrol gyi khrid yig, Vol. III, pp. 81–103;
- Bar do 'phrang sgrol gyi 'khrul 'khor zin bris, Vol. III, pp. 157–61.

Karma gling pa (14<sup>th</sup> AD), *Kar gling zhi khro*, see Kalsang Lhundup (1969), for further bibliographical references see Blezer (1997), p. 133:

- Chos nyid bar do'i gsal 'debs thos grol chen mo (ChB), pp. 4–69;
- Bar do 'phrang sgrol gyi smon lam, p. 115f.;
- Srid pa bar do'i ngo sprod gsal 'debs thos grol chen mo (SB), pp. 70–109.

Klong chen pa dri med 'od zer (1306/8–63), *sNying thig ya bzhi*, eleven volumes, Delhi 1970 (IASWR microfiche R-468) see amongst others (See not only Vol.3 but also Vol.6; for a full list see Blezer (1997), pp. 144f.):

- *Zhi ba bar do lam gyi mtshan nyid*, Vol. III, text h, p. 133, l.4 p. 153, l.6;
- *Khro bo bar do gnad kyi sgron me*, Vol. III, text i, p. 154, l.1 p. 174, l.6;
- Bar do'i gdams pa 'byung ba 'dus pa 'bral ba rtags kyi rim pa, Vol. III, text j, p. 174, l.6 p. 183, l.6;
- *'Chi kha'i bar do'i gsal 'debs*, Vol. III, text k, p. 183, l.6 p. 191, l.2;
- *Chos nyid bar do yon tan*, Vol. III, text l, p. 191, l.2 p. 195, l.6;
- *Bar do ngo sprod*, Vol. III, text m, p. 195, l.6 p. 198, l.5.

#### **SECONDARY SOURCES**

Achard, J.L. (1998), Bon zhig khyung nag and the Rig pa gcer mthong Tradition of rDzogs chen, in Tibet Journal, Vol.XXIII.4 (1998), special edition, Bon Religion of Tibet, pp. 28–57, Dharamsala.

Back, D.M. (1979), Eine Buddhistische Jenseitsreise, Das sogenannte "Totenbuch der Tibeter" aus philologischer Sicht, Wiesbaden 1979.

Blezer (1997), Kar glin Ži khro, A Tantric Buddhist Concept, Leiden 1997;

[- (2003) "Karma Gling pa: Treasure Finder (*gTer sTon*), Creative Editor (*gTer sTon*?)—A Preliminary Comparison of the Man ngag snying gi dgongs pa rgyal ba'i bka' zhes bya ba'i rgyud and Two Bar do thos grol chen mo-Texts: ..., in East and West, vol.52, nos.1–4 (December 2002), pp. 311–45; cf. a scrambled version appeared earlier *Reading Asia*: New Research in Asian Studies, pp. 292–338, Leiden 2001 (1998 yearbook of the IIAS).]

Blondeau, A.M. (1984), "Le "découvreur" du Maṇi bka'-'bum était-il Bon-po?", in Tibetan and Buddhist Studies, Commemorating the 200th Anniversary of the Birth of Alexander Csoma de Körös, Vol. I, Bibliotheca Orientalis Hungarica, Vol.XXIX.1, edited by L. Ligeti, pp. 77–122, Budapest 1984.

Chang, Garma C.C. (1977) trsl., *The Hundred Thousand Songs of Milarepa*, two volumes, Boston / Shaftesbury 1989 (Boston 1977).

Chökyi Nyima Rinpoche (1991), *The Bardo Guidebook*, translated by E. Pema Kunsang, Hong Kong/ Kathmandu 1991.

[Cornu, Ph. (2006), Les évolutions de la notion de bar do: ses origines indiennes et son développement au Tibet, Ph.D. thesis Paris 2006.]

Dargyay (Neumaier), E.K. (1977) trsl., Das tibetische Buch der Toten, Bern/München/Wien 1978 (1977).

Dudjom Rinpoche (1991), *The Nyingma School of Tibetan Buddhism, Its Fundamentals and History, two volumes, Volume One: The Translations, Volume Two: Reference Material,* translated and edited by Gyurme Dorje with the collaboration of Matthew Kapstein, Boston, Massachusetts 1991.

Ehrhard, F.K. (1997), "Recently Discovered Manuscripts of the *rNying ma rgyud 'bum* from Nepal", in *Tibetan Studies, Proceedings of the 7<sup>th</sup> Seminar of the International Association for Tibetan Studies, Graz 1995*, edited by E. Steinkellner, Vol.I, pp. 253–67, Wien 1997.

Evans-Wentz, W.Y. (1927) ed. of trsl., *The Tibetan Book of the Dead, The After-Death Experiences on the Bardo Plane*, according to Lāma Kazi Dawa-Samdup's English Rendering, London/Oxford/New York 1960 (1927).

Fremantle, F. and Chögyam Trungpa (1975) trsl., The Tibetan Book of the Dead, The Great Liberation Through Hearing in the Bardo, Berkeley/ London 1975.

Germano, D. (1994), "Architecture and Absence in the Secret Tantric History of the Great Perfection (rdzogs chen)", in *Journal of the International Association of Buddhist Studies*, Vol.17, 2 (1994), pp. 203–335;

- (1997), "Dying, Death, and Other Opportunities", in *Religions of Tibet in Practice*, edited by D.S. Lopez, Jr., pp. 458–93, New Jersey 1997;
- [- (2006), The Funerary Transformation of the Great Perfection (Rdzogs chen), in *Journal of the International Association of Tibetan Studies*, pp. 1–54, issue 1, October 2005.]

Gyaltsen, Shardza Tashi (1993), *Heart Drops of Dharmakaya*, *Dzogchen Practice of the Bön Tradition*, translation and commentary by Lopon Tenzin Namdak, edited by R. Dixey, Ithaca 1993.

Kalsang Lhundup (1969) ed., The Tibetan Book of the Dead by the Great Acharya Shri Sing-ha, Varanasi 1969.

Karmay, Samten G. (1972) ed. & trsl., *The Treasury of Good Sayings: A Tibetan History of Bon*, published by the School of Oriental and African Studies of the University of London, in the London Oriental Series, Vol.26, London;

- (1977), A Catalogue of Bonpo Publications, The Toyo Bunko, Tokyo 1977;

- (1998), The luminous Little Boy, Bangkok 1998;

- (1998<sup>a</sup>), The Arrow and the Spindle, Studies in History, Myths, Rituals and Beliefs in Tibet, Kathmandu 1998.

Kunsang, Pema (1989) trsl., *The Mirror of Mindfulness, The Cycle of the Four Bardos*, by Tsele Natsok Rangdröl, translated by Pema Kunsang, v. Rangdröl, Natsog Tsele (1989);

- (1991) trsl., v. *Chökyi Nyima Rinpoche, The Bardo Guidebook,* translated by E. Pema Kunsang, Hong Kong / Kathmandu 1991.

Kværne, P. (1971), "A Chronological Table of the Bon po the bsTan rtsis of Ni ma bstan 'jin", in *Acta Orientalia*, Vol. XXXIII, pp. 203–82, Havniæ 1971.

Lati Rinbochay and Hopkins, J. (1979) trsl., *Death, Intermediate State and Rebirth in Tibetan Buddhism*, Ithaca 1985 (London 1979).

(Lama) Lodö (1982), Bardo Teachings, The Way of Death and Rebirth, Ithaca 1987 (San Fransisco 1982).

Martin, D. (1997), Tibetans Histories, A Bibliography of Tibetan-Language Historical Works, London 1997.

Mullin, G.H. (1986) trsl., *Death and Dying, The Tibetan Tradition*, London/New York 1987 (1986).

Namdak, Lopon Tenzin (1993) ed. & trsl., *Heart Drops of Dharmakaya*, *Dzogchen Practice of the Bön Tradition*, translation and commentary by Lopon Tenzin Namdak, edited by R. Dixey, v. Gyaltsen, Shardza Tashi (1993).

Orofino, G. (1985) ed. & trsl., Sacred Tibetan Teachings on Death and Liberation, translated from the Italian (Roma 1985), Bridport, 1990.

Prats, R.N. (1996) trsl., El Libro de los Muertos Tibetano, La liberación por audición durante el estado intermedio, Madrid 1996;

- (1997), "Towards a Comprehensive Classification of rNying-ma Literature", in *Tibetan Studies, Proceedings of the 7<sup>th</sup> Seminar of the International Association for Tibetan Studies*, Graz 1995, edited by E. Steinkellner, Vol.II, pp. 789–801, Wien 1997.

Rangdröl, Tsele Natsok (1989), *The Mirror of Mindfulness, The Cycle of the Four Bardos*, translated by Pema Kunsang, Boston/ Shaftesbury 1989.

Sogyal Rinpoche (1992), The Tibetan Book of Living and Dying, San Francisco 1992.

Sørensen, P. K. (1994), "Tibetan Buddhist Historiography", in *Asiatische Forschungen*, Monographienreihe zur Geschichte, Kultur und Sprache der Völker Ost- und Zentralasiens, Band 128 edited by W. Heissig et al., Wiesbaden 1994.

Thurman, R.A.F. (1994) trsl. and discussion, The Tibetan Book of the Dead, Liberation through Understanding in the Between, New York 1994.

Trungpa, Chögyam (1975), The Tibetan Book of the Dead, The Great Liberation through Hearing in the Bardo, v. Fremantle (1975).

Vallée Poussin, L. de la (1923ff.) trsl., *l'Abhidharmakośa de Vasubandhu*, Société Belge d'Études Orientales, six volumes, Paris 1923–31 ('31, '23, '26, '24, '25, '25a, *AbhKBh* I&II correspond to Vallée Poussin Vol.II (1923), *AbhKBh* III in Vallée Poussin III (1926), *AbhKBh* IV in Vallée Poussin IV (1924), *AbhKBh* V&VI in Vallée Poussin V (1925), *AbhKBh* VII-IX in Vallée Poussin VI (1925<sup>a</sup>)).

Varela, F.J. (1997), Sleeping, Dreaming, and Dying, An Exploration of Consciousness with the Dalai Lama, Boston 1997.

Wallace, B.A. (1998) trsl., *Natural Liberation, Padmasambhava's Teachings on the Six Bardos*, commentary by Gyatrul Rinpoche, Boston 1998.

APPENDIX, CONSPECTUS OF 5AR DO LISTINGS IN TEXTS DISCUSSED OR REFERRED TO IN THIS ARTICLE.

Wangyal, Tenzin (1993), *Wonders of the Natural Mind*, edited by A. Lukianowicz, Barrytown 1993.

**
•

adultity traditions text	A OWING BUILD	Ī	ווב מר חבותוו	apsorphorioge.	nicain.	OCEU	reality as it is becoming	DECOLUTION	חונם	C. A.
Abhidharmakosabhāsya	7		purvakala			marana		antarā	upapatti	4.5
BKA'ROYUD AND EARLY 'BKA'RGYUD'										
La va pa (8 <sup>th</sup> /9 <sup>th</sup> c. AD?)	23	11				rang bzhin		srid ba	(mngal sgo)	8/97
Ti lo pa (988-1059)	50					('bag gsal)		(sgyn lus)	(mingal sgo)	10-11
Nã ro pe (1016-1100)	en		skye shi		milan			said pa		11
Khyung po mal 'byor (probably 11th-12th AD)	23		skye shi		rmilam			srid pa	200	11-12
Mi la ras pa (1040/53-11/23/35), Bar do ngo sprod	6 (several?) iso		skye shi	(/several?)	rmilan	chi ka ma		srid pa	mngal	11-12
mGur bum (faithful to Mila ras pa?)	6 rang bzhin <sup>131</sup>		skye shi		rmilan	bhi ba		srid pa	skye gnas	11-12
«Gam po pa (1079-1153)	33	1	-			dang po		gayic pa	gaum po	11-12
Phag mo gru pa (1110-70)	55					rang bzhm		said pa	(magal 590)	12
Zhang g-yu bing pa (1123-93)	3		skye shi		rmilam			said pa		12
Yang dgon pa (1213–58)	6 rang bzhin	11	skye shi	ring dzin	rmsi lam	'chi kha		srid pa		13
BON (ZHANG ZHUNG)SNYAN RGYUD										
sGron ma drug gi gdams pa	3	91			12	('bhidus)	bonnyid	srid pa		87 117
Bar do dus kyi sgron ma	9		rang bzhin	ring 'dzin	milan	skye shi	bonnyid	srid pa		12
Bar do 'od Inga ngos bzung ba'i man ngag	6 gnas gzhi		skye shi	ring 'dzin' <sup>200</sup>	rmi lam <sup>IS</sup>	'chi kha	(bon nyid)	srid pa		13
RIVINGMA			A							
Nyi da kha shyor I'yang gsang I	4		rang bzhin			chi kho	ohos nyid	srid pa		87 112
Rang byung ohen po'i rgyad l'yang gsang'l	4		rang bzhin		rmilan		chos nyid	srid pa		82 10-137
sPros bral don gsal chen po 's rgyad ['yang n']	4	9	rang bahin	ring 'dzin	i i		chos nyid	srid pa		87.13
Thig le kun gsal chen po'i rgyud l'ssang'l	4	9	rang bzhin	ring dzin			chos nyid	said pa		87 13
sGron ma bar ba's rgyad frang gang 7	4		rang bzhm	ring 'dzin	-	skye shi		srid pa		82117
Bar do gsang ba'i rgyad ['phy'or 'nang shor'l]	Ś		rang bzhin	ring 'dzin	rmilam	skye shi		srid pa		829/1077
Bar do inga'i ngo sprod ['Hong sde']	8		rang bzhin	ring 'dzin	rmilan	skye shi		stid pa		8714/15
Bar do mun gsal sgron me [taunic'1]	6 rang bzhin	9.1	skye shi	shes snga phyi?	rmsi lam.	'chi kha		strid pa		mid 12??
Rin po che 'phags lam bkod pa'i rgyud l'Hong de'l	9		rang bzhin	ring dzin.	rmilan	skye shi	chos nyid	srid pa		22
Karina gling pa (14th) ['tarenic'], 'rdages chen']	9	1	rang bahin <sup>132</sup>	ring dzin²nd	rmi lam <sup>151</sup>	bhi kha	chos nyid	sug pa		143
Klong chen pa (1306/8-1363) [yang gsang /]	4		skye gnas			'chi kha	chos nyid	srid pa		14
Thig is nyag goig ye nas ['yang gsang 7]	4	19	skye gras			chi kha	chos myid	srid pa		14/15

De Question marks indicate conjectural or madritional (additional additis) dates, it is of course lightly doubtibl that any of these texts in the present from predate the 11th o. A.D. The order within each ecotion, for reasons of uncertainty of dates, is not arriefly chronological, but regions tested dates and characteristics of bur do 'systems'.

Servita bornãos., literita sópa studias po sago phyri bando o the chos nyá kylávando, might telong tere, or under the headin 28 ez tê banan tilo az god man thar repas par phye ba mgár ban, Kem 126 556 3, f. 1,654, l. I. For more information, see Blez 87 ND, senson kaha, dos mores para para para person person

# On the history and identification of two of the Thirteen Later Translations of the Dzogchen Mind Series

### Karen Liljenberg (SOAS)

he Eighteen Major Scriptural Transmissions of the Mind Series, in Tibetan Sems sde lung chen po bco brgyad, constitute probably the earliest extant group of texts from the Tibetan Great Perfection (rDzogs chen) tradition.

As such, they have been held in reverence from the earliest period of the emergence of the *rNying ma* school right up to the present day. Modern scholarship, however, has barely begun to devote the attention to them which their historical importance deserves.

As the subject of my doctoral studies I have chosen to examine the sub-group of the Eighteen Major Scriptural Transmissions known to the tradition as the *Thirteen Later Translations*, in Tibetan *Phyi 'gyur bcu gsum*. These texts are described as having been translated in the eighth century C.E. by Vimalamitra and others during the exile of Vairocana, who translated the *sNga 'gyur lnga* or *Five Early Translations*.<sup>1</sup>

The earliest lists of titles of the *Thirteen Later Translations* are found in the writings of the twelfth century treasure revealer Nyang Ral Nyi ma 'od zer. He gives two lists, one in his *Zangs gling ma* biography of Padmasambhava,<sup>2</sup> and the other in his religious history, the *Me tog snying po.*<sup>3</sup> There are significant differences between the two lists, however, and subsequent lists drawn up by various authors<sup>4</sup> also show marked variations, symptomatic of continuing fluidity in the composition of this group of texts.

This paper addresses the question of the history and identity of two of the texts whose titles are included in most of the extant lists, including that of the great fourteenth century rNying ma scholar and visionary, Klong chen rab byams, but whose locations have hitherto been undetermined, namely, the sGom pa don grub and the Yid bzhin nor bu.

Found in Jamgon Kongtrul's *Rin chen gter mdzod*, Vol. 1, Paro, 1976, p. 78.4-p. 80.2. The *Zangs gling ma* is available in an English translation by E.P. Kunsang, entitled *The Lotus Born*.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Karmay, 1988, p. 24.

Chos 'byung me tog snying po sbrang rtsi'i bcud, pp. 320-321.

Apart from Nyang Ral, lists of the texts are found in the following sources: Klong chen rab 'byams: Chos dbyings rin po che'i mdzod kyi 'grel pa lung gi gter mdzod, fol. 334/p. 749; Grub mtha' mdzod, fol. 284/p. 1169. rGyal sras thugs mchog rtsal: Chos 'byung rin po che'i gter mdzod bstan pa'i gsal bar byed pa'i nyi 'od, also known as Klong chen chos byung, Vol. 2, p. 51.2. dPa' bo gtsug lag: Chos 'byung mKhas pa'i dga' ston, ed. Lokesh Chandra, 1959, Vol. 1, p. 221. Bairo'i 'dra 'bag chen mo in the Bairo'i rgyud 'bum, Leh 1971, Vol. 8, pp. 405-605; the list begins on p. 519.4; English translation entitled The Great Image by Ani Jinba Palmo, where the list is on pp. 117, 118. Sog zlog pa blo gros rgyal mtshan: bDag po rin po che'i chos 'byung la zhal snga nas blo bzang pas dgag pa mdzad pa; in Collected works of Sog zlog pa Vol. 2, fol. 256.4. Sems sde bco brgyad kyi dgongs pa rig 'dzin rnam kyis rdo rje'i glur bzhengs pa, in rNying ma bka' ma rgyas pa, Vol. Tsa, p. 298ff, translated by E.P. Kunsang in Wellsprings of the Great Perfection, pp. 53-74. This list of sources is not exhaustive, merely representing those I have consulted for this paper.

### 1. The bsGom pa don grub

The *sGom pa don grub* is listed by Nyang Ral in his *Zangs gling ma* as one of the *Thirteen Later Translations*, where it is described as "teaching the method of meditation". However, in his second list, it has vanished, leaving an incomplete complement of only seventeen titles to make up the *Eighteen Major Scriptural Transmissions*. This suggests that the status or identity of this text was to some extent problematic by the twelfth century.

It is clear from a comparison of the various extant title lists that some contain a (b)sGom pa don grub while others, sometimes in the same place in the list, have a bsGom pa don drug. For example, Klong chen rab 'byams has a bsGom pa don grub as his text number eighteen,<sup>7</sup> while rGyal sras thugs mchog rtsal<sup>8</sup> has a sGom pa don drug ma placed very unusually as the fifth of the sNga 'gyur lnga. The mKhas pa'i dga' ston<sup>9</sup> and Bairo'i 'dra 'bag chen mo<sup>10</sup> omit the title from their lists altogether. Even so, the Bairo dra 'bag chen mo does mention a Byang sems don drug in a list of texts said to have been translated by Vairocana.<sup>11</sup> In the same position in a virtually identical list in the Padma bKa' thang biography of Padmasambhava by Orgyen Lingpa<sup>12</sup> is a Byang sems don grub.

Any remaining doubt that we are dealing with a single text with two alternative titles is fortunately dispelled by the Rig 'dzin tshe dbang Nor bu edition of the Collected Tantras of the Ancients (*rNying ma'i rgyud 'bum*). In its volume Ka, text twenty has as its cover title *Sems bsgom don drug pa*, but its title at the beginning of the actual text reads *Byang chub kyi sems sgom pa don grub pa*.<sup>13</sup> At the end of this short text, the colophon gives the form once again as *don drug pa*. I set out below my translation and transliteration of this text from the volume now held in the Bodleian library, Oxford. It nicely matches Nyang Ral's description as "teaching the method of meditation". To my current know-ledge, it appears to be the only extant "free-standing" version of the *sgom pa don grub/don drug*.<sup>14</sup>

(Folio 185a, 1.4) In the language of India: bo dhi tsi ta sa ma ti a mo gha tsa na ma. In Tibetan: Accomplishing the aim of meditation on the Mind of Enlightenment. Homage to glorious Samantabhadra, the great bliss! The sea of compas-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> sGom pa'i thabs bstan pa'i phyir; Zangs gling ma, vol. 1, fol. 40 / p. 79 l. 1.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> That is, the *Me tog snying po* list. Although the question of which of these two works is earlier is not yet settled by modern scholarship, Dan Martin dates the latter text to the late 1100's; see Martin D., *Tibetan Histories*, p. 30.

Chos dbyings rin po che'i mdzod kyi 'grel pa lung gi gter mdzod, fol. 334/ p. 749.5; Norbu & Clemente, 1999, p. 244.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> *Klong chen chos byung*, Vol. 2, p. 51.4; Norbu & Clemente, 1999, p. 247.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Chos 'byung mKhas pa'i dga' ston, Vol. 1, p. 221.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> Bairo'i rgyud 'bum, Vol. 8, p. 519.4 ff.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> Norbu & Clemente, 1999, p. 248.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> Op. cit., p. 249.

Rig 'dzin Tshe dbang Norbu, Vol. Ka, fol. 185a. 3.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> See below regarding its incorporation, under the chapter title *Zab mo don drug gi le'u*, into the *Khor ba rtsad nas gcod pa nyi zla dang mnyam pa dri ma med pa'i rgyud*.

sionate energy pervades all sentient beings, but the gods and nāgas, although they attend to the authentic teachings, will never venerate the Three Jewels. Once great beings have seen this realization for themselves, the realization of the true nature of things accomplished through great bliss, the mind of fortunate ones will understand it.

Phenomena and mind are, from the beginning, without duality. Since, despite searching for it, one does not find the mind's nature, there is nothing to show to another, saying "it's like this". Because mind and phenomena are not anything at all, when one meditates, one will not meditate on anything. Whatever characteristics of conceptual thought may arise, if one knows that very thought to be the true nature of things, there is no need to meditate on the realm of reality as anywhere else. In that, there is nothing to correct through antidotes or to suppress. In this way, non-distraction from this real state, through the three times and in all situations, is the Dharmakāya.

When this becomes powerful, the world has no self-nature. Compassionate energy's manifestation pervades everything, and pours a great rain of love upon sentient beings. When meditation and that which is experienced in meditation are without duality, blissfully being present in the state of the absolute is also what is called "meditation on the mind of enlightenment". Meditation on the immaculate mind of enlightenment signifies non-distraction [by] the great current of conceptual thought.

This concludes Six points on Meditation on the Mind of Enlightenment. 15

The ambiguity over the title would seem to have its origin even earlier than Nyang Ral's twelfth-century lists. In fact, the ninth-to-tenth century bSam gtan mig sgron by Nub Sangs rgyas Ye shes quotes from a text entitled Don drug pa twice in its chapter seven. These citations exactly match the sGom pa don grub text found in the Rig 'dzin Tshe dbang Nor bu edition.

How did a text that was presumably originally entitled *sGom pa don grub* — *Accomplishing the aim of meditation,* or more succinctly, *Success in meditation*<sup>17</sup> —

Folio 185a, 1.4: rgya gar skad du/ bo dhi tsi ta sa ma ti a mo gha tsa na ma/ bod skad du/ byang chub kyi sems sgom pa don grub pa zhes bya ba/ dpal kun tu bzang po bde ba chen po la phyag 'tshal [lo]/ thug rje rgya mtsho (l. 5) sems can kun la khyab/ lha dang klu yang bden pa'i bka' nyan te/ dkon mchog gsum ni nam yang bskur mi bya/ chos nyid rtogs [pa?] bde ba chen por grub/ skyes bu chen po rang gis rig nas rtogs pa 'di/ skal (l. 6) ldan rnam kyi blo la go bar gyis/ chos dang sems ni ye nas gnyis su med/ sems kyi rang bzhin btsal yang ma rnyed na/ gzhan la 'di 'dra zhes ni bstan du med/ sems dang chos ni ci yang ma yin pas/ sgom (l. 7) pa'i tshe na ci yang mi bsgom mo/ rnam par rtog pa'i mtshan ma ci byung yang/ rtog pa de nyid chos nyid yin shes na/ chos kyi dbyings ni gzhan du bsgom mi dgos/ de la gnyen pos bcos shing dgag tu med/ 'di (Fol. 185 b) ltar dus gsum rnam pa thams cad du/ nyid las ma yengs pa ni chos kyi sku/ stobs su gyur na 'jig rten rang bzhin med/ thugs rje sprul pas kun la khyab mdzad cing/ sems can rnam la byam pa'i char chen (l. 2) 'bebs/ bsgom dang bsgom par bya ba gnyis med na/ don dam ngang la bde bar gnas pa ni/ byang chub sems sgom zhes kyang de la bya/ rtog pa'i rlung chen ma yengs don ston pa/ rnam dag byang chub sems (l. 3) kyi bsgom pa yin/ byang chub kyi sems bsgom pa don drug pa rdzogs so.

bSam gtan mig sgron 441.3-4: rnam par rtog pa'i mtshan ma ci byung yang/ rtog pa de nyid chos nyid yin zhe na/ chos kyi dbyings nyid zhan du bsgom mi dgos; 474.6: 'di ltar dus gsum rnam pa thams cad du/ nyid las ma yengs pa ni chos kyi sku/ stobs su gyur nas 'jig rten rang bzhin med/.

Bo dhi tsi ta sa ma ti a mo gha tsa, the version of the title supposedly transliterated from Sanskrit, seems closer to the don drug Tibetan title, since tsa is likely to represent Sanskrit adjectival

come to be known as sGom pa don drug, The six points of meditation?<sup>18</sup> The answer may not be as simple as someone deciding that the text contained six points, and renaming it accordingly. In fact, there does not seem to be any clearlydiscernible structure of six points in the text. 19

In the various editions of the rNying ma'i rgyud 'bum there is a group of texts whose title contains the phrase "cutting Saṃsāra from the root", khor ba rtsad nas gcod pa in Tibetan. One of the group, Tb.40 in the mTshams brag edition, 20 entitled 'Khor ba rtsad nas gcod pa nyi zla dang mnyam pa dri ma med pa'i rgyud, consists of five *rDzogs chen* texts spread out over its chapters two to eleven. The titles given to these are as follows: rDo rje tshig drug (Chapter two, folios 696.7-697.2); Zab mo don drug (Chapter three, folios 697.2-698.1); rTsol bral rtsal drug (Chapter four, folios 698.1-699.1); Yangs pa che ba drug (Chapter five, folios 699.1-700.7); and chapters six to eleven, five of whose titles include the word thig le. The first chapter consists of an introduction in which Sattvavajra (Sems dpa' rdo rje), requests Samantabhadra (Kun tu bzang po) to explain various points by means of what he calls on fol. 696.5 drug tshan lnga yi bshad pa, that is, "the explanation of five sets of six".21

The drug tshan lnga are in fact the Rig pa'i khu byug, the bsGom pa don drug/grub, the rTsal chen sprugs pa, roughly the last two-thirds of the Khyung chen lding ba,22 and finally, what appears from its short title and its contents to be a version of the *thig le drug pa*.<sup>23</sup> These texts have been grouped together according

number sat, six. Don grub, on the other hand, would be Amoghasiddhi or Siddhartha, (both also Buddha names), in Sanskrit. However, the Sanskrit can not simply be accepted without reservation as being the text's original title. Moreover, the absence of sandhi between the words samādhi and amogha (which would give samādhyamogha), as well as the divergence between the apparent meaning of the Sanskrit title and that of the Tibetan, in immediate juxtaposition here, strongly suggests that the text passed at some stage through the hands of one or more redactors or copyists unfamiliar with Sanskrit.

The two titles are not as far apart as the two English translations would suggest, as don is a multivalent term that can mean aim, purpose, meaning, aspect or point. The only real point of difference is between grub (achieve) and drug (six), two words which are pronounced similarly

However, a tentative division into six points might be as follows: 1) chos dang sems ni ye nas gnyis su med 2) sems kyi rang bzhin btsal yang ma rnyed na/ gzhan la 'di 'dra zhes ni bstan du med/ 3) sems dang chos ni ci yang ma yin pas/ sgom (l. 7) pa'i tshe na ci yang mi bsgom mo/ 4) rnam par rtog pa'i mtshan ma ci byung yang/ rtog pa de nyid chos nyid yin shes na/ chos kyi dbyings ni gzhan du bsgom mi dgos/ 5) de la gnyen pos bcos shing dgag tu med/ 6) di (Fol. 185 b) ltar dus gsum rnam pa thams cad du/ nyid las ma yengs pa ni chos kyi sku/ (the last point perhaps also including the subsequent lines concerning the fruition of the practice).

This text is also found in sDe dge vol. Cha (Dg. 121); Taiwan edition Tb1. 4499; Kaneko catalogue Tk. 1.6; Bairo'i rgyud 'bum vol. Kha (Bg. 25).

Line 3 of the same folio gives their condensed titles as: tshig drug don drug rtsal drug stel che ba drug dang thig le drug/'gro drug 'khor ba'i dra ba gcad/.

Tb40/Tk. 18's chapter five opens with four lines that are not part of the khyung chen lding ba:[de nas bcom ldan bka' stsal pa] mi gnas dmigs med chos kyi sku/ spros med byang chub snying po'i don/bde chen sprul pa gnyis su med/ gzhan nas mi btsal rang las byung/. Chapter five then follows the khyung chen lding ba, from that text's zin dang chags dang bral dang zhi up to its end.

The Thig le drug pa is another of the text titles included in lists of the Thirteen Later Translations whose identity is somewhat problematic. None of the quotations from it in the bSam gtan mig

sgron are found in these chapters of Tb. 40.

to an overarching numerical principle of "sets of six", which certainly is relevant to the *Rig pa'i khu byug*, consisting as it does of six lines, and sometimes referred to by its alternative title of *Six vajra lines* (*rDo rje tshig drug*) to this day.<sup>24</sup> It also seems apposite to include the *Thig le drug pa* in such a group. However, its relevance to the other texts, and to the *sGom pa don grub* in particular, appears less obvious.

Regarding its dating and authorship, Tb. 40 has echoes of the *Kun byed rgyal po* in some of its language. <sup>25</sup> Unlike the *Kun byed rgyal po*, however, it incorporates not just texts from the *sNga 'gyur lnga*, but also two of the *Thirteen Later Translations*. Tb. 40 is likely to postdate the composition of the *Kun byed rgyal po*, but this is of limited usefulness for dating, as the *Kun byed rgyal po* itself, although considered as "the fundamental tantra of the rDzogs chen Mind Series", <sup>26</sup> has not been firmly dated.

Both Tb. 40 and the closely-related text that follows it, Tb. 41,<sup>27</sup> are said in their colophons to have been translated into Tibetan by the eighth century Indian paṇḍit Śrī Siṃha and the Tibetan translator Vairocana. Tb. 41 adds a rather odd redactor's colophon, however, which appears to say that "the Novice monk of gNyi ba, Nyi ma rdo rje, made the *Five Earlier Translations* and the *Thirteen Later Translations* as [?] Tantras". <sup>28</sup> Now, while Tb. 40 incorporates actual texts of the Five Earlier Translations, the texts included in Tb. 41 although bearing the titles of the Thirteen Later Translations, appear (with the possible exception of chapter ten, the *Yid bzhin nor bu'i le'u*, which I discuss in more detail below) to be paraphrases or elaborations of the original texts.

According to the *Blue Annals*, written in the fifteenth century, there was a disciple of Zhig pa of dBus (who died in 1195) called sNye<sup>29</sup> ston Nyi ma rdo rje.<sup>30</sup> If he is the redactor in question, this would indicate a compilation date in the late twelfth or first half of the thirteenth century for Tb. 41 as well as, most probably, for Tb. 40, since Tb. 41's colophon appears to refer to both texts.

However, if we attribute the invention of the *drug mtshan lnga* scheme to Nyi ma rDo rje, how to account for the fact, as I mention above, that the much earlier *bSam gtan mig sgron* already cites from the *Don drug* rather than *Don grub*? It seems that the six-fold scheme itself must either predate or be roughly contemporary with the *bSam gtan mig sgron*. Tb. 40 surely cannot, however - while its core texts might be attributable to an eighth or early ninth century date, the framework which introduces and elaborates on them is certainly later. Tb.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> See Norbu, N., 2000, pp. 15, 16.

The most obvious example is its frequent exhortation "listen, great being!"(eg.Tb. 40, p. 696.1-2) with which the *Kun byed rgyal po* introduces most of its teachings.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> Norbu & Clemente, 1999, p. 64.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> *mTshams brag* Tb. 41, p. 709.6-727.2; Taiwan edition Tb1. 4500; *sDe dge* edition Dg. 123; Kaneko catalogue, Tk. 1.7; also *Bairo'i rgyud 'bum*, Vol. 2 (Kha) Bg. 2.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> mTshams brag Tb. 41, 727.2 : snga 'gyur lnga dang phyi 'gyur bcu gsum gyi rgyud la gnyi ba'i ban chung nyi ma rdo rje byas pa.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> F.W. Thomas tentatively equates gNyi ba with the tribal division sNyi ba; Thomas F.W., 1950-63, (Index of Tibetan proper names, p. 52).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>30</sup> Roerich, 1988, p. 85.

41, with its paraphrase versions of the *Thirteen Later Translations*, is even more obviously later.

To sum up, it is my contention that the title of the *sGom pa don grub* was changed, perhaps as early as the ninth century, in order to fit it into the text group arranged according to the numerical scheme of sixes that we see in Tb. 40. This led to some uncertainty about the correct title and identity of the text, its omission from such early collections as the *Bairo'i rgyud 'bum*, and its eventual disappearance from view.

#### 2. The Yid bzhin nor bu

This title, *The Wish-fulfilling Jewel*, is included in all of the lists of the *Thirteen Later Translations* that I have examined, yet even so a search for any extant text so-titled proves fruitless. It is described by Nyang Ral as teaching that "all desirable qualities arise from the nature of the mind", and by dPa' bo gtsug lag in his *mKhas pa'i dga' ston* as "condensing all philosophical tenets". It is classified in the *mKhas pa'i dga' ston* and *Bairo'i rgyud 'bum* as one of the four "minor" texts, which may or may not be an indication of its length.

If we turn to the indexes to the various *rNying ma'i rgyud bum* editions, we find, situated in the midst of the *Thirteen Later Translations*, several recurring titles that nevertheless do not appear in any of the lists. One of these unlisted texts, the *Khams gsum sgron ma*, is found among the *Thirteen Later Translations* in the *mTshams brag*, *gTing skyes*, and Rig 'dzin tshe bdang nor bu editions.<sup>33</sup>

This short text, *The Lamp of the Three Realms* (Tb. 36), contains just after its opening homage to Samantabhadra the phrase "the precious *wish-fulfilling jewel* [my italics] that transcends the three realms", a possible alternative title<sup>34</sup> that would exactly match that of our missing text.

In the *Rin chen dru bo*, his commentary on the *Kun byed rgyal po*, Klong chen rab 'byams mentions a text by Vairocana named *The Jewel Lamp*, on which he says he has based his explanation.<sup>35</sup> This *Jewel Lamp* has remained unidentified up to now<sup>36</sup>, but its title perhaps represents an amalgam of the *Khams gsum sgron ma* and the *Yid bzhin nor bu*, in which case it could tentatively be identified with Tb. 36.<sup>37</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>31</sup> Sems nyid las 'dod pa'i yon tan thams cad 'byung bar bstan pa'i phyir (Zangs gling ma, p. 79.3).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>32</sup> Grub mtha' thams cad 'dus pa yid bzhin nor bu (mKhas pa'i dga' ston, vol. 1, p. 222).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>33</sup> Perhaps not coincidentally, these are the editions that group the *Eighteen Major Scriptures* together most tightly. The *Khams gsum sgron ma* is found in *mTsham brag* Tb. 36; *gTing skyes* Tk. 32; Rig 'dzin Tshe dbang nor bu Vol. Ka 33.

Khams gsum las 'das yid bzhin nor bu rin po che / Tb. 36, p. 636.2.

Lo tsa ba chen po be ro tsa na'i sems lung rin chen sgron me'i lung bzhin bkod pa (Rin chen dru bo, p. 426.3-4). See Lipman and Peterson, 2000, p. 55.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>36</sup> See Clemente and Norbu, 1999, p. 66, and p. 274, n. 141.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>37</sup> On the other hand, it is not immediately obvious how the *Khams gsum sgron ma* could actually have served as a basis for the exposition of the *Kun byed rgyal po* that we see in Klong chen rab byam's *Rin chen dru bo*.

At any rate, the case for identification of Tb. 36, *The Lamp of the Three Realms*, with the *Yid bzhin nor bu* is strongly supported by the *bSam gtan mig sgron*, which provides us with at least one quotation from the *Yid bzhin nor bu*. This reads: "Rang byung ye nas ma bcos 'od gsal ba| rtsol bas rtsol du med de snying po'i don". <sup>38</sup> The same lines, with minor variations, are found in *The Lamp of the Three Realms*. <sup>39</sup> While this is not a conclusive proof that the two texts are one and the same, it must add considerable weight to the argument.

Another text, Tb. 41, one of the set of four whose titles contain the phrase 'khor ba rtsad nas gcod pa, has chapter titles consisting of the titles of the Thirteen Later Translations. As mentioned above, the actual contents of these chapters, generally speaking, do not match the extant texts after which they are named. They seem instead to be rough paraphrases. However, chapter ten, significantly entitled Yid bzhin nor bu'i le'u rather closely follows the Khams gsum sgron ma, line for line, up to drang srong chen po nyid kyi spyod yul yin. The main difference between the two texts is that Tb. 41 uses a seven-syllable verse form rather than the nine-syllable form used by the Khams gsum sgron ma. It also, interestingly, substitutes rtag pa for the term g.yung drung found in the Khams gsum sgron ma.

The picture is complicated by the fact that Tb. 41's chapter fourteen happens to be entitled "*Khams gsum sgron ma'i le'u*." In fact, this chapter reads like a paraphrase of its preceding chapter ten. The intertextual relationships here are perplexing. The *Yid bzhin nor bu* citation from the *bSam gtan mig sgron* actually matches Tb. 41 slightly better than the version in Tb. 36, except for the fact that Tb. 36 and the *bSam gtan mig sgron* quotation both have nine syllables in their lines. Another problem lies in the apparent anomaly of including a single source-text in what otherwise would be a work made up instead of paraphrases of source-texts.

At any rate, the fact that this chapter is explicitly titled *Yid bzhin nor bu'i le'u* and is almost identical to the *Khams gsum sgron ma*, must add further support to the case for linking the *Khams gsum sgron ma* with the missing *Yid bzhin nor bu*, even if it eventually turns out that the *Khams gsum sgron ma* itself is merely a paraphrase or abridgement of the "original" *Yid bzhin nor bu*.

I set out below an English translation of the Tibetan text of the *Khams gsum sgron ma*:<sup>41</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>38</sup> bSam gtan mig sgron, p. 348.3.

See my transliteration of the text below.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>40</sup> See below for further discussion of this term.

bCom ldan 'das dpal kun (2) tu bzang po la phyag 'tshal lo| khams gsum las 'das yid bzhin nor bu rin po che| bgrod med rnam par grol ba'i lam ston pa| gzhan nas btsal bar rnyed (3) par mi 'gyur te| thig le chen po kun la khyab par gnas| rang byung ye shes ma bcos 'od gsal ba| bde chen btsal du med pas snying po'i don|snang mdzad (4) nyid ni rtag par kun tu bzang| gnyis med bde ba'i ngang ste lhun gyis grub| g.yung drung chen po'i Klong du shar ba yis| bde ba chen po'i long spyod rdzogs pa yang| (5) rtog dpyod mtshan ma kun las 'das pa'i phyir| drang srong chen po nyid kyi spyod yul yin| thams cad sku gsung thugs kyi dkyil 'khor la| shes te rtog pa'i Klong du (6) mnyam gzhag nas| grub pa'i khyad par mngon du shar ba'i tshe| khams gsum kun kyang bdag gi zhabs la 'dud| byang chub kyi sems khams gsum sgron ma rdzogs (7) so. Transliterated from Tb. 36 (mTshams brag, Vol 1, p. 636).

Homage to glorious Samantabhadra, the transcendent victor! The precious wishfulfilling jewel that transcends the three realms, that shows the path of complete liberation (that does not need to be followed), will not be found if sought from others, since the great sphere dwells in and pervades everything. Self-originated wisdom, the natural clear light, great bliss, that is not to be sought-after, is the essential meaning. That which brings about phenomena is always, Everywhere Good (Samantabhadra). The non-dual state of bliss is spontaneously accomplished. Arising in the expanse of great changelessness, the enjoyment of great bliss is also perfect. Since it transcends all conceptual analysis, it is the experiential domain of great sages. In the all-inclusive mandala of enlightened body, speech and mind, once one rests in equipoise in the expanse of knowledge and realization<sup>42</sup>, when the particular aspects of accomplishment become manifest, all of the Three Realms bow down at one's feet. The mind of enlightenment, the Lamp of the Three Realms, is concluded.

Clearly this matches the classification of the *Yid bzhin nor bu* as a short (minor?) text, at less than a folio side in length. It also fits the description given by Nyang Ral quite well, although dPa' bo gtsug lag's description could only loosely apply.

In its homage to Samantabhadra, its conciseness, and its lack of terminology characterizing *rDzogs chen* traditions other than *sems sde*, the *Khams gsum sgron ma* can be said to meet some provisional criteria for identification as one of the *Thirteen Later Translations*. Its inclusion of the term *g.yung drung*, however, is unusual. Sam van Schaik has observed that this term from pre-Buddhist Tibet, with the rough meaning of "eternal", was "almost written out of Buddhist translations" after its meaning was fixed as equivalent to the Sanskrit *sanātana*, a rare word in Buddhist texts compared to the Sanskrit *nityā*, translated by a different Tibetan term (*rtag pa*).<sup>43</sup> The fact that *rtag pa* also occurs shortly before *g.yung drung* in this text could mean that the text is translating the two Sanskrit words differently, as one would expect after the standardization of vocabulary had occurred.

However, from the eleventh century *g.yung drung* became closely associated with the later Bon tradition. <sup>44</sup> Therefore the fact that the *Yid bzhin nor bu'i le'u* in Tb. 41 substitutes *rtag pa* for the term *g.yung drung* found in the free-standing version of the same text (i.e. the *Khams gsum sgron ma*) could be an indication of a later date for Tb. 41. This would accord with its probable redaction by Nyi ma rdo rje in the late twelfth or early thirteenth century, as argued above.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>42</sup> The text here actually reads *rtog pa'i klong*, "the expanse of concepts" or "expanse of thoughts", but *rtog pa* is frequently found as a misspelling of *rtogs pa*, "realization", which seems to make better sense

Van Schaik, entry on g.yung drung, <u>http:earlytibet.com</u>.

It may be significant that followers of the Bon rDzogs chen teachings have claimed that Vairocana himself was Bon po as well as Buddhist. See Karmay, 1988, p. 17.

#### Summary

By relying for corroboration on citations contained in the *bSam gtan mig sgron*, it has been possible to identify two of the *Thirteen Later Translations*, as listed by Klong chen pa and others, that have until now been unlocated. The *bsGom pa don grub* seems to be extant in free-standing form only in the Rig 'dzin tshe dbang nor bu edition of the *rNying ma'i rgyud 'bum*. I have postulated that the six-fold schema followed by Tb. 40, which incorporated this text under the title *Zab mo don drug*, contributed to this text's obscurity.

Further, I have found the *bSam gtan mig sgron* citation from the missing *Yid bzhin nor bu* in one of the three unlisted texts that are regularly located among the *Thirteen Later Translations* in the *rNying ma'i rgyud 'bum*, namely the *Khams gsum sgron ma*. This identification is confirmed by chapter ten of Tb. 41, entitled *Yid bzhin nor bu'i le'u*, which closely follows the text of the *Khams gsum sgron ma*.

### **Bibliography**

#### Tibetan sources

#### Editions of the rNying ma'i rgyud 'bum:

rNying ma rgyud 'bum, mTshams brag dgon pa edition, 1982, Thimphu, Bhutan.

Bai ro'i rgyud 'bum; (in eight volumes, Smanrtsis Shesrig Spendzod 18-23), 1971, Leh, Ladakh, S. W. Tashigangpa.

*rNying ma rgyud 'bum,* reproduced from manuscripts found at gTing skyes dgon pa in Tibet, Dilgo Khyentse, 1972, Thimphu, Bhutan.

sDe dge edition of the Collected Tantras of the Ancients, (bDe bar gshegs pa'i bstan pa thams cad kyi snying po rig pa 'dzin pa'i sde snod rdo rje theg pa snga 'gyur rgyud 'bum); sDe dge par khang, sDe dge, Sichuan, PRC, 1991.

Rig 'dzin tshe bdang nor bu manuscript edition of the *rNying ma'i rgyud 'bum*, Volume Ka, held at the Bodleian Library, Oxford, shelfmark MS. Tib.a.24(R).

#### Other Tibetan sources:

*Tibetan Tripitaka*, Peking edition reprinted under editorship of D. T. Suzuki; Tokyo-Kyoto, 1957.

Nyang Ral nyi ma'i 'od zer - sLob dpon pad ma 'byung gnas kyi skyes rab chos 'byung nor bu'i 'phreng ba| nam thar zangs gling ma, found in Jamgon Kongtrul's Rin chen gter mdzod, vol. 1, 1976, Paro, Ngodrup and Sherab Drimay.

Nyang Ral nyi ma'i 'od zer - *Chos 'byung me tog snying po sbrang rtsi'i bcud*, Gangs can rig mdzod, series no.5, Lhasa, Bod ljongs mi dmangs dpe skrun khang, 1988.

gNubs sangs rgyas ye shes - *rNal 'byor mig gi bsam gtan*. (also known as *bSam gtan mig sgron*) Publisher S.W Tashigangpa, Leh, Ladakh, 1974.

dPa' bo gtsug lag 'phreng ba - *Dam pa'i chos kyi 'khor la bsgyur ba rnams kyi byung ba gsal bar byed pa mKhas pa'i dga' ston,* Satapitaka series no. 9 [4], ed. Lokesh Chandra, New Delhi 1959-1965, in 4 vols.

Bairo'i 'dra bag chen mo in Bai ro'i rgyud 'bum, vol. Ja, pp. 405-605; 1971, Leh, Ladakh, S. W. Tashigangpa.

Klong chen rab 'byams pa dri med 'od zer - Chos dbyings rin po che'i mdzod kyi 'grel pa lung gi gter mdzod, in mDzod bdun, Sherab Gyaltsen and Khyentse Labrang, Gangtok, Sikkim, 1983.

Klong chen rab 'byams pa dri med 'od zer - *Grub mtha' mdzod*, in *mDzod bdun*, Sherab Gyaltsen and Khyentse Labrang, Gangtok, Sikkim, 1983.

rGyal sras thugs mchog rtsal - Chos 'byung rin po che'i gter mdzod bstan pa gsal bar byed pa'i nyi 'od (also known as Klong chen chos 'byung), Dodrup sangyey lama, Gangtok, Sikkim, 1976.

Sems sde bco brgyad kyi dgongs pa rig 'dzin rnam kyis rdo rje'i glur bzhengs pa, in rNying ma bka' ma rgyas pa, vol Tsa; bDud 'joms 'jigs bral ye shes rdo rje, Kalimpong, 1982-87.

Sog zlog pa blo gros rgyal mtshan - bDag po rin po che'i chos 'byung la zhal snga nas blo bzang pas dgag pa mdzad pa, in Collected writings of Sog bzlog pa blo gros rgyal mtshan, Sanje dorje, New Delhi, 1975.

### Non-Tibetan references

Achard J-L., 2003 "Rig 'dzin tshe dbang mchog grub et la constitution du rNying ma rgyud 'bum de sDe dge", in Revue d'Etudes Tibetaines, no. 3, pp. 43-89.

Cantwell, C., "Distinctive Features of the Rig 'dzin Tshe dbang nor bu (Waddell) Edition of the rNying ma'i rgyud 'bum". In D. Germano and H. Eimer, ed., 2002, The Many Canons of Tibetan Buddhism, Leiden, E.J. Brill, pp. 359-376 (revised for online publication at <a href="http://ngb.csac.anthropology.ac.uk/csac/NGB/Doc/DistinctiveFeaturesWeb.xml">http://ngb.csac.anthropology.ac.uk/csac/NGB/Doc/DistinctiveFeaturesWeb.xml</a>).

Karmay, S.G., 1988 The Great Perfection (rdzogs chen) A Philosophical and Meditative Teaching in Tibetan Buddhism, Leiden, E.J. Brill.

Kunsang E.P. (trans.), Schmidt M.B. (ed.), 1999 The Lotus-born; the life story of Padmasambhava, Shambhala, Boston.

Kunsang E.P (trans.), Tweed & Schmidt (ed.), 2006 Wellsprings of the Great Perfection, Rangjung Yeshe Publications, Hong Kong.

Lipman K & Peterson M., 2000 You are the eyes of the world, Snow Lion Publications, Ithaca, New York.

Martin, D., 1997 *Tibetan Histories; a bibliography of Tibetan-language historical works*, Serindia Publications, Chicago.

Norbu N. & Clemente A., 1999 The Supreme Source; the Kunjed Gyalpo, the fundamental Tantra of Dzogchen Semde, Snow Lion Publications, Ithaca, New York.

Palmo, Ani Jinba (trans.), 2004 The Great Image; the life story of Vairochana the translator, Shambhala, Boston.

Roerich G. (trans.), 1988 The Blue Annals, Motilal Banarsidass, Delhi.

Thomas F.W., 1935-1963 *Tibetan literary texts and documents concerning Chinese Turkestan.* [4 vols.] Royal Asiatic Society, London.

van der Kuijp, L.W J, 2007 "On the authorship and date of the ecclesiastical chronicle Chos 'byung rin po che'i gter mdzod bstan pa'i gsal bar byed pa'i nyi 'od", in Tibetstudien: Festschrift für Dieter Schuh zum 65. Geburtstag; Petra Maurer und Peter Schwieger, Apprimus Verlag, Aachen, pp. 127-148.

van Schaik, S., 2004 "The Early Days of the Great Perfection", in Journal of the International Association for Buddhist Studies (JIABS), 27/1, pp. 165-206.



# A Handlist of the Bonpo Kangyur and Tengyur

Kurt Keutzer, University of California, Berkeley Kevin O'Neill, Charlottesville, Virginia

hat follows is a handlist of one edition of the Bonpo Kangyur and Tengyur and two editions of the Bonpo Tengyur. This handlist was originally created as a handlist of the editions of the Kangyur and Tengyur housed at the Ligmincha retreat center in Serenity Ridge Virginia. Serenity Ridge houses what is apparently the third edition of the Bon Kangyur. This edition contains 178 numbered volumes and one unnumbered volume entitled brgyud rim. The volume numbers are prepended to each page number. The catalog of this edition is abstracted from Appendix B of A Catalogue of the Bon Kanjur Edited by Dan Martin, with a foreword by Per Kvaerne. Senri Ethnolgical Reports No.40. National Museum of Ethnology, 2003. We examined each volume in the collection housed at Serenity Ridge and found this collection matched Martin's catalog precisely. The 179 volume electronic edition of the Bon Kangyur distributed by the Bon Foundation (http://www.bonfoundation.org/) appears to match A Catalogue of the Bon Kanjur as well.

For the Bon Tengyur we present two handlists. Serenity Ridge houses a collection of the Bon Tengyur that contains 324 volumes. This collection is distinguished from other editions of the Tengyur by the number of volumes and the inclusion of Shardza Rinpoche's collected works. The volume numbers are written on paper *dpe gdong* that accompany each volume. Our handlist for this edition is based on an unpublished catalog provided to us by Jean-Luc Achard. Any variations from Achard's list are noted in the end notes. This catalog is futher collated with *A Catalogue of the New Collection of Bonpo Katen Texts*, edited by Samten Karmay and Yasuhiko Nagano, Senri Ethnolgical Reports No.25. National Museum of Ethnology, 2001. Karmay catalogs an edition of the Tengyur that was published Tenpai Nyima. Volumes 1-233 of this are identical with the edition housed at Serenity Ridge, but the two editions begin to differ after that. Numbers from Karmay's catalog are given in the right column. If the text is not found there then a 'n/a' is written in the right column.

If it is not obvious already it should be noted that the information in these handlists is a proper subset of the information in the aforementioned catalogs. Moreover, the information provided here is miniscule by comparison. Nevertheless, experience has shown these handlists are very handy for quickly checking for titles and hence they are offered here.

# Bonpo Kangyur

# মর্ণ্য

# mDo Section:

Vol.	Title	no. of pages
1.	र्स्चर.त.शह्र्य.मी.शर्ट्र.वर्ष्ट्र.वर्थराध्यथा.मी.कैं.व.योतीट.चेंट.जन.कैंश.तर.रेथो.तयु.कैंटो	223
2.	Srid pa mdzod kyi mdo 'khor 'das khams kyi rtsa ba g.yung drung las rnam par dag pa'i rgyud. মুন্মের মার্নি মুনামান্ত্রী নাৰুদ।	219
3.	Srid pa'i mdzod phugs kyi gzhung. 역실대표를 기계	676
4.	['Dul ba rgyud drug.] Contains seven titles. মার্থিনু হ'মু নে মুথান লহ'। সিন্	463
5.	mDo sde drung mu bskal bzang. KA (part 1).  — KHA (part 2).	441
6.	यर्रे.ह्यं.ह्यं.च्येश्वतःचबरः। र्यो	613
7.	mDo sde khod po bskal bzang. KA (part 1).  — KHA (part 2).	638
8.	मॅ होते नम्रायान वार तर्मे न यहेन मते सही जिने	505
9.	Go lde'i bskal bzang 'gro ba 'dren pa'i mdo. KA (part 1).  — KHA (part 2).	526
10.	ल. मुर् ह्या भवर उचैर यदु मर्ट स्यावियामा यभीला तदु योरमा हैमा ग्री मर्ट् ह्या यो भट्टी यो थे प्राप्ती यो	509
	ह्रेन त्यास्यकाचा र्जी	
11.	Ye srid thog mtha' 'byung ba'i bder gshegs bskal pa'i grangs rtsis kyi mdo khro gnyen gyi gtan la phabs pa. KA (part 1).  — KHA (part 2).	691

	) OJ	
12.	अर्ट् क्रे.चश्रयः त.च = ८.त्.धी८. योतुषः दशः शाययः अर्घटः योद्ययः त.सूत्रः नुः चक्किटः ता	581
	السار	
	mDo sde bskal pa bzang po gling gshen nam mkha' mthong gsal la snyan du brgyud pa. KA (part 1).	
13.	∫ ¬ — KHA (part 2).	583
14.	<u>ढ़ॸॣॹय़ॱॸऀढ़ॱॺऀॱक़ॆढ़ऀॱक़ॗॖॣॸॱॸॣऀॱॺॱॺऻॾॖॱॸॾॣऀॸॱॸॺॱॸॗॱढ़ॺॸॱॺढ़ऀॱऒॸॣॕॱऀॺॴ</u>	737
	र्बेद्र-य-वेद-म्बर्थ-व्यु-व्यक्ष-वच-यवे-अर्दे। र्रिग्	
	'Dus pa rin po che'i rgyud dri ma med pa gzi brjid rab tu 'bar ba'i mdo las, sTon pa 'od gsal lha las bab pa'i mdo. KA (part 1).	
15.	KHA (part 2).	667
16.	∫¶ — GA (part 3).	611
17.	∫5 NGA (part 4).	731
18.	∫(₹) — CA (part 5).	659
19.	CHA (part 6).	679
20.	∫ <b>E</b> JA (part 7).	652
21.	∫3 — NYA (part 8).	698
22.	∫5 — TA (part 9).	698
23.	「見」 — THA (part 10).	604
24.	∫5 — DA (part 11).	689
25.	∫ M — A (final part).	665
26.	तर्नुश्रामः मैत्रः में केते क्रुनः द्वे का कोन्या क्रुन्तवे कोन्याम् अस्य क्रुश्यः मुक्तः मेत्रः केत्रः वर्षेटः न	374
	'Dus pa rin po che'i rgyud dri ma med pa rtsa ba'i mdo sangs rgyas kyi rnam thar rin chen 'phreng ba.	

A Handlist of the Bon Kanjur and Tengyur

65

27.	र्रेश.योश्रीत्रा.शु.वेय.यक्षेत्र.तयु.चैता.शक्ष्य.ग्रीय.मै.यबर.त्.्येश.शायतःचैता.स्.वैयोशःकृष्ट्र्य.	117
	इ.जाव्याच्याचीयाचीक्या	
28.	Dus gsum mi nub bstan pa'i rgyal mtshan kun tu bzang po nam mkha' rgyal po thugs rje chen po 'khor ba kun grol gyi rgyud. Note: This is a gter ma of Bde-chen gling-pa.	507
	'Dus pa rin po che'i rgyud gzer dmig gi le'u ste bco brgyad pa. KA	
29.	(part 1).  KHA (part 2).	635
30.	अर्ने तर्नु अप्यामेन विक्ति क्रिक्ष क्षेत्र । इस्य अप्याप्य अर्मे विष्य । यस्य । यस्य । यस्य । यस्य । यस्य । य	234
	mDo 'dus pa rin po che'i rgyud thams cad mkhyen pa'i bka' tshad	
31.	ma. શ્રેન્' માત્રસ્યા ગાયુસ સેસચ રહ્યું ક્રો સહેવે સોને	253
32.	Srid pa khams gsum sems can skye mchi'i [~'chi'i] mdo. র্মুন দ্বীর বেনুদ্র নাজ্য বেছিনা ঘন্ত অর্ম্বা	227
33.	sNod rten 'byung ba chags 'jig pa'i mdo. ક્ષુ-એન્- મેન્-લન્ન- ત્રક્ષુત વનસ ત્રાપ્ય ન્ કુન્- ભારાની ક્ષેત્ર સહે સેન્	
	য়ৣয়৾ঀৢॱয়৾৻ঀয়ৼয়ৣৢঀ৽য়ঀয়৽য়ৣ৽য়ৼ৾৻য়ৼৣয়৽য়৾য়য়ঢ়৾ৼয়ৣ৾য়য়৾য়য়য়৽য়ৣ৽য়ৼ৾৻	537
	Bla med go 'phang bsgrub thabs g.yung drung lam gyi sgron ma'i mdo. Bla med go 'phang sgrub thabs kyi mdo mjug gi gtor zlog sogs kyi mdo.	
34.	रेब र्ये के वार्ते र वर्जे वार्य रेव केव र्ये।	373
	<u> बुशः अर्रे : पञ्च : सुर्शः पः सुर्शः । पञ्च : ग्री</u> : पग्गागः रोत्य।	
	Rin po che gtor bzlog mdo' chen mo. Zhus mdo padma spungs pa spar kha brgyad kyi bkag sel. [Several other titles.]	

Dus gsum nub pa med pa'i mtshan chen yongs su grags pa'i mdo las, Gleng gzhi dang bder gshegs dpag med sangs rgyas stong gi mtshan phyag. KA (part 1). Dus gsum nub pa med pa'i mdo las, 'Gro ba 'dul ba sangs rgyas stong gi mtshan. KHA (part 2).

য়ী:মহ্ছৰ:ম্বিয়া

GA: Dus gsum nub pa med pa'i mdo' las, Ting 'dzin rgyal po'i sangs rgyas stong gi mtshan. GA (part 3). Dus gsum nub pa med pa'i mdo las, mTha' yas rgyal po'i sangs rgyas stong gi mtshan phyag. NGA (part 4). Dus gsum nub pa med pa'i mtshan chen yongs su grags pa'i mdo las, bDer gshegs dri ma med pa sangs rgyas stong gi mtshan phyag. CA (part 5).

्रिक नुसाम्बद्धाः सुनः या सेन् स्पर्वः सर्वतः स्वेतः स्वेत ৼ*৾য়*ঀঀয়৸৻৴য়ৼ৻৴ৼ৻ড়য়৻৸৻ঽ৾৻য়৻ৼ৸ৼৠ৾ৼ৻য়ৢ৾৻য়৻ড়৾৻ৼ৻ - रुषःमार्युष्ठः सुवःयः भ्रोरः यद्ये : सर्वः सेवः सेवः संव्यः स्वारं स्वयः स्वरं स्वयः स्वरं स्वयः स्वरं स्वयः 661 र.य.ियायायश्चेतायायाचारार्यायायाः **क्रियायाया**यायाया िष्ठे रुषःमासुस्रासुमायासेरायदे सदे स्था महिमामाविमायादे र बेमार्स्स्या क्रुशःश्रेदःयोः सर्ददः धुय

Dus gsum nub pa med pa'i mtshan chen yongs su grags pa'i mdo las, bDer gshegs dbang dang ldan pa'i sangs rgyas stong gi mtshan phyag. CHA (part 6). Dus gsum nub pa med pa'i mtshan chen yongs su grags pa'i mdo las, bDer gshegs bskal pa bzang po sangs rgyas stong gi mtshan phyag. JA (part 7). Dus gsum nub pa med pa'i mdo las, bDer gshegs 'od zer spro ba'i sangs rgyas stong gi mtshan phyag. NYA (part 8).

र् हे र् रूषः मृष्यः सुनः यः योदः यदेः यदेः यथा यिष्ठेशःसेर्-स्रहसःसदेःस्ट्रस्स्क्रुसः र्बेट वी अर्द्ध सुवा खेद् द्वा था

্বশাল্যমাধ্যমাধ্যমাধ্যমাধ্যমাধ্যমাধ্যমা

636

यी:शक्ष्यःसीयाःजातः पश्चाना

Dus gsum nub pa med pa'i mdo las, gNyis med mnyam pa'i sangs rgyas stong gi mtshan phyag le'u dgu pa. TA (part 9). Dus gsum nub pa med pa'i mdo las, bKod pa zab mo'i sangs rgyas stong gi mtshan phyag le'u bcu pa. THA (part 10). Dus gsum nub pa med pa'i mdo las, dGa' ldan byams pa'i sangs rgyas stong gi mtshan phyag le'u bcu gcig pa. DA (part 11).

र्वि रुषाम्बुमामुमामुमाम्बर्धाः स्वर्थाः स्वर्याः स्वर्याः स्वर्याः स्वर्थाः स्वर्याः स्वर्या	
सर्ष्य-सियो.सु-दे-दे-दे-दे-दे-दे-दे-दे-दे-दे-दे-दे-दे-	
र् यो दुर्याम्बर्यासुनायाः स्रोदायते स्रोदीत्या स्राच्छा स्राच्छा स्राच्छा स्रोद्धाः स्राच्छा स्रोद्धाः स्रोदा	629
বী'মর্ছর'র্মান্ত্র'মন্ত্র'বাশ্বম'শ।	
िस र्रे र्याप्यायायायायायायायायायायायायायायायायाय	
নী'মর্ছর'রিমা'মের'মর্থ'মঙ্গিমা	
Dus gsum nub pa med pa'i mdo las, Thog pa med pa'i sangs rgyas stong gi mtshan phyag le'u bcu gnyis pa. NA (part 12). Dus gsum nub pa med pa'i mdo las, mThu dbang ldan pa'i sangs rgyas stong gi mtshan phyag le'u bcu gsum pa. [PA] (part 13). Dus gsum nub pa med pa'i mdo las, mNgon par dga' ba'i sangs rgyas stong gi mtshan phyag le'u bcu bzhi pa. [PHA] (part 14).	
यीं अर्कम् सुमा त्येतु पर्के तूं। या	
्रियो र् र्यान्यस्य स्वर्धाः स्वरं स	675
मो <sup>ॱ</sup> शक् <sup>र</sup> दीयो.जु.च दे.चें यो.चो	
्रिं र्यायार्थं शार्येयः ता सार्यः सार्यः सार्यः ता सार्यः ता सार्यः सार	
Dus gsum nub pa med pa'i mdo las, bDe ldan bkod pa'i sangs rgyas stong gi mtshan phyag le'u bco lnga pa. BA (part 15). Dus gsum nub pa med pa'i mdo las, U dum wa ra'i sangs rgyas stong gi mtshan phyag le'u bcu drug pa. [MA] (part 16). Dus gsum nub pa med pa'i mdo la[s], mTha' yas rdzogs pa'i sangs rgyas. TSA (part 17)	
অব্ৰেষ্ট্ৰপ্তিশ্ৰ	289
mDo phran nyi shu rtsa gcig (title of first text: Khri rje lung bstan gyi mdo). ইনামানুনা ঘ্ৰমাথে মান্ত্ৰী অনু মান্তিম স্থানা নিমানা	200
Rigs drug thar lam gyi mdo gnyen thing gi gter ma. रेवा वहेंद्र चुनाश सुवानाय वे नगर सेवे नाने रखा रेवाश नुवानर वसानी सर्हा	205
Rig 'dzin thugs sprul g.yu lo dkar po'i gter ma, Rigs drug thar lam gyi mdo.	
	सर्वत्र अवायेत् यह गाहिकाय।  पि तृत्र गाव्या व्यव्या सेत् याचे सर्वे स

44.	तर्व : क्रेंग्र अं सं क्रेंट्र अं अर्के र क्रेंट्र तर्व क्रुंट्र : त्य अ	
	रैयासः नुया नगुः त्यार्वेरः वरुवः वालिः नृरः नुसुवा वा स्रुवा न्यस्य स्वरः योवः।	447
45.	bDun tshigs pho sbyongs mchod skor bdun pa'i rgyud las, Rigs drug dkyil 'khor bca' gzhi dang dmyal ba nas drangs pa'i le'u. (Contains still other titles.)	471
	रियो देव यन यनु अ मी अ न अन अ मि	
46.	Lha bu padma 'phrul gyi mdo. KA (part 1). Drin lan 'bum gyis bsabs mdo. KHA (part 2).	231
47.	mDo ka ba gling dgu. KA.  — KHA.	303
48.	$\int \P \left( -GA \right)$	267
49.	Since NGA.	381
	Jacan.	327
51.	fal_CHA.	225
52.	JE _ JA.	343
53.	ST_NYA.	265
54.	∫5\— TA.	118
55.	[च.चुम रेम सदे:अर्रे:श्रे	278
56.	Khu byug rig pa'i mdo sde. वाप्पुर-तुर-त्यकाः क्रूकाः धर-त्वाधिके क्रुत्।	255
57.	g.Yung drung las rnam par dag pa'i rgyud. इूअ'न्या'में श्रुव'याबुट'।	225
58.	rNam dag gi sgrub gzhung. नुअर्था-अंकेन अंक्नित्र नदे कुर पर कुरावे विनुश्य कुरावे वाबुर्थ क्रिंस मुन्यों वाबुर स्पर्	407
	Byams ma chen mo rtsa ba'i rgyud dang rtsa ba'i 'bum rtsa ba'i gzungs skor gyi gsung pod. (Contains a large number of titles.)	

59.	यविष्यत्रयाङ्करायरःकुषायाणेन्।यविष्याष्ट्रीवेर्त्यायुक्तर्याके द्वार्यके द्वार्यके द्वार्यके विष्यु	
	यिषेत्र रतः दूर्यः परः द्वृत्यः पर्वः श्रर्जन् त्येवाशः परः पर्वेह्न् प्रवेश्वर्रे।	375
60.	gShen rab rnam par rgyal ba yid bzhin gyi nor bu rin po che dpal mgon rgyal po'i gzungs. gShen rab rnam par rgyal ba'i mtshan legs par bstod pa'i mdo.	207
	Rin chen sgron ma 'khor ba dong sprug gi mdo skor gyi sgung pod.	
61.	रियो र् इसन्यायनुवायते हुन्यो वस्या	487
	rNam dag 'dul ba'i rgyud kyi 'bum. [Short title: 'Dul 'bum.] KA (part 1).	
62.	KHA (part 2).	467
63.	∫¶ — GA (part 3).	487
	∫5 NGA (part 4).	475
	∫ (₹) — CA (part 5).	519
	∫ <b>a</b> \ _ CHA (part 6).	541
67.	द्यः स्ट्राः श्चीः श्चीः योर्डेन् स्वतः सद्दी स्ट्रिन् स्वतामा स्वीया स्वीया स्वीया स्वीया स्वीया स्वीया स्वीय स्वाया स्वाया स्वीया स्वीय	248
	Ngan song skye sgo gcod pa'i mdo. lTung bshags sogs kyi skor. (Contains several titles.)	
68.	नाण्ट दुर नार्ड र अते श्लेवमा साराः ।	271
	g.Yung drung gtsang ma'i sgribs sel gyi tshe mdo gzungs. gSer 'od nor bu 'od 'bar.	
69.	दर्चश्र-व.कु.च.कै.लु.चूच्य.सथ.चुटे.जु.च <sup>च</sup> टक.कु.के.क.त।	
	यालीट.र्येट.याक्ट.जा.याज्ञट.याज्ञटला याज्ञट.याज्ञटल.र्ज्य.क्रे.क्रे.वी	293
	'Bras bu che ba lha yi bon phan byed kyi gzungs sde lnga pa. g.Yung drung gtsang ma gsang ba'i gzungs. gSang ba'i gzungs sde nyi shu.	

A Handlist of the Bon Kanjur and Tengyur

71

70.	र्क्षे वित्रा क्रेस् त्यसुया ची क्रुया के त्यपन चुन या ज्ञान है । या स्वर्था स्व	
	सिया रित्रे प्रिवेश हाया रिह्म रित्र स्थ्रे तथा रित्र र्स्स स्थ्रिया रित्र र्स्स स्थ्रिया	467
	<u> ज्ञ</u> ्चर्या.वर्सेज.यी.श्र.जूर.वर्येट.च.र्जेवु.\चया.ईर\	
71.	Mo khog chen 'phrul gyi rgyal po bshad byang gzhung don mdel mig dang bcas pa. Phyag [~Phywa] gshen thig [~theg] pa'i bon sgo las, dPyad don sgyu ma gser 'bum. Mo bkra 'phrul gyi me long 'byung ba lnga'i khag rdung.  ন্ন্তিইম্ব্র্যুম্ব্র	259
	र्देया.चर्राजा.खु.चु.ट.पार्जा.चेयु. र्युचे र्युच.यचेत्रा.ट्याप्ट.त्र्	237
72.	bDud rtsi sman gyi mdo dgu las, gSo rigs rtsa ba thugs 'bum mkha' sngon. sDug bsngal zhi byed gso bya'i [~byed] sman 'bum dkar po. ধুবাবধুবে'ইবিব্যুম'ড্রে'বা	141
73.	sDug bsngal zhi byed dpyad 'bum khra bo. भूगानभूत्य हे हुन नार्थ हुन र हुने र बन त्यनुस्र बनार्थ।	888
74.	sDug bsngal zhi byed gso byed [~bya'i] nad 'bum nag po. নাখ্ম বুং শ্রুম শ্রুষ্ট্রকুর জেনা ব্রিলাঝা জনা চিজী নী শ্রুম জমনে ব্রুঝা	
	म्चीमार्थाम्या अर्केन हेता अर्केन हेता हैता हम्या होरा के सुना नहीं।	353
	g. Yung drung klong rgyas kyi spyi chun lag khrigs. Yig [~yi] ge sgra yi mnga' dbul. Gleg[s] bam. mChod rten. mChod rten byin rlabs. 1Der so spyan dbye.	

# বনুমা

## 'Bum Section:

Vol.	Title	no. of pages
75.	र्णि क्रुं अप्राति वृक्ष्यानामिव स्वात्या सर्दा या वर्षु महिषाणी क्रें वर्षा महेंदाया	
	कैल.चयु.चोर्बर.प्रच.क्रॅंशल.च्री.प्र्यांचांचर्स्या	953
	वेश:रव:ग्री:स:र्र्य:मुंद्रीद:रा:श्रेन्:रादे:(वशर्य)	
76.	rNam mkhyen rgyal ba gshen rab la mdzad pa bcu gnyis kyi sgo nas bstod pa. rGyal ba'i gsung rab rnams kyi klog bsgom. Shes rab kyi pha rol tu phyin pa srid pa'i khams. KA.	
	Shes rab kyi pha rol tu phyin pa srid pa'i khams. KHA.	

	A Handlist of the Bon Kanjur and Tengyur	73
77.	「可し—GA.	939
78.	Since NGA.	981
79.	√5 —CA	777
80.	∫ Table CHA.	753
81.	JA.	845
82.	STONYA.	1145
83.	∫5 \ TA.	853
84.	THA.	922
85.	√5 \ DA.	858
86.	∫₹\_NA.	989.
87.	STI — PA.	755
88.	रियो विशास्ता ग्री यार्से या मुर्खित या यो निर्देष ग्री तिस्राम्।	988
89.	Shes rab kyi pha rol tu phyin pa ye dbyings kyi khams. PHA.	831
90.	Shes rab kyi pha rol tu phyin pa mnyam pa nyid kyi khams. BA.	801
91.	Shes rab kyi pha rol tu phyin pa mnyam pa nyid kyi khams. A.	407
92.	Khams chen 'bring po'i rgyas pa 'phyong 'bum. KA (part 1).  — KHA (part 2).	405
93.	∫ ¬ GA (part 3).	449
94.	∫5. \NGA (part 4).	363
	∫(3) — CA (part 5).	555
96.	CHA (part 6).	435

97.	∫ <b>E</b> JA (part 7).	399
98.	∫ M — A (final part).	419
99.	र्गि विश्वश्चर्यक्षर्यं विश्वर्याः स्ट्रीटः स्वान्यक्षः यक्षः विश्वर्यः विश्वर्यः विश्वर्यः विश्वर्यः विश्वर्यः	536
	Khams brgyad gtan la phab pa stong phrag brgya pa rtsa ba'i 'bum. KA (part 1).	
100.	KHA (part 2).	377
101.	्यो चर्नेशासयु.पर्युट.मू.विश्वशास्त्रैपश्चायाय.पर्टेश.कुश.ची.च	439
	bsDus pa'i 'bring po khams rtsa'am bka' 'dus ces bya ba. KA (part 1).	
102.	KHA (part 2).	429
103.	र्गि विश्वश्चर्यम् त्याप्तवश्चर्याः द्वान्त्रं क्षायः देशः स	389
	Khams brgyad gtan la phabs pa'i rtsa ba don rnam pa nges pa. KA (part 1).	
104.	्रियो तर्जुअ:चःद्रवा:अ। विश्वश्चर्यक्षेत्रःक्षेत्रःक्षेत्रःक्षेत्रःक्षेत्रःक्षेत्रःक्षेत्रःक्षेत्रःक्षेत्रःक्षेत्रःक्षेत्रःक्षेत्रःक्ष	452
	विया य के के ' यें ' प्यु अ मुी ' क्षे द ' यें ' बिश मु ' य व वे ' अ दें।	473
	বিষ্ণান্ত্র নাদ্র অ'ধন' এ ইবা ঐব মইব।	
	— <i>dum bu 'og ma</i> . KHA (part 2). Khams bsdud tshigs bcad ma. Theg pa chen po yum gyi snying po zhes bya ba'i mdo. Khams brgyad gtan la phab pa thig le'i mdo'.	
105.	्रियो वृष्ट्रभी श्रीट मृत्यन्या सदः ययया रियन्याययया	587
	Bon nyid kyi snying po bdal pa'i 'bum [short title: bDal 'bum]. KA (part 1).	
	KA (part 1).  — KHA (part 2).	503
107.	∫¶ — GA (part 3).	521
108.	∫5. — NGA (part 4).	575
109.	$\int \mathfrak{F} - CA \text{ (part 5)}.$	591
110.	Table CHA (part 6).	535
	∫ <b>E</b>	577
l		

	A Handlist of the Bon Kanjur and Tengyur	75
112.	∫5 — NYA (part 8).	593
113.	∫5 — TA (part 9).	563
114.	∫¶ — THA (part 10).	610
115.	र्णि विश्वास्यामुन्नाम् अन्यासुन्यासुन्यस्य स्ट्रिन्यस्य स्वास्य क्रिसे स्वास्य स्वास्य क्रिसे स्वास्य	623
116	Shes rab kyi bla na med pa phyin par mngon rtogs rig pa'i rtse mo'i 'bum. KA (part 1).	639
110.	KHA (part 2).	037
117.	∫¶ — GA (part 3).	628
118.	∫5. — NGA (part 4).	690
119.	$\int \sqrt[3]{-\text{CA (part 5)}}.$	623
120.	$\int d^3 d$ — CHA (part 6).	621
121.	∫ <b>E</b> JA (part 7).	591
122.	∫3 — NYA (part 8).	555
123.	∫5 — TA (part 9).	555
124.	∫¶ — THA (part 10).	543
125.	व्य १९८ मी श्रीट में ह्याया है १९ या ५ मी प्रमाणी प्रमाणी है भी माना माना है १९ या ५ मी प्रमाणी है १९ या १९	511
	Bon nyid kyi snying po thugs rje nyi ma dgu shar gyi 'bum. glegs	
126.	bam dang po (part 1).  ∫ ন্ন্রীন্ম'ন্ম'ন্ন নুম'ন্ _ glegs bam gnyis pa (part 2).	557
127.	ি ন্থীনাম'নম'নাম্ম'ন \_ glegs bam gsum pa (part 3).	579
128.	र् ज्ञीनाशनमः निकंप े — glegs bam bzhi pa (part 4).	533
129.	र् ज्ञीनाशनमः भूम े _ glegs bam lnga pa (part 5).	521
	र् ज्ञीनाशनमः र्जुमा में — glegs bam drug pa (part 6).	471
	্রিন্বাম্বান্ত্র্য — glegs bam bdun pa (part 7).	561

132.	রিন্মানমান্ত্র্ব্রাম — glegs bam brgyad pa (part 8).	536
133.	र् ज्ञीनामानमानमान — glegs bam dgu pa (part 9).	581
134.	্রিন্মানমানম্ব্রাম — glegs bam bcu pa (part 10).	555
135.	र्णि वेंब रेब रेक विश्वास्यामनेब संग्वर्ट अवे सु विष्य र्मार वें।	573
	रियो गर्डदः अः सुः वित्य अवगः धे।	
136.	Bon rin po che 'phrul ngag bden pa gtsang ma'i klu 'bum dkar po. KA (part 1). gTsang ma klu 'bum nag po. KHA (part 2).	519
137.	gTsang ma klu 'bum khra bo. GA (part 3). जात्रसम्बद्धान्य निक्षान्य क्षेत्र मिन्द्रसम्बद्धान्य क्षेत्र मिन्द्रसम्बद्धान्य क्षेत्र मिन्द्रसम्बद्धान्य स्	
	इस्रान्ना मेन केन मार्डमास दे मुल्यस नगमान नगान मार्थस वर्ष सम्ब्रीम मुल्यस्थित।	472
138.	gNam sa snang brgyad kyi mdo 'gro la phan phyir kong tses zhus pa. rNam dag rin chen gtsang ma'i klu 'bum dkar nag khra gsum 'dus pa skor gyi gsung pod. Contains several other titles. ১৯৮১বার্থ্যমূর্ম্ব্রেম্য	
	dkar nag kra gsun 'bring ba	421
139.	(Bon rin po che 'phrul ngag bden pa gtsang ma klu 'bum nag po'i gzhung. gTsang ma klu 'bum don bsdus chung ngu zhes bya ba'i skor gyi gsung pod. Contains several other titles.)  স্থা কুমানমান্দ্রামানী ব্রহ্মানী ব্যহ্মানী ব্যহ	
	rNam par dag pa'i 'bum bzhi las, gTsang ma'i klu 'bum. KA (part	341
140.	1). चि क्रुं क्रायर द्वायदे त्व्युवाय हो त्या वायद्वा द्वार क्रिय मुंद्वी क्रुं र वर्षे व्या	451
	र्विस संग्रहेश स <sup>े</sup>	
141.	rNam par dag pa'i 'bum bzhi las, Sa bdag dbang chen gyi sgyur bcos (bam po gnyis pa). KHA (part 2).  িন্দ্ৰ ক্ষাধ্য বৃদ্ধান্ত বৃদ্ধান্ত বিশ্বস্থা ক্ষান্ত বৃদ্ধান্ত বৃদ্ধান বৃদ্ধান্ত বৃ	325
	rNam par dag pa'i 'bum bzhi las, Rin po che gnyan gyi 'bum. GA (part 3).	

142.	र् न्याय क्षेत्र क्	400
143.	rNam par dag pa'i 'bum bzhi las, rDo bdag gtod po bcos pa (bam po bzhi pa). NGA (part 4).  โป้ รุ่มณาฉุญมารุปาราชั่า รัฐาหิราหิราหิราหิราหิราหิราหารณาผลิวสุมาฏิรูเกา	351
144.	dPal 'bum dkar po. Bon nyid snying po bdal pa'i 'bum gyi rtsa ba. KA (part 1).  স্থা ক্রিট্রাইন্সান্ত্রাবার্থ ব্যুমান্ত্রাক্রান্ত্রালা  Bon nyid snying po bdal ba'i 'bum rtsa zhes bya ba. KHA (part 2).	231

## শূবাবা

sNgags Section:

Vol.	Title	no. of pages
145.	বাব:ম:র্বাপ:শ্রী:দইবা:মা ট্র্রেই:বাপেম:ব:মগ্রম্রনা	232
146.	Gab pa thugs kyi brnag pa, Khro rgyud gsang ba bsen thub. নামমান্ত্ৰাইন ইকি শ্ৰী শ্ৰুবেমানাবাম শ্ৰুনাম্বা ব্ৰন্থা নাম্বাৰা	416
	न्धयःम्बरःचःवनुबःयःनेतःची <u>ः</u>	
147.	gSas mkhar rin po che spyi spungs gab pa sku gsung thugs kyi brnag pa, dPal gsang ba 'dus pa don gyi rgyud. নামক'মানম'ন্ত্ৰি'ন'নাখ্ড্ৰ'হ্ৰ্ম'উনিম'মন্ত্ৰ'নাজ্ব্ৰ'।	264
148.	gSas mkhar zhi ba g.yung drung yongs su rdzogs pa'i gzhung. ব্রিনিই কুর্ব-রূপ	789
149.	Khro bo'i rgyud drug. (Contains six titles, the Khro bo rgyud drug in the sPa-gro-ma version.) ঝুনানুহাকীৰ শ্বীহানবী ক্লুহানহা বামৰাকীৰ ইনাৰাপুৰ ক্লুহাৰী বামুহাৰী বা	
	lTa ba khyung chen lding ba'i rgyud dang, Gsas chen rigs lnga'i rgyud skor gyi gsung pod. (Contains six titles, the Khro bo rgyud drug in the Dang-ra-ma or Byang gter version.)	264

150.	योशकाःश्रायमः मुष्ठः मुर्गे सुम्यागीः वम्यायः योशकाः मुन्नः से व्यक्तिः।	
	वार्यानु विद्याया वार्या वार्या वार्या वार्या वार्या वार्या विद्याया वार्या वार	407
	गीय.चचर.चरिष.क्षेप्र.क्षेप्र.घचरा.भूर।	
151.	gSas mkhar rin po che spyi spungs kyi nang nas. gSal byed me long pra yi 'phyong. Las kyi 'phyong chen sde dgu. g.Yung drung gting rdzogs gsang ba'i rgyud. Kun bzang gshen lha'i sgrub thabs skor. (Contains still other titles.)	
	२चवाःयोशशः <sup>रू</sup> शःसदुःधुरःश्वरःयोलःङ्केदुःचश्चेतःङ्गीयःङ्गैयदुः <del>ष</del> ्टिरो	360
	<u> रचत्रःयाश्रशः रूअः यः द्वाः र्त्तेयः वो क्रु</u> दः श्रेंदः देः र्वे क्रेत्र	
	श्चैं:वर्ष्या:खं:नु:दवर:वदे:कुन:भ्रेरा	
152.	sPyi spungs gsang ba thugs kyi brnag pa, dBal gsas rngam pa'i ting mur g.yu rtse'i bsnyen sgrub rtsa ba'i rgyud. dBal gsas rngam pa drag zlog gi rgyud stong ri tho chen. sPyi gtsug u du 'bar ba'i rgyud skor. (Contains still other titles.)	
	यावतःतर्वो देवःकेवःवायरः क्रींदःवायुटः दुटः देवाः यते क्रुत्।	170
	ন্রুমঝ'ম'র্ক্টর্'র্ম্ব্র্র্র্বর্ত্ত'বর্ষ্ক্র্রুবঝ'শ্বা	
	gSer lo ljon shing bdud rtsi 'khyil pa'i rgyud. mKha' 'gro rin chen gsang skor g.yung drung rig pa'i rgyud. Byams ma chen mo rtsa ba'i bsgrubs pa.	
153.	म्राक्चिर् स्य क्रियाक्ष्या यायर क्रिया विया त्या	306
	<u>कुक्तु</u> तृ:देशःयवे:चेयाःयो।	
154.	Ma rgyud sangs rgyas rgyud gsum. gSang chen 'dus pa'i snying thig las, rTsa rgyud nges pa'i thig le. খ্ৰামণ্ট্ৰীত্বেন্স্ন্ত্ৰ্ব্ৰ্ব্ৰ্ব্ৰ্ব্ৰ্	749
	Thugs kyi yang gab ma rgyud thugs rje nyi ma'i rgyud.	

	A Handlist of the Bon Kanjur and Tengyur	79
155.	याश्चर शावर देव र्थे के बेवा ये 'द्वीदश केव वाणुट 'दुट 'ॲटश हूँवाश ग्री क्रुट क्रेंरा	
	त.र्चेट. मुचारा पि.वीया योश्नर अपूर्या कैल. त्र्याश्चर विया श्चेर्य पुरी	324
156.	gSas mkhar rin po che thig le dbyings chen g.yung drung yongs rdzogs kyi rgyud skor. Pha rgyud rig pa khu byug gsang mchog rgyal po mthar thug rtsa ba'i rgyud. (Contains still other titles.) নামৰামানমানী কিন্তু কুন্দানামন নাম্ভ্ৰমান ক্ৰমান	
	য়য়ৼ৾ঢ়৻ঽঀৣয়৻য়৻য়য়য়য়৻ড়ৢয়৻৸য়৻ৠৣ৾য়ৣৄৼঀ	276
157.	gSas mkhar rin po che spyi spungs gsang ba 'dus pa thabs chen yab kyi lung rgyud. gSang ba 'dus pa thabs chen yab kyi rgyud. (Note: These are gter ma of gSang-sngags gling-pa.)  স্থান ক কিব অব অব শ্বিমান্ত্র স্থান কিব অব অব শ্বিমানত কিব অব অব অব শ্বিমানত কিব অব	
	गुरु:वर्ष:मेर्व:केर्व:वार्य:दुर:वार्यर:ववे:कुर:व्यया वर्षेम:विवार्य:दर्वेर्य:वर्षुवार्य:दर्वेर्य:वर्षुवार्य:दर्वे	297
	चर्नरःयिविषासः नर्गोरसः यः वृषासः चर्सुवसः धीनः चल्निः र्वेरः चुत्रः खुनः की क्रुः चः सः वेदः त्युः चुत्रः	
	<b>€</b> 51	
158.	gSang ba rin chen yan lag snying rgyud dgongs 'dus rgyab brten lung gi rgyud. Kun 'dus rin chen g.yung drung gsang ba'i rgyud las, bDer gshegs dgongs 'dus. bDer gshegs dgongs pa thugs bsgrubs yid bzhin nor bu'i lung gi rtsa ba sa bon lta bu'i rgyud.  বিশ্বিম্যান্ত্ৰ্যুম্বান্ত্ৰয় বিশ্বান্ত্ৰ্যুম্বান্ত্ৰ্যুম্বান্ত্ৰ্যুম্বান্ত্ৰ্যুম্বান্ত্ৰয় বিশ্বান্ত্ৰয় বিশ্বান্ত্ৰয	251
	द्रयो.यहूच.यर्थं अ.स.घचश.कुचे.शोयय.ता. <sup>कु</sup> ट्री	231
159.	Zhi khro rab 'byams rtsa gsum kun 'dus gsang ba sngags kyi rgyud. Rig 'dzin 'dus pa thabs chen mkha' yi rgyud. ক্টামক্র্মান্ত্র্	
	<b>५</b> न८:५्न्याःदनरःचःश्रेःद्रेदःवीःश्रे्र्रा	302
	য়য়ঽ৾৻ঽয়ৣ৾৻ঀয়৾ৼয়ৼৣ৾৻ঽয়য়৾য়ৣ৾য়য়ৣৢয়ৢয়ৢয়	
	Che mchog dran pa yang gsang drag po'i rgyud, rTsa rgyud dbang drag 'bar ba'i phreng ba. dBang drag 'bar ba me phreng gi skor. mKha' 'gro shes rab blo 'phel gyi bsgrub thabs kyi skor.	

160.	गानाबनार्थास्त्रास्त्राक्कान्याः कृति क्षित्रस्त्रास्ताः मृत्राक्षाः स्त्राक्षाः स्त्राक्षाः स्त्राक्षाः स्त्र	
	र्रेट्ट द्रमा रेवि हुन। न्वयः मुख्यः द्रमा रेवि हेत्।	
	वि.ययर.ययो.स्.योश्नर.य.रय.क्रयोश.यर्थेश.तयु.क्रीरी क्रि.शर्टेर.ययर.ययु.क्रीरी	841
	मुंब्रिक ह्या पर्वे कुर्ग वहेवा हेव स्ट्रिंडिंडिंडिंडिंडिंडिं विश्वया वार्यया वार्यया वी कुर्ग	
	यायायायाद्यासुदास्यायादे श्रीकृत्।	
161.	Ka ba nag po man ngag rtsa ba'i rgyud. Nyon mongs rang grol dug lnga rtsad gcod kyi rgyud. Ri rong nag po'i rgyud. dBal gsas drag po me ri 'bar ba'i rgyud. Sha 'bar nag po gsang ba ngan sngags 'dus pa'i rgyud. rGya mdud 'bar ba'i rgyud. Chu srin rngam pa'i rgyud. 'Jig rten phung byed kyi rgyud. Khams gsum kun grol gyi rgyud. Gab pa mngon phyung stag la'i skye rgyud.  प्राथि कि प्राथ कि प्राथि कि प्राथि कि प्राथ कि	795
162.	Phur pa'i rgyud dgu skor gyi gsung pod. (Contains nine titles.) भूगायुराञ्चर्द्वा प्रायायुराययायायायायायायायायायायायायायायाय	
	ह्य-च्यात्र्यात्रुवार्थः र्ववाय्यन्यः प्यात्यः वीक्षुत्।	262
163.	sTag phur rtsa rgyud. dBal phur 'bar ba nag po'i phrin las me ri 'khyil ba'i rgyud skor. Khro bo gnam leags thog mda' yang gsang gi rgyud. ন্যানিত্ব বৃত্ত বৃত্ত ব্যাক্ষান্ত বৃত্ত	426
164.	Ge khod bdud 'dul gsang ba rtsa ba'i rgyud. (With associated and additional titles.) মুন্ম্বিস্ফাম্ম্বামান্ট্রমান্ত্রিয়া	420
165.	sPu gri dkar po sngags sems dang po 'byung srid thugs rje'i nyi ma shar tshul. (Contains a number of titles connected with the sTag la spu gri dkar po'i rgyud.) মার্মান্ত্রসামান্ত্রস	198
	Ma mo 'dus pa yang snying gis rgyud las, gSang ba rtsa rgyud (and associated texts of the Ma mo sbod gtong gi rgyud skor).	357

166.	शायवःवर्ग्ने क्रुंचवरे क्रुंच्यव्याः वाश्यरः क्रेष्ट्रंच्यः यः बरः वयः ग्रीक्रुंचः ग्रीक्रुंवः र्था	
	<u> चया पर्वत नुस्य धेती हुन सु वी सेया गोर्वन ।</u>	
	নাৰ্ম'ঝুনা্ম'ঝুঁনা্নী'ঝি'নব্ম'∃'ঝের্ম'ক্ত'না	285
	दह्मार्थाचीन् मित्रे हे त्रमार्थेते मार्थे मार्थे प्रमार्थे प्रमार्थे प्रमार्थे प्रमार्थे प्रमार्थे प्रमार्थे प	
	श्चेशः वः त्यशः वीरः नगरः संदेः हुः वसुवाः श्चुः व्यवः वेवा हुनः वादनः ग्रीः वेराः धीवा नर्वा रागरः व	
	ম'শ্	
167.	mKha' 'gro rtsa ba'i rgyud 'bum gsang chen rol pa zang thal gyi rgyud kyi rgyal po. Brag btsan dmar po'i rgyud spu gri reg gcod. gNam lcags srog gi se bdar za 'gram che ba. 'Jigs byed gshin rje nag po'i gsang rgyud dug mtsho' khol ma'i lo rgyus. sKyes bu las ging dkar po'i rdzu 'phrul sku lnga'i srog rgyud gnad kyi them yig dngul dkar bum pa.	735
168.	Kun 'bum go 'byed rtsa ba'i rgyud (Kun 'bum khra bo and associated texts). श्ची मह्मा खानु विकास के किया महिमा किया किया किया किया किया किया किया किय	
	sPyi gtsug u du 'bar ba rin po che tog gi gzungs. gTsug tor skor	375
169.	gyi gsung pod. (Contains several titles.) নামমান্ত্রান্ত্রামান্ত্রানান্ত্রান্ত্রানান্ত্রানান্ত্রানান্ত্রানান্ত্রানান্ত্রানান্ত্রানান্ত্রানান্ত্রানান্ত্	240
170.	gSas mkhar gsang ba'i 'tshams zlog gi rgyud skor. देव से के गुव वर्ष कुपये कुर ब्रेंट्रा	257
	Rin po che kun 'dus rtsa ba'i rgyud skor. (Contains several titles.)	

## ঝিমঝা

## Sems Section:

	Sems Section:	
	<u> Fitle</u>	no. of pages
171.	र्ह्म्यायायः केवार्यः लिटः लिटः श्ववः कुटः नायः कुटः श्वेरः पति।	353
	rDzogs pa chen po zhang zhung snyan rgyud bka' rgyud skor bzhi.	
172.	हूँ त्रायाया के वार्या के	580
	र्हे्याय हेर प्राये में पुर र्वेद हे पर पादिया है हैं प्राया है या है से प्राया है या है से प्राया है या है से प्राया है से स्था है	
	rDzogs pa chen po byang chub sems kyi smyu gu gab pa dgu skor. rDzogs chen gser gyi lung non che ba gnyis kyi skor.	
173.	्र्रुत्यानः सः त्युः क्र्रितः युः विदः क्ष्यः स्रोधाराः यदेः द्योवाः सा	353
	rGyud gab pa dgu skor gyi le'u dang po. Byang chub sems kyi gab pa'i 'grel pa.	
174.	र्ह्मेयारा हेर प्रस्तान से प्रतास से स्वास स	324
	rDzogs chen bsgrags pa skor gsum las, sTeng lha yul du bsgrags pa'i skor.	
175.	र्ह्मिया होत्र निर्मेया श्री र यो श्री या श्री	255
	द्वायाः त्या प्राप्त प्रमान	
	rDzogs chen bsgrags pa skor gsum las, Bar mi yul dang, 'Og klu yul du bsgrags pa'i skor.	
176.		470
	sPyi rgyud chen po nam mkha' dkar po ye khri mtha' sel gyi skor.	
177.	र्ह्मेयाश्च हेन हो त्यं प्राप्त स्थाप के सुर्थ किया ता और किया ही हो के श्वास हिन और ।	364
	rDzogs chen me long bdun pa. Lha bon khyab pa snang ldan gyi nyams khrid skor.	
178.	र्हूयाश्वराक्षक्र संस्था स्थेन सम्बन्धा स्था स्था स्था स्था स्था स्था स्था स्थ	280
	rDzogs pa chen po mu med bdal pa'i rgyud.	

## Bonpo Tengyur

Achard Volume #	Title	Karmay volume #
Volume 1	ร नुवे भूँ ब महुमाश हमार । महोब र स्व अर्थे माहे स्व ब स्व महिमाश सके माहुमाह माह माह माह माह माह माह माह माह माह	1
Volume 2	ব্ৰথ বাৰ্থ প্ৰবাৰ শ্ৰুব শ্লুব dBal gsas thugs sgrub skor	2
Volume 3	ধুবা থ বসু এথ বাদ হৈ কুবাৰ। sTag la bkra shis gter rdzogs	3
Volume 4	ব্ৰাশ্ব্যাথাব্যথার্থ। Drag sngags dbal mo	4
Volume 5	र्रे अर्द्ध स्त्रुव्य पर्द्धिया पर्देश श्री श्री श्री श्री श्री श्री श्री श्र	5
Volume 6	મુ કેરે લ્લિંમ વડ્યા Mu cho'i khrom 'dul	6
Volume 7	धूमायमा धुर्के । sTag lag lha rgod	7
Volume 8	हे प्रमुज्ञ न्ह्य न्ह्य rta 'brin ga'u dmar nag क्रें न्नर प्रमुज्ञ न्ह्य क्ष्य Tshe dbang padma rab khros	8
Volume 9	श्चे शुर् अप्रवः र्सेटः। sPyi spung mkha' klong	9

	_	
volume 10	[a rayard kwi rayard 'aral	10
	la rgyud kyi rgyud 'grel	
Volume 11	वित <sup>्</sup> त्यरः <b>श्च</b> ेत्वतुत्या	11
gS	Shed dmar spyi 'dul	
Volume 12	- কুন্বামন:মার্কুনা মহম: হুবা	12
M	Ia rgyud gsang mchog mthar thug	
Volume 13 55	पत्म मान्य प्रत्या थ	13
dF	Pal gsang ba 'dus pa	
الالالالالالالالالالالالالالالالالالال	·क्वें?र्दर्-र्थम् <sup>,</sup> ब्रोर्	14
M	Ia tri 'od dpag med	
Volume 15	<b>अ</b> ्वं देन नगर नयमा सेन येन।	15
Ts	she sgrub 'od dkar dpag med pod	
Volume 16	প্র.জান্তর বর্ট্যু 🗣 প্রমূ	16
	am lnga mkha' 'gro rgya mtsho	10
Volume 17	, त्युव द्वर <b>अ</b> त्र <b>अ</b> त्	17
Lh	hun grub dbang ldan bla sgrub	
Walana 10	<u> </u>	10
Volume 18 Sri	rid rgyal srog sgrub	18
Volume 19	기출·대·제회·월·기	19
Sri	rid rgyal mthu sgrub	
Volume 20	''ପଷ୍ଟ୍ର'' ଅସ <b>୍ଥିଷ୍ଟ</b> ମ୍ବ	20
A	bse'i mthu sgrub	-
Volume 21	वैक हे क्या यें।	21
gS	Shin rje nag po	

Volume 22	ਕੇ ਜੇ ਤੁਤਾਖ਼ਤ। Me ri gyad phur	22
Volume 23	মুনির্মান Khro bo rol pa (wrapped in two volumes: I -pp.1-896; II - pp.897-end)	23
Volume 24	র্ব আঁর প্রবাধানত স্থান। Don yod zhags pa'i skor	24
Volume 25	श्रुव हुन :यून :या। sNyan rgyud phur pa	25
Volume 26	श्चे पञ्च प्रतिक्षा sDe brgyad bzlog mdos (smad cha)	26
Volume 27	श्रे'नकुर'नर्ज्ञेग'अर्रेश। sDe brgyad bzlog mdos (stod cha)	27
Volume 28	ખુડ્ર વર્ગ પ્રાપ્ત વર્ષે કરાયા માટે જાય માટે ક્ષુવા Ud 'bar dkyil 'khor dang ma mo gsang sgrub	28
Volume 29	ধুনা'ঝ'ধুন'ন'ইৢ ঐহ'শুইুব'ঝঝ'ধুনা'নাৰুহ'। sTag la phur bu rtse med kyi rgyud las stag gzhung	29
Volume 30	ঘনামাই শাুর র্মাঝা অবানামন নার্ভির শ্রীর বাদিন করিব। thugs rje kun grol / Zab gsang gcod kyi dgongs spyod	30
Volume 31	तुरासुमार्छन् सुमार्छन् केषा Drung mu gcod chen	31
Volume 32	कें द्रप्रत्यप्र (बुद्रायम् सें भिगाई है। Tshe dbang yang zhun (à éplucher ; intéressant) par Mi shig rdo rje	32
Volume 33	वन देव। वके से र जा र पहुर जावका ग्री क्रस्मा प्राप्त प्र प्राप्त प्र प्राप्त प्र प्राप्त प्र प्राप्त प्र प्राप्त प्र प्र प्राप्त प्त	33

Volume 34  Zab don / 'Chi med gu ru padma 'byung gnas kyi rnam thar (Ga)  Volume 35  Zab don / 'Chi med gu ru padma 'byung gnas kyi rnam thar (Ga)  Volume 36  Zab don / ghu'i rnam thar zab don bzhugs  Volume 36  Zab don  Zab gang mkha' 'gro'i snying thig kye ma'i zab gcod lag len shel dkar phreng ba'i do shal  Volume 38  ¬¬¬¬¬¬¬¬¬¬¬¬¬¬¬¬¬¬¬¬¬¬¬¬¬¬¬¬¬¬¬¬¬¬¬			
Zab don/ ghu'i rnam thar zab don bzhugs  Volume 36 বিশ্ব বি	Volume 34	Zab don / 'Chi med gu ru padma 'byung gnas kyi	34
Zab don  =ব লাউন্  =ব লাউন্  =ব লাউন্  =ব লাউন্  =ব লাউন্   Zab gsang mkha' 'gro'i snying thig kye ma'i zab gcod lag len shel dkar phreng ba'i do shal  Volume 38  Volume 38  प्रात्य শ্বন্ধ শ	Volume 35		35
Volume 37  Volume 37  RT ম্বান্ত মেন্ত মেন্ত মেন্ত মিন্ত মানত মেন্ত মিন্ত মানত মানত মেন্ত মেন্ত মিন্ত মানত মেন্ত মেন্ত মিন্ত মানত মানত মেন্ত মন্ত মানত মানত মেন্ত মন্ত মানত মানত মানত মানত মন্ত মানত মানত মানত মানত মানত মানত মানত মান	Volume 36	1 11	36
gSang phur stag la gri 'dul  Volume 39  Sর্মান্ম্মিমন্ত্রম্মা  Dran pa gser gdams  Nুলামান্ত্রন্মা stag la bdag la rdzogs  Nুলামান্ত্রন্মান্ত্রন্মা stag la bdag la rdzogs  Ngলামান্ত্রন্মান্ত্	Volume 37	वन मार्थर अस्व त्यमें दे श्री र हो मा गु अस्य विश्व प्राप्त स्थित । प्राप्त के प्राप्त	37
Dran pa gser gdams  Nolume 40  Pan pa gser gdams  Nolume 40  Pan pa gser gdams  Nolume 40  Nolume 40  Nolume 40  Nolume 41	Volume 38		38
Volume 40  য়্বা'অ'য়৾'ঽয়	Volume 39		39
mTshan brjod	Volume 40	भूगायाओयवरप्पत्रणार्द्वेणश्रामाश्रद्धणायाः भूग्यश्रामा भूग्यश्रामा स्वाप्या हिर्मा अर्थित्। sTag la me 'bar bdag rdzogs gsang ba mchog gi skabs	40
	Volume 41		41
Volume 42  Khrid yig dmar mo mdzub tshugs (Kun grol grags pa)  42	Volume 42	ব্রিস্থানাস্ক্রম্র্রাক্র্রামা Khrid yig dmar mo mdzub tshugs (Kun grol grags pa)	42

Volume 43	याबर व त्यों दिवा अ हु उधावद दर्वे दर्वे दर्वे दर्वा य गुरु दर्वे ।	
Volume 45	Ma rgyud mkha' 'gro dgongs pa kun 'dus (mKha' 'gro	43
	gsang ba ye shes, mKha' 'gro snying thig de Kun grol grags pa)	
Volume 44	खु'वर्नुअ'वनर'नवे <del>क</del> ुर्	44
	U 'du(m) 'bar ba'i rgyud	11
Volume 45	লব:র্ম:র্মাম:র্মুনা	45
	Yab sras thugs sgrub	-
Volume 46	ब्रॅन ब्रेंट र् गहेंट रे। या ग्रें क्रेंन गहेंट र	46
	Ma mo rbod gtong	
Volume 47	गुब-रेमाञ्चेब-मञ्चेम	47
	Kun rig sbyin bsreg	
Volume 48	<u> </u>	48
	Dran pa gsang sgrub	
	মুন্সান্ত্রা stag la phur shas (shams)	
Volume 49	can অন্ত্রীন্যাঝন্যের শ্রুবাঝ্রুবানী স্বাঝন্মূর্ম স্থান্য	49
	Yang snying gsang ba'i thugs sgrub de gSang sngags gling pa	
	र्कें निर्मे rtsod zlog	
Volume 50	यारायायर मेर में के ही सुरया हुँ त नहीं या ले हिंदी नहीं र सुरा	50
	gSas mkhar rin po che spyi spungs rtsod bzlog zhi khro'i bsnyen sgrub	
Volume 51	र्केन:मर्जेग	51
	rTsod bzlog	J.
	गुरु नबर खुर केर्ग kun bzang lung chen	
Volume 52	गुरु मु चबद र्थे अहुअ संहित गुक्कित र्थेषाया	52
	Kun tu bzang po mnyam pa nyid kyi rgyud sogs	

	नायमः अवे नार्ना अवे नार्नायः रिनाम। gsar ma'i gdug (ma'i	
Volume 53	gdugs) dkar गर्जाकेर गर्गर गुः भ्रेरा	53
	gTsug chen gdugs dkar gyi skor	
Volume 54	र्दुं केंद्र सुर् कुरग्रुखा	54
	Hûm chen ghu rtsa gsum	
Volume 55	देवा वर्ष प्राप्त श्रीरा rig 'dus dang sa snying	
volume 33	ह्मः अभिवादिक प्रतिर्वाद्य विष्या	55
	Bla ma rig 'dzin dgongs pa 'dus pa	
Volume 56	ष्पर- <u>ड</u> ्रेश्चॅर-केब्	56
	Yang rtse klong chen	
Volume 57	बे:गोर्ड <b>र</b> :इर:क्रेर:क्रुव:इग:क्रुवा	57
	Zhi gcod dang srid rgyal drag sgrub	
	মু হব স্থান ghu ru'i thugs sgrub	
Volume 58	लर.चय.सी.र.वयाश.मी.श्रीय.ता	58
	Yang zab ghu ru thugs kyi sgrub pa	
Volume 59	यावतः तर्वो दर्वो दर्शाद दुर्श ददः श्रेद क्रुयः द्वा श्रुवा	59
	mKha' 'gro dgongs 'dus dang srid rgyal drag sgrub	
Volume 60	মানব:বের্লু-বর্লা-মানব-ব্রা	60
	mKha' 'gro dgongs 'dus (mKha' 'gro snying thig)	
Volume 61	द्रया'यह्रव'श्रायय यर्ग्ने (बुर्थ योव)	61
	Rig 'dzin mkha' 'gro zhus len	
Volume 62	भ्रे:वैवा:गुर:द्रवा	62
	Mi shig gur drag (I)	
Volume 63	भ्रे:बैग'गुर-दग	63
	Mi shig gur drag (II)	

Volume 64	মানব:বর্ন্স্ বাধ্যম:বার্ডিব।	(4
	mKha' 'gro gsang gcod (I)	64
Volume 65	মানব:বর্নু:বাশ্ব-শের্ভিন্।	65
voidine 05	mKha' 'gro gsang gcod (II)	03
	भैःभैना मुंदन mi shig ghu drag	
Volume 66	मु:र्:५म:ध्री	66
	Ghu ru drag po (I)	
	मु:इग	
Volume 67	सु: <u>र</u> :इग:र्थे।	67
	Ghu ru drag po (II)	
Volume 68	ल् <b>ट</b> :ल्ट्र:इंग	68
voidine oo	Zhang zhung ju thig	00
Volume 69	बे:ब्रॅं-र्नोट्य:यर्था	69
	Zhi khro dgongs 'dus (I)	
Volume 70	बे मिं न्में र स यनुस	70
	Zhi khro dgongs 'dus (II)	
Volume 71	शे:वैमार्से में	71
	Mi shig khro bo	
Volume 72	नश्चर्यात्रासः मेत्र केत्र सीमः यागात्रा	72
	bsGrags pa rin chen gling grags	
Volume 73	र्दुःकेबःगुः <u>नुः</u> क्वःगशुरु।	73
	Hûm chen gu ru rtsa gsum	
Volume 74	बिद्धिः कुष्याग्युवः वर्षा	74
	Zhi khro rtsa gsum kun 'dus	
Volume 75	थें वृते भूत य	75/76
	Li shu'i sgrub pa	

Volume 76	Combined with number 75.	75/76
Volume 77	र्से भ्रम खुर य	77
voidine 77	Blo Idan phur pa	77
Volume 78	<u> </u>	78
volume 70	dMar khrid dgongs pa kun 'dus	70
	कें भूत हैं है में विन। tshe sgrub rdo rje go khrab	
Volume 79	वकें क्षेत्र क्षेत्रं कें कें त्यम् क्षेत्रं मुं क्षुवः या	79
	'Chi med mgon po tshe dpag med kyi sgrub pa, révélé par Sangs rgyas gling pa	
	ग्रिवासायव्याप्तवे त्यादा gzhi lam 'bras bu'i lung	
Volume 80	श्च-र्स्ट्रेन-यानिःयास-यन्त्रस-युक्तुन-स्यास	80
	sGa ston gzhi lam 'bras bu rgyan sogs	
Volume 81	इ.च.रअर.वचा.ची.क्ट्र.रट.श्चराया	81
V OIGHING 01	Dra ba dmar nag gi rgyud dang sgrub pa	01
Volume 82	चैर.क्य.श्चैय.घयश.लश.रूश।	82
	Byang chub sgrub thabs lam rim	Ŭ <u></u>
Volume 83	प्रश्नायक्ष्य प्रमुखाया 	83
	Khams brgyad bsdus pa	
Volume 84	<b>ब्रॅ</b> ट:याश्रुआतत्त्व्यायायायायायायायायायायायायायायायायायाय	84
voidine of	sTong gsum 'khrugs pa yo bcos	01
Volume 85	कु.यान्याः चेत् क्क्वेंदः चले क्क्वयाना	85
	rTsa gsum bon skyong bzhi sbrags	
Volume 86	<u> इ</u> .यर्चेय.रट.जु.वी.रट.रचे.तयु.खेल.यर्थश्रा	
	rje 'brug dang li shu dang dran pa'i zhal gdams	86
	म् अद्र से पु ल्या महाराष्ट्र	
	Bla ma'i li shu zhal gdams	

	নাৰ্থকে বা	
Volume 87	gSol kha (in two volumes : vol 1 -pp.1-926 ; vol2-	87
	pp.927-1796)	
Volume 88	<u>चुःत्यम्बः श्रादः येद्</u> ।	88
	Bru lugs skang pod	
Volume 89	यायवःवर्ग्, श्रेषाः माच च रः श्रवः मालु रः ।	89
	mKha' 'gro skal pa bzang mo'i gzhung	
Volume 90	মামৰ'ক্টৰ'ষ্ট্ৰ'মাই'হুম'ঘমা	90
	mKhan chen nyi ma'i rnam thar	
	चगाद 'दर्मोव्या bka' 'grel	
Volume 91	श्चीं.वर्तेज.रं.च.क्रेक्टिं.वर्योज.त।	91
	sGyu 'phrul dra ba rtsa rgyud 'grel pa	
Volume 92	लट कुर्योट केंद्र ग्री विद्योव क्रींट।	92
	Yang rtse klong chen gyi 'grel skor	
Volume 93	चगायः त्याः स्ट्रेन त्याः स्यारः कयाशा	93
	bKa' 'gyur brTen 'gyur dkar chags	
Volume 94	यिषु के अदे नगद स्युआ	94
	gShen nyi ma'i bka' 'bum	
Volume 95	चैर.क्य.ज्याश्चारा-चर्यर.जञ्जा	95
	Byang chub legs bshad lam rim	
Volume 96	बरबाक्किंबार्स्ट्रेंटर्न्नर।	96
	Sangs rgyas stong dbang	
Volume 97	यिषेष.रयःग्री:श्रेषेश.रयशः रूसः ।	97
	gShen rab kyi skyes rabs rnam thar	
Volume 98	र्हूयामा क्रेम् 'सू' न 'र्ह्म वा' यसे नमा	98
	rDzogs chen lta ba thog 'bebs I	

Volume 99	इं.सं.सं.सं. अटश.क्रेंश.क्रेंट.रेचट.।	99
	Dzwa phur me ri + sangs rgyas stong dbang	
Volume 100	याश्वर यः श्रृयाशः ग्रीः प्यर याश्वर ख्रुताशः कुरा	100
	gSang ba sngags kyi yang gsang thugs rgyud	
W-1 101	बर बिर क्षेत्र क्रुर ग्री के क्रिय दर अहे द नहें द नक्षेत्र नहें श	101
Volume 101	Zhang zhung snyan rgyud kyi lo rgyus dang mngon brjod bstan bcos	101
Volume 102	श्चर्द्र मा से व्योधियाम	102
	sNyan ngag me long gi 'grel pa	
Volume 103	दर्बे(अर्वे(ब्र.ब्र.लंबर-क्रंप्रम्	103
	'Gro mgon sa lam dang tshad ma	
Volume 104	रूठा: <b>स्</b> चारम्	104
	rNam rgyal sgrub pa	
Volume 105	নমম'ম'ঝৣয়'য়ৢৢন	105
	bSam pa lhun grub	
	র্ব'র্ন্স dran drag	
Volume 106	<u>बुःस् श्</u> रुत्यस्याद्गः मदे क्	106
	Zhi khro sgyu 'phrul dra ba'i rgyud (Dran pa yang gsang drag po)	
Volume 107	র্বার্থী dran drag	
	<u> इब्रस्य इब्राधेर्वे वर्त्त</u> ्र्वाया	107
	Dran pa drag po'i bzlog pa	
Volume 108	नगाय:म्बराक्षेत्र:ब्रॉटश:गाुत:यद्यीत।	108
	dKa' thub nyon mongs kun 'byin	
		-

r.		
Volume 109	নাক্র ই: মুব-নি। ga rgya'i sman dpe মনমাক্রুমা মুব-মুব-মিন। Sangs rgyas sman lha'i pod	109
Volume 110	বাষ্য মান স্থান বিব্যা gsar ma'i skong 'bum বাষ্য মান বিব্যা gSar mi rkang 'bum	110
Volume 111	নামনে মু আই মাই মাই মাই মাই মাই মাই মাই মাই মাই মা	111
Volume 112	ग्रायद्भारा प्राया प्राय प्राया प्राय प्राया प्राया प्राया प्राया प्राया प्राया प्राया प्राया प्राय	112
Volume 113	বঙ্গুবাঝ'ন'র্মুম'বাঝুর। bsGrags pa skor gsum	113
Volume 114	ন্ত্রিবর্ত্রিন্তিন্তিন্তিনিন্তিন্তিন্তিন্তিন্তিন্তিন	114
Volume 115	ব্ম'ঝামন' ই'মার্ডিন। nam mkh' rwi gcod ইুমাঝ'রুর'ব্রম'ঝামন' ষ্ট্রী'মার্ডিন। rDzogs chen nam mkha' spyi gcod	115
Volume 116	ম্মান্ত্ৰ স্থাম্ Rab gnas skor	116

Volume 117	รุมะ विर क्रिं वर्षे विर देश dmar khrid sngon 'gro'i khrid	
	rim इसर हो ५ 'तु मृष्ट्र रूट : ब्रॉक्प	117
	dMar khrid dug lnga rang grol	
	বাম্ব্রবাশ্বরের gsang ba gsang chen	
	चय.जश.शायव. वर्सू वर्चेश. हूँ योषा श. में दें. योषा बा शायर हो. के. शायव वर्सू देस्	
Volume 118	टश.त.उर्देश.तपु.र्वेयोश.श्रीय.योशट.य.योशट.कुर्य.श्रीय.तो	118
	Zab lam mkha' 'gro 'bum rdzogs ma rgyud gsas mkhar sde lnga mkha' 'gro dgongs pa 'dus pa'i thugs sgrub gsang ba gsang chen sgrub pa	
	र्शें र्ने र खुर्के र्ना se dor lha rgod	
Volume 119	योशर.र्जयोश.योशर.यषु.क्रैंर.क्रैं.कुर.रूल.तो	119
	gSang sngags gsang ba'i rgyud rgya cher rol pa	
Volume 120	बेग् केंद्र ख़ू भे से वेंद्र ।	120
	Theg chen lha yi me long	
	শূর্ত্ব শূর্ট্র বুষ্ট্রবাশ দ্বিব। gcod kyi dmigs khrid	
Volume 121	ग्रस्ट म्रिंद प्येद प्रविद दें र पु।	121
	gSang gcod yid bzhin nor bu	
Volume 122	यो: मिंद अूत का	122
	Ge khod smad cha	
	यिषुद्र:र्यः श्रेव:रयव:रूठ:यवित्।	
Volume 123	gshen rab skyes rabs rnam bshad ਡੂਲਾਲਾਕੁਰ,ਡੂਕਾਰਾਕ੍ਰੇਡ,ਨਰਾਗੂੰਡੂਲਾਨਰਾਡੂਲਾਨ੍ਰਰਚੱਨਾਕੁੰਨੇਬੁੰਨਰਾ	123
	rNam mkhyen rgyal ba gshen rab kyi skyes rab rnam bshad nor bu'i phreng ba	
Volume 124	म्रासिन्यन्यः मत्रेः मिब्रा	124
	Mu med bdal ba'i gzhung	

Volume 125	भ्रान्त महिश्व त्युक्त सुक्त न्युक्त त्या स्था न्युक्त त्या सुक्षा skad gnyis shan sbyar dang sa lam rnam bzhugs sdus श्राप्य सी क्रुक्य न्युक्त न्युक्त स्था सुक्षा Sa lam gyi rnam gzhag dang skad gnyis shan sbyar	125
Volume 126	ৰু অন্যুষ্ণ ক্ট্ৰিছ্ৰা Zhu lugs zhi khro (2 volumes: I-p.1-996; II- 997-2104)	126
Volume 127	५४वः वे निर्देशः के dpa' bo bdun p stod cha निरंगिवायः १४वः वे निर्देश्वा bDer gshegs dpa' bo bdun sgrub	127
Volume 128	ব্দর র্মান্ত্র বা শ্লুব্ কা dPa' bo bdun pa smad cha	128
Volume 129	याश्वर द्वेया भे नर्गेर भा gsang thun thig le bkod pa	129
Volume 130	वन्तराङ्के स्रोतेना सेट पाडेश द्वापान प्रमान है। प्रमा	130
Volume 131	र्हेनाश्र के सुन्त सुन्	131
Volume 132	શ્ભુ'ગાશુરા લેદ શ્ભુગ sKu gsum zhing sgrub	132

Volume 133	श्रुम् हुन देया या या छेन सार्वे राग् sNyan rgyud rig pa gcer mthong	133
Volume 134	अञ्च प्रते 'द्रम्थि 'द्रम्' sum brgya pa'i 'grel dang ti ka	134
Volume 135	र्इ.गासुक्षः पोर्ड १८५८। rTsa gsum yi dam kun 'dus	135
Volume 136	র্টা শ্বুবাবাখনে ব্রুবাবাখনে বিদ্যাল Tshe sgrub g.yung drung gur khang র্টা ব্রুবাবাখা শুলুবাখা শুলু	136
Volume 137	भुत्रसुवानाश्वर नवे नहिं अर्केन स्नाश भुत्र मुश्या विश्वर नाश्वर नाश्वर हो र द्वार आव वे हैं चेरा sGyu 'phrul gsang ba'i gtso mchog thugs sgrub kyi lag len gsal byed nam mkha'i nyi zer	137
Volume 138	श्रुम कुर गुर्भेम 'वर्गे रेस' य कुम्मा sNyan rgyud kyi sngon 'gro rim pa rnams (Phyag khrid)	138
Volume 139	शुरु द्राप्तर द्रुक्ष घर। grub dbang rnam thar	139
Volume 140	สัสพราคาจัก tshe g.yang kha sprod  สหารัสาทุพราคาจักท์  Zab don gsang ba snying po Note, this volume is incomplete. It begins on page p. 251	140
Volume 141	ব্দন্দের্ক্তর্মনাশ্রমান্ত্রীব্ থেশ শ্রীবা dBang chen gsal byed las thig	141

Volume 142	र्शे भारत के प्रति क	142
Volume 143	মুনা থেই শ্লুব শ্লুব sTag la'i sgrub skor	143
Volume 144	র্মু হৈন্ত্রী অ'বা Klong rgyas 'grel pa	144
Volume 145	गुष्पर सर्हेग रेथ य। gSang mchog rol pa	145
Volume 146	অন্য থের ব্র্ হ'ন্ব থা Lag len nor bu'i do shal	146
Volume 147	यभित्र रसायगाय केत्र सेवि प्रगास कया gShen rab bka' chen po'i dkar chag	147
Volume 148	र्हेमाश केंद्र 'सू' य र्शेमा' य येयथ। rDzogs chen lta ba thog 'bebs II	148
Volume 149	ग्रायार स्वाया स्वीद स्वर स्वर स्वर स्वर स्वर स्वर स्वर स्वर	149
Volume 150	ব্ৰথান্থ্য দুন্দ্ৰ ন্থ্য ব্ৰথা ক্লিট্ট্ৰন্থ dBal gsas ting mur g.yu rtse'i rgyud	150
Volume 151	वस्यान् ह्रेंग्यायायान्य अया या स्वायान्य स्त्री ।  'Bras bu rdzogs sangs rgyas pa byams sngags bstod वस्यान् ह्रेंग्यायायान्य हुन्गु निर्माद्यात्य ।  ह्रेंग्यायायान्य ह्रिम्प्यायान्य हिन्मु ह्रिम्प्यायान्य ह्रिम्प्यायान्य हिन्मु ह्रिम्प्यायान्य हिन्मु ह्रिम्प्यायान्य हर्म्य ह्रिम्प्यायान्य हर्म्य ह्रिम्प्यायान्य हर्म्य ह्रिम्प्यायान्य हर्म्य ह्रिम्प्यायान्य हर्म्य हर्म हर्म्य हर्म्य हर्म्य हर्म हर्म्य हर्म हर्म्य हर्म हर्म हर्म हर्म हर्म हर्म हर्म हर्म	151

Volume 152	मुयाम्बित्रसहस्रासेन्यम् वार्यामार्थसः मुक्ताः इसः। rGyal gshen mnyam med 'brug gsas zla rgyal rnam	152
	thar	
	यायसारान्द्रायाः क्रेत्रः द्व्याद्यरः सर्देत्रः द्वेत्रायाः यस्य द्वेत्रा	
Volume 153	mkhas p dpal chen rnam thar mngon rtogs lam rim phar phyin গুল্বামান্ত্রী হুমান্বিশ্	153
	gZhi lam 'bras bu'i rnam bshad	
Volume 154	श्र.चुर्या हें हिंदे क्षेत्र क्चें राजय संस्था हैया क्षेत्र	154
	Mi shig rdo rje'i snyan rgyud yab sras dril sgrub	
Volume 155	क्रेव या श्वा र य या व श	155
	rTen gsum rab gnas	
Volume 156	गण्-रदुर र्ग्नेर कुषा मध्य द्वेद यो में रिका	156
	g.Yung drung klong rgyas gsal byed kyi go don	
Volume 157	गहें सुंग्रथ मध्य अप	157
	gTo phyogs bsdus pa	107
	मायस मलेदे सहिंद दर्मीय सूँद का	
Volume 158	মার্ট্র-বার্ঝ'নস্ত্'নব্রুর'গ্রী'বেগ্রীঝ'ম'মামানঝ'ম'মী'নজ্বীঝ'মার্চ্র'মা	158
	mKhas bzhi'i mdzod 'grel stod cha : mDzod gnas bcu bdun gyi 'grel pa mkhas pa mi bzhis mdzad pa	
	भ्रार्क्षेत्र चेता त्र्योय त्यु हैता त्योय य पत्र उदे नगत।	
Volume 159	sga ston theg 'grel 'bru tig 'grel p pan ca'i dka' हेमा'र्रेअ'र्र्स्स,'राज्ञ्ज,'याज्ञायाः वाचे स्त्रों केंद्रिं।	159
	Theg rim rnam bshad gsal ba'i me long	
Volume 160	हिंक्र्य	160
. crame 100	Khro bo ram pa	
Volume 161	দেমক ক্রিক দ্বীক না	161
	Khams chen ti ka 'grel pa	161

Volume 162	श्चन द्वा कुन दिन स्था होता sNyan ngag rgyud dang thor bu	162
	sNyan ngag dang a khrid sogs	
Volume 163	rTsi gzhung 'od zer 'bum ldan	163
Volume 164	ओ'रै'गिहेर'अदे' <b>श्</b> वाया	164
	Me ri gter ma'i sgrub pa	
Volume 165	ন্ধুমান্থান্থান্থান্থান্থান্থান্থান্থান্থান্থ	165
Volume 166	विट:मूर्ट, द्रयामा तर्रमा नट विषया मध्य विट मुर्चे वि	166
	Khyung rgod rigs 'dus dang byams ma'i byad bkrol	
Volume 167	यधियः स्थेतः विवाधः स्थेतः १८ म्य १ म्य	167
	gShen lha'i thugs sgrub dang bdud 'dul gsang ba'i sgrub pa	
Volume 168	वॅर्-डेर-विवाम	168
	'Od zer 'khyil ba	
	द्रेव प्रसम्बुद विशेष drel dmar rgyud 'grel	
Volume 169	इंदु नगर सुन दियोय।	169
	Dre'u dmar rgud 'grel	
Volume 170	श्रु.चेर्-अदु.श्रुव-म	170
	Mi dred ma'i sgrub pa	
Volume 171	ब्रार्बे वर्ष वर्ष वर्ष वर्ष वर्ष वर्ष वर्ष वर्ष	171
	Ma mo 'dus pa'i yang snying drag sgrub	
	ব্ৰথানাম্ব্যান্ত্ৰিন্ত্ৰ dbal gsas don rgyud	
Volume 172	न्यायायायायायायायायायायायायायायायायायाया	172
	gSas mkhar rin po che spyi spungs dpal gsang ba 'dus pa don gyi rgyud	

_		
Volume 173	まち게지 Zla dkar	173
Volume 174	र्न्यः सून् स्राप्तः य। dBal stag phur pa	174
Volume 175	रेव केंद्र श्चेंद्र आये श्चुपा ऑप्रा Rin chen sgron ma'i sgrub skor	175
Volume 176	র্জিব5্মা Khro 'dur	176
Volume 177	মানর ক্রির সর্মার্থ ক্রমান্তর স্বর্থ বিশ্বর্ত্তর বিষয় ক্রমান্তর বিষয় করা	177
Volume 178	প্রমন্ত্র্বিজ্বিস্ক্রা Sher phyin stod cha	178
Volume 179	প্রমন্ত্রীর স্ক্রাস্ক্রা Sher phyin smad cha	179
Volume 180	रूपाश्वायम् rTsa gsum mchog lnga	180
Volume 181	รุง (dus sgrub pa	181
Volume 182	ॾॖॣॖॾॖॣॸॱॸॖॕॿॱॺॻॖऀॺॱॸ॒ॸॱॴॸॱॾॖॖ॓ॱॺॖऀॸॖॱऄऀॴ ॴॸॱॾॖॖ॓ऄॣ॔ॺ॔ॱॺॻॣऀ rTsa rgyud don 'grel dang yang rtse khrid yig	182
Volume 183	हें भे चेता वर्गे वा प्रदा्धा प्रहुपि दूस प्रविष्ट्र rJe yi theg 'grel dang sum brgya pa'i rnam bshad	183
Volume 184	রুবু'বেমম'বেশ্রীঅ'ব্দ'ঝম'শ্রীবৃ  rMa'u khams 'grel dang lam khrid	184
	rivia u knams grei dang iam knrid	

Volume 185	चर्-र-क्रु.बाल.उचर-सैबा.ध्रा	185
	bDud rtsi g.yu 'brang phyug mo	
Volume 186	गार्डे अर्केग न्या सुवा	186
	gTso mchog dgra brub	
Volume 187	नङ्क्ष्र्र-इक्ट्र-नगःभेगानङ्गा	187
	brDa sprod rtsa rgyud dag yig bcas	
	নাধ্যমন্ত্ৰি ক্লুমেন্ত্ৰীৰ gsar bon rta mgrin	
Volume 188	ন্থম: ব্র্ : ক্র্ অন্ত্র্বা	188
	gSar bod rta mgrin	
Volume 189	र्ह्म्याश्चात्क्ष्यः द्वारा स्टब्स्या स्टब्स्या स्टब्स्या स्टब्स्या स्टब्स्या स्टब्स्या स्टब्स्या स्टब्स्या स	189
	rTogs ldan bla ma'i rnam thar sogs rnam thar skor	
	ग्रीयः वक्ष अस्य देश स्वापा वर्षियः वरुष स्वाप्त स्वापत स्वाप्त स्वापत स्वाप्त स्वापत स्वाप्त	
Volume 190	Gyer 'cham nam ris srog 'khor bcas sna tshogs bsdus pa	190
	न्मवास्त्रम् द्भार्येदी प्यतः स्त्रीतः स्वीत्रा	
	dPal ldan lha mo'i yang snying sogs	
	गुरु तर् रुष रेत के र द्वे कुर तर्क स्र साम्य स्था त्या त्येत्।	
Volume 191	Kun 'dus rin chen rtsa rgyud 'tshams bsdam lag len ๆสาวรุงารุราริจิาวภูณายุ	191
	Kun 'dus dang de'i 'grel pa	
Volume 192	श्रायशः सीयः मुष्टे दुः क्रुंशः व्यः प्रदः योषादः क्रुंयः गीवः प्रबदः खेदः क्रेव।	
	mkhas grub rin blo'i rnam thar dang g.yang sgrub kun bzang lung chen	192
	र्या.श्रॅर.ल.तुश.श्रुं.वर्तेवा.ग्री.ध्र्यं ही।	
	Dag snang ye shes sgyu ʻphrul gyi bon sde	
Volume 193	<u>ष्ट्रिन्</u> हुन्, नुग	193
	Khro bo rgyud drug	

Volume 194	अ:क्रु:५नर:नले।	
	Ma rgyud dbang bzhi	194
Volume 195	इयार्स् भुं हेंग्या	195
	drag po sku rdzogs	
	बिन्द्रिवर्वा zhi ba rwi 'dul	
Volume 196	बिनः <b>श्ची</b> यन्या	196
	Zhi ba spyi 'dul	
	र्हेग्रथ'स्व'वर्डेर'य'र्र्स्बेर्क्न्य'इर्र्स्य'र्र्स्य'इर्स्युव'वरुषा	
Volume 197	bZod pa dang mi ston rnam thar dang bla ma rtsa sgrub bcas	197
Volume 198	র্মুদ্যবাধ্যমানের্দ্রবাধানর্ভ্মা	198
volume 190	sTong gsum 'khrugs bcos	170
Volume 199	गुद्र च ब द व व व व व व व व व व व व व व व व व व	199
	Kun bzang 'khor ba kun 'dren	
	₹ःदस्यार्थार्स्यात्र्रुर्वात्रुर्वात्रुर्वात्रुर्वे देवे देवे देवे देवे देवे देवे देवे द	
Volume 200	rkyang 'phags khro gnyan dbu za bon ri'i dkar chag रेना वहेंद्र ग्रीर के हे वेंद्र ग्रीक्विशस्त्र स्वराहर थेंद्र मृद्याश हे है आ	200
	Rig 'dzin gyer mi nyi 'od kyi skyes rabs rnam thar yon tan thugs rje nyi ma	
	<u> </u>	
Volume 201	dbu ma'i rang 'grel dang lung rgyud वेमा'स'केब'से 'न्न्'ब'र्स्ट्र्स्येल'न्ट्रल्स्ट्र्स्ट्र्	201
	Theg pa chen po dbu ma rang grel dang lung rgyud	
Volume 202	द्ये.बट.चाश्नट.चढु:क्रैट.भूरा	202
	Phyi nang gsang ba'i rgyud skor	
Volume 203	रू. इ.स	203
	rNam thar phyogs bsdus	

Volume 204	সমুস্ম্মানুম্মানুমানুমানুমানুমানুমানুমানুমানুমানুমানু	204
Volume 205	সুদামীমামানামান মেন্টামামা Byang sems gab 'pa'i 'grel pa	205
Volume 206	न्यायायायायायायायायायायायायायायायायायाया	206
Volume 207	र्वि: पूरः चिंद्वरः चिंदिः चेंद्वरः चिंदिः चेंद्वरः चेंद	207
Volume 208	अभुग्नास्यः देवा वर्ष्यः प्रवास्यः। sKu gsum rig 'dus dran pa drag phur अभुग्नास्यः देवा वर्ष्यः द्वा स्यः स्यः स्यः स्यः स्यः स्यः स्यः स्यः	208
Volume 209	कें भ्रुप्त भे भे भे भे कि। Tshe sgrub ye shes go cha	209
Volume 210	ন্যুন'ন্ন-'র্'শ্বুনা Grub dbang bla sgrub	210
Volume 211	মদেষ দেৱী মার্চি দের্মী থা mKhas bzhi'i mdzod 'grel (smad cha)	211
Volume 212	रेगा वहें ब सु ग्राया प्राया प्राय प्राया प्राय प्राया प्राया प्राया प्राया प्राया प्राया प्राया प्राया प्राय प्राया प्राय प्राया प्राया प्राया प्राया प्राया प्राया प्राया प्राया प्रा	212

		1
	कें चुर क्रूब ग्राबा tshe khyung rnam gsum	
Volume 213	क्रें-द्यदः अर्केन् त्वतु अन्दरः द्यव्याष्ट्वरः द्यस्यें द्रदः हिं कें क्रुअव्हें अश्र	213
	Tshe dbang mchog 'dus dang dBal khyung dmar po dang Khro bo rnam 'joms	
Volume 214	रेया'वहेंद्र'वर्ष्य'य'वयस्य केद्र'स्यायव 'भें कुर्	214
	Rig 'dzin 'dus pa thabs chen mkha' yi rgyud	211
	कुरायम् अपन्याम् मान्याम् मान्याम्याम् मान्याम् मान्याम्य	
Volume 215	rgyud 'bum dang rnam thar kor (skor) वाष्ट्र-तुंद-तेंद्र-तुंद्व-तुंद्य-त्य-त्य-त्य-त्य-त्य-त्य-त्य-त्य-त्य-त	215
	g.Yung drung bon gyi rgyud 'bum dang rnam thar nyams mgur	
Volume 216	चिर-श्रेशश्चायायार्य-स्यो श्रेरि	216
	Byang sems gab pa dgu skor	
Volume 217	बनःर्भे:श्रु:मण्या:मरुन:द्वेथ:ग्री:खेन:मा <b>ल्</b> र:।	217
	Zab mo sku gsum bcud dril gyi khrid gzhung	217
Volume 218	विमा रेस मार्थाया प्रति क्रिंद सा	218
	Theg rim gsal ba'i sgron ma	
	दैं यर् या कृत्या द्वारा स्थार स्थित का	
Volume 219	rwi 'dul rta dbu dmar khrus stod cha લેગ ગુખુદ ર્કુદ શુુ વકુવા	219
	Zhi ba g.yung drung spyi 'dul	
	र्दे तर्वा कृत् न्यार विषा श्रूर का	
Volume 220	rwi 'dul rta bu dmar khrus smad cha	220
	ब्रिक्टिल.रस्मिर्यं दयं वयंत्रा	
	Khro rgyal raksha dbu 'bum	
Volume 221	याण्ट दुर र्लेट अ र्ह्मे अ र्ह्ह् राजा बुर ।	221
	g. Yung drung yongs rdzogs rgyud gzhung	

Volume 222	ই্লাম'ক্টর'জ্'ব্বি' হিন্দ্র' মুব'ক্কুর্ । rdzogs chen U ni'i (ri'i) snyan rgyud ইনাম'ক্টর'মনি'ম'ঝম'র্ম'জুম'মুম্'হ্রেম'র্মিন্মা। Theg pa chen po'i sa lam dang U ri stong thun sogs	222
Volume 223	विर विर श्रुव क्रिन ग्री है अर्थ क्रिन विर	223
Volume 224	ন্ত্ৰ মানা ব্যাস্থ্য ন্ত্ৰী কুল হৈছিল বিষয় বিষ	224
Volume 225	ब्रिंचें द्रचट केंद्र ग्रीं वर्षेया य द्रट क्रूब प्रविष्	225
Volume 226	चेना रेझ दुव्योय। चनाद युद् दुुें 'धे' द्योय य चेंद्र 'क्क्रें नाश्रय 'तुंद्र हेश तुःच। Theg rim rtsa 'grel + bKa' lung spyi yi 'grel pa bon sgo gsal byed ces bya ba	226
Volume 227	गायाद दें दें दें दें दें प्रांत हो दें प्रांत हैं दें हैं दें हैं दें प्रांत हैं दें हैं दें हैं प्रांत हैं दें हैं दें हैं प्रांत हैं दें हैं हैं हैं हैं हैं हैं हैं हैं हैं है	227
Volume 228	ই'বর্গ'ব্দ'রুঝ'রুঝ'র্ম'র্ম'র্মার্থা rJe 'brug dang zla rgyal rnam thar sogs	228
Volume 229	্ব্ৰমান্ত্ৰ ন্মান্ত্ৰী ক্ৰমান্ত্ৰীৰ ন্মান্ত্ৰীৰ ন্মান্ত্ৰীৰ দিয়া dBal khyung gi lag len rig 'dzin bkod pa	229
Volume 230	প্র বিব বিন্দ্র বিদ্যান বিদ্	230

		1
Volume 231	च.ब.च.च.च.च.च.च.च.च.च.च.च.च.च.च.च.च.च.च	231
	bShad grwa'i bca' yig	
	ही अर मार्थर मार्थेश पश्चर रेता रेट शायत मुर्ट मार्थर स्थित (666	
Volume 232	pages) Phyi nang gsang gsum bca' dpe dang mKha' klong gsang mdos	232
Volume 233	याविम् हे अते चगाव वयुम सेन्।	233
	gShen nyi ma'i bka' 'bum pod	
	गोर्नेन केन ge khod stod cha	
Volume 234	चर्न् त्यनुत्यः मार्थारः चः द्याः केषा	242
	bDud 'dul gsang ba drag chen	
Volume 235	নামম:মান্ম:নাম্ম:নার্ম্ম:বন্যা	238
	gSas mkhar gsang ba sgo dgu	
	ৠন ক্রুন নে ক্রিনা ব্রুনা snyan rgyud dran pa chog drug	
Volume 236	इक्.स.चीश्रदःश्चीच	268
	Dran pa gsang sgrub	
	कुमार्युमः पर्देरः वर्दुमः सूर्वः भी rtsa gsum bder 'dus stong	
	rgyung sgrub pa	
W-1 227	first title p.1 : ग्रायदः सूनायः श्रुप्ते पुरापुरः ५८ः देना यहेव कंवा सुर्या	226
Volume 237	gsang sngags spyi yi dug phyung dang rig 'dzin tshan khrus	236
	क्रु.वासुरा: यदे: वाविवास: तद्रुष: धा	
	rTsa gsum bde gshegs 'dus pa	
Volume 238	श्रीताः भी. मु. कंत्रः श्रीरः तृतुः योग्नरः ययेश।	271
	sPrul sku blo ldan snying po'i gsung 'bum	
Volume 239	ग्राचे महेत्रमा मुख्यमा मदी सार्चे।	n/a
	gZi brjid rab tu 'bar ba'i mdo	

Volume 240	<b>कुरु</b> ,र्या,र्थ्य, ऑुट्.लर्था	254
	rNam dag padma klong yangs	
Volume 241	<u> </u>	244
	dBal phur zhi khro sman gsum pod	
Volume 242	यत्रपानावर्णे हेर्द्रप्रस्	n/a
	Man ngag gnad kyi rdzong 'phrang	
	बर्ने क्रें बे के प्राप्त के mode see me tog 'phreng ba	
Volume 243	दसम्बन्धः मदे मात्रकः महेदा मुन्यके नः सर्वे हो।	263
	'Phags pa'i gnas brten gyi mchod pa mdo sde	
	र्भेट कुट क्षुत भेट या वर्ष दे र क्षुत वेंगाया stong rgyung sgrub skor	
Volume 244	las nor sgrub sogs	255
	क्रु.या <u>र्</u> यस्थ्यायाः वर्षाया	
	bde gshegs 'dus pa	
Volume 245	নুম্বামার্মুর্ক্র	248
Volume 240	Byams ma stod cha (1070 pages)	240
	যাধ্য সূত্র ক্রা ক্রা ক্রা ক্রা ক্রা ক্রা ক্রা ক্	
Volume 246	gSang sngags lam gyi 'jug chog/ gsang sngags lam rim	251
Volume 247	स्र-प्रते त्यों या ।	243
	Phur pa'i 'grel pa	
	र्सूट कुट क्षुत र्सूर अधानधर या अधारीक र्सेन	
Volume 248	stong rgyung sgrub skor las bsad pa lus sbyin sogs kyi skor	249
	क्रु.याम्युयान्यः तर्नुन्यान्यः तर्नुन्यः या	
	rtsa gsum bde gshegs 'dus pa	

Volume 249	याशर.र्जयाश.ग्री.कैल.त्.त.कैट. मुया.तपु.चि.चैया.याश्वर.शक्त्या.शवम.वया.कैल.	267
	र्थे कुन हे अनु न	
	gSang sngags kyi rgyal po pha rgyud rig pa'i khu byug gsang mchog mthar thug rgyal po rtsa ba'i rgyud ces bya ba	
Volume 250	<u> </u>	241
	dBal mo dra thab dmar nag pod	
Volume 251	नर्भेर् हेंग्य र् ग्रेंट क्ये bstod tshogs (klong rgyas)	
	p.1 क्रूबाबाहुन क्रुवान मिनेन स्माया rnam mkhyen rgyal ba	265
	gshen rab la	
	<u>a</u> £.₹≈1	
	Klong rgyas	
Volume 252	यायतः तर्ग् क्वां यहें वि क्वं या वर्षे ।	299
	mKha 'gro rgya mtsho ('i rnam thar)	
Volume 253	বার্ড মর্ক্রবা নুরা ক্রমে শ্লুনি gtso mchog dgr chos skor	
	ব্রা'বর্তুস'অম'ব্যা'রার্থা'রা বর্ত্ত্রীবাধা'র্থাবা	256
	dGra bcom yang dag mthar thug gi 'grigs yig	
Volume 254	गुरु सुरु अंश्रेश्र राय केर में विंद सुर अंदि कुर वावाय पर दे हूर स्	
	नश्रुअः दें अवरः श्रीदः वी नतु दः ह्री विश्वः वा	276
	Kun spangs sems dpa' chen po khod spungs mdo rgyud grags pa'i rnam thar mdor bsdus ngo mthar snying gi bdud rtsi zhes bya ba	
Volume 255	ग्विंद्र:ग्रिंद्र:प्रथर।	260
	gShen gter dre'u dmar	269
1	·	l

Volume 256  ত্বিশ্বন্ধ ন্ত্ৰী বনুধ নাত্ৰ মান্ত্ৰ মান্ত্ৰ মান্ত্ৰ মান্ত			
ত্বিশ্বন্দ্রমন্ত্রন্ত্রন্ত্রন্ত্রন্ত্রন্ত্রন্ত্রন্		कुवा रत्य में जो विद्युद नावय सेंग्या rgyal rabs bon gyi 'byung	
rGyal rabs dang bsTan 'byung  ন্মন্ত্ৰম্মন্ত্ৰীর শ্বন্ধন্ত্ৰমন্ত্রীর শ্বন্ধন্ত্রীর শ্বন্ধন্ত্রী শ্বন্ত্রী শ্বন্ধন্ত্রী শ্বন্ত্রী শ্বন্তির শ্বন্তির শ্বন্তির শ্বন্তির শ্বন্ধন্ত্রী শ্বন্ধন্ত্র	Volume 256		270
Volume 257  Volume 257  বিষয়ের মুর্র মুর্র মুর্র মুর্র মান্ত্রম মুর্রা মুর্র মুর্রা মুর্রা মুর্রা মুর্রা মুর্রা মুর্রা মুর্বা মুর্রা মুর্রা মুর্রা মুর্রা মুর্রা মুর্রা মুর্রা মুর্রা মুর্বা মুর্রা মুর্বা মুর্রা মুর্রা মুর্রা মুর্রা মুর্রা মুর্বা মুর্বা মুর্বা মুর্রা মুর্বা			
dbal phur bsnyen sgrub las gsum gyi zin bris skor দ্বীর্মান্যব্যার্মীর্মান্যব্রমান্ত্রীর্মান্ত্র বিদ্যালয় yi tshogs 'khor bsnyen sgrub  Volume 258  Volume 258  Volume 258  Volume 259  কিন্তু বিশ্বনি বিশ্বনার্মীর্মান্ত্র বিশ্বনার্মীর্মান্তর বিশ্বনার্মীর্মান্তর বিশ্বনার ব			
Volume 258  Volume 258  Volume 258  Volume 258  Volume 258  Volume 259  Volume 260  Volume 261  Volume 261  Volume 261  Volume 262  Right মান	Volume 257	dbal phur bsnyen sgrub las gsum gyi zin bris skor	240
bstan gnyis gling pa'i skyes rabs rnam thar gter 'byung lo rgyus ইন্থিন নেইন্ধা শিল্প ক্রিন্থ ক্রম্বার্থন নির্মাণ করেন নির্		Yi dam dbal phur gyi tshogs 'khor bsnyen sgrub	
lo rgyus  হি ইপ্রন্মন ইন্ত্রা  তি ক্লিন ক্লান্ত্রা  তি rgyus  হি ইপ্রন্মন নি ক্লান্তর বালুন বি ক্লান		नसून,गहेन,ग्रीट पते क्वेन रतम क्रूंग वर गहेर विट लें क्रूंग	
Volume 258       ইট্রইন্মনিট্রা       ইট্রইন্মনিম্রান্ত্রির্বা       272         য়ৢয়য়য়য়ঢ়য়			
rDo rjhe phreng ba'i rgyan : O rgyan rgyal tshab bstan gnyis gling pa yi : skyes rab gter 'byung lo rgyus las : rdo rje phreng ba'i rgyan  Volume 259  The gabeu gnyis stod cha  Siমান ব্রাবর্ধন ব্রেক্সিন্তর নার্ভারত বির্বাধন বর্ধন ব্রাক্সিন্তর নার্ভারত বির্বাধন বর্ধন বর	Volume 258		272
gnyis gling pa yi : skyes rab gter 'byung lo rgyus las : rdo rje phreng ba'i rgyan  Volume 259  ক্রিন্মন্ত্রন্ধি শুর্মিন্ধ্র বির্বাধি বুর্মিন্দ্রন্ধি নির্বাধি নির্ব		मुक्षारमामिरावर्षुरावर्षा हिंहिसेरामवे क्वि	
Volume 260 Cho ga bcu gnyis stod cha  \[ \begin{align*} \frac{\text{N}}{2} \times \text{N		gnyis gling pa yi : skyes rab gter 'byung lo rgyus las :	
Cho ga bcu gnyis stod cha  য়ৢয়	Volume 259	র্ক্ত বাদ্ধিশ শ্বূর্ণ কা	n/a
Volume 260     smra seng blo 'phel lha rgod bcas kyi sgrub pod (맞滿方 됐지'라)     258       Lha rgod sgrub pa     259       Volume 261     중'국저도'현주' 백자'라이 기능하는 대한 기능한 기능한 기능한 기능한 기능한 기능한 기능한 기능한 기능한 기능	voidine 209	Cho ga bcu gnyis stod cha	π, α
Volume 261  Lha rgod sgrub pa  Z59  Tshe dbang bod yul ma  (ইনিইক্সুনর্সিনা zhi khro'i sgrub skor  স্কিন্দের্বিইক্সুনর্সিনা zhi khro'i sgrub skor  ইন্মান্ট্রিনিক্সুন্সিনা zhi khro'i sgrub skor  ইন্মান্ট্রনাক্সন্মান্ট্রনাক্সন্মান্ত্রিক্সান্ত্রন্স্রিক্স্মান্ত্রন্স্র্র্র্ন্স্রিক্স্মান্ত্রন্স্র্র্র্ন্স্র্র্ন্স্র্র্র্ন্স্র্র্র্র		श्चार्यात्र विविध्याः भ्रार्केतः यस्याग्रीः श्चुतः यदि।	
Volume 261       ক্র'ন্ন্ন্ন্র্ন্'ঝ্র'মা।       259         Tshe dbang bod yul ma       ক্রিন্রের্ম্বর'র্ম্মা।       zhi khro'i sgrub skor         Volume 262       ক্রাম'ঊ'ন্মান্মান্রেইর'মানের'বর্ম্বুর্ম্বর্মা।       235         ক্রাম'ঊ'ন্র্মান্র্র্মের্মান্র্র্ম্বর্ম্বর্ম্বর্ম্বর্মান্র্র্মান্র্র্মান্র্র্মান্ত্র্মান্র্র্মান্র্র্মান্র্র্মান্র্র্মান্র্র্মান্র্র্মান্র্র্মান্র্র্মান্র্র্মান্র্র্মান্র্র্ম্বর্ম্বর্ম্বর্মান্র্র্ম্বর্মান্র্র্ম্বর্ম্বর্মান্র্র্ম্র	Volume 260		258
Tshe dbang bod yul ma    ট্রিনি শ্বুন শ্বিন বার্বির শ্বুন র্কর ন্র্র্ম শ্রুর বর্মা    Tshe dbang bod yul ma    তির্নিনি শ্বুন শ্বিন শ্বুন শ্বিন আন্বর বর্ম শ্রুর শ্বুর শ্বুর শ্বুর শ্বুর বর্মা    Tshe dbang bod yul ma    Volume 262    Tshe dbang bod yul ma  259  259  259  259  259  259  259  25		Lha rgod sgrub pa	
Tshe dbang bod yul ma    টির্নি:য়ৣব:শ্রুম:শ্রুম:শ্রুম:য়	Volume 261	क्रें-द्यदः वेंद् 'खुव'अ।	259
Volume 262       新来、水、水、水、水、水、水、水、水、水、水、水、水、水、水、水、水、水、水、水		Tshe dbang bod yul ma	20)
हेर त्वें जुण धुर कं ने प्यू अप कें ने त्यों।		बैद्धित भूग भेग zhi khro'i sgrub skor	
	Volume 262	मु:या:पी:न्य:मेरावहेंद्र:यायव:वर्ग् श्रु:स्रुत।	235
Bla ma yi dam rig 'dzin mkha' 'gro spyi sgrub		क्रेरःवर्ते तुगासूर कं वास्था सें वायमी	
		Bla ma yi dam rig 'dzin mkha' 'gro spyi sgrub	

-		ı
Volume 263	पर्प्तारेक् महिर्द्ध स्वारेक् के से से से मार्थ मार्थ के प्राप्त के से से से मार्थ मार्थ के प्राप्त के से	262
Volume 264	नगाय नहेन यशुर शुं नगार कमा bka' brten 'gyur gyi dkar chag नगार कमाश ने आयन या गाय हेन हेंगाश श्री dKar chags de mKhan po g.Yung drung tshul khrims	234
Volume 265	বাদীর ঝ্বাঝ ব্রিনি ক্রম দা gshen lugs khro bo rgyas pa বাখ্য- ব্রু নে উন্মান। g. Yung drung yongs rdzogs (gshen lugs khro bo)	237
Volume 266	শুর বর্ত্ত অনুষ্ঠা ক্রিব শ্রী ক্রুব শ্রিকাশ। Kun bzang mnyam nyid kyi rgyud sogs	n/a
Volume 267	कें द्रपर हुं भेश श्रेंद्र का tshe dbang dzwa this stod cha कें द्रपर द्रपा (ब्रेंश) Tshe dbang drag khros (stod cha)	252
Volume 268	ধুম্মেরীমে phur pa'i 'grel শামারবার্মিমের মেনাস্ক্রমেরীস্কুর্ব। Ka ba nag po man ngag rtsa ba'i rgyud	n/a

	<del>-</del>	
	ব্ৰহ্মতন্ত্ৰ্ৰাবন্ত্ৰী dbyangs can sgra 'grel	
	र्चेटश.१४.४४.४१.११.४४.५५५१.४४.४१.४१.४१.४१.४१.४१.४१.४१.४१.४१.४१.४१	
Volume 269	इन्-नर्स्नि-स्वान्तिः सम्बुत्यः क्रुवः स्त्रीनः मास्यसः नमायः नवते स्त्रीनः वेर् नः विसः न्वाना	275
	dByangs can sgra mdo'i 'grel pa rgyal yum bzang bza' ring btsun gyi dgongs bcud dpyod ldan bye ba'i mgul rgyan srid gsum dga' ba'i snying nor zhes bya ba	
	w.छ्रथं.य.चर्चेंंं.सपु.कॅंश.बर.रेट.तेंं रक्त्र्यू	
Volume 270	A khrid bla ma brgyud pa'i rnam thar dang shar rdza'i thor bu (Shar rdza'i bka' 'bum)	n/a
Volume 271	भु: याहेब: जेव्य: <b>ब्रॅ</b> ट: ।	n/a
Volume 27 1	Lha gnyen shel sgong (Shar rdza'i bka' 'bum)	π, α
	र्बेस न्यू स दूस प्रमाय विष्टु न्याय विष्टु स्वी स वर्ष दिया परि हो सेवा	n/a
Volume 272	sDom gsum rnam par 'byed pa'i bka' brten gyi sa bcad rig pa'i lde mig (Shar rdza'i bka' 'bum)	
Volume 273	श्चे र्बेन देन संकिये सर्हिन।	n/a
Volume 270	sDe snod rin po che'i mdzod I (Shar rdza'i bka' 'bum)	π, α
	মর-মোমর-র্যক্তি জোট্রিস্ত্রর মর্ক্রম্পানর্জ্য মার স্থ্রির বের্র্ত্তি ট্রিস্ট্র মানগার	
Volume 274	युर्कुः सर्वे।	n/a
Volume 27 1	Man ngag rin po che a krhid thun mtshams bco lnga pa'i sngon 'gro'i khrid rim bka' lung rgya mtsho (Shar rdza'i bka' 'bum)	11, u
	हे देव में केवे दूरा घर ५८ विया देश सेयासा	
Volume 275	rJe rin po che'i rnam thar dang theg rim sogs (Shar rdza'i bka' 'bum)	n/a
Volume 276	অ্বা:মঠ্র ন'ব নি শ্রু নমা ম্ 'ব র্ম্ ন ব হৈ র্	
	Yul mchog bzhi skyabs su 'gro ba'i tshul (Shar rdza'i bka' 'bum)	n/a
Volume 277	वर्ने क्ष चित्र क्षेत्र क्षेत्	n/a
	bDen pa bon gyi mdzod sgo	11/ α

	<u> नृष्टी</u> दशःसेवाःसेवःसंक्रिवेःसर्हेत्।	
Volume 278	dByings rig rin po che'i mdzod I (Shar rdza'i bka' 'bum)	n/a
Volume 279	র্মির্ঘ্রম্মত্ন্শ্রীআ্ন্মের্ট্রি (bon thams cad kyi yang mdzod)	n/a
	वाया सर्हे। वाया वसीया बसासावया वसूया सर्हेन।	
	Gal mdo, Gab 'grel, Nam mkha' 'phrul mdzod	
Volume 280	বৃদ্ধীন্ধান্ধান্ধানি কৈনি আইবি। dByings rig rin po che'i mdzod II (Shar rdza'i bka' 'bum)	n/a
Volume 281	याद 'देया' देव 'सं केंदे' सार्हित्। Lung rig rin po che'i mdzod (Shar rdza'i bka' 'bum)	n/a
Volume 282	श्रु'गाशुरु रदः वदा sKu gsum rang shar (Shar rdza'i bka' 'bum)	n/a
Volume 283	พราสราสุมามกรามที่ราชิสุ รูมพามริเมธุญารเริ่มๆนั้รุ่ Yang zab nam mkha' mdzod chen I (Shar rdza'i bka' 'bum) / byams ma'i manDal ba'i chog pod	n/a
Volume 284	र्श्वेर् देव रें के ते सर्हित। तन्न स्वाधान स	n/a
Volume 285	হুম'নএন'র্ট্রার্ন্র্বার্ন্রার্ব্রান্ত্রাক্র্বার্ন্র্ব্রান্ত্রা rNam bshad tshig don dka' gnad rab gsal	n/a
Volume 286	বশার দ্বীর ব্রী ঝ'নডব্। bKa 'rten gyi sa bcad (sdom gsum, Shar rdza'i bka' 'bum)	n/a
Volume 287	ञ्चामहेन नियार्श्वेर । Lha gnyen shel sgong (Shar rdza'i bka' 'bum)	n/a
Volume 288	প্ৰমান্ত্ৰ ক্ৰিয়ে ক্ৰান্তমা Shar rdza'i rnam thar sogs (Shar rdza'i bka' 'bum)	n/a

Volume 289	योग्रथ'न्यप्त 'सें केंदे' गिहेस अर्हित्। Legs bshad rin po che'i gter mdzod	n/a
Volume 290	অন্ত্রন্ত্র্রা স্থান্ত্রন্ত্র্রা     শ্রন্ত্রন্ত্রন্ত্র্রা স্থান্ত্রন্ত্র্রা Yang zab nam mkha' mdzod chen II (Shar rdza'i bka' 'bum) / bon 'chad mkhas pa'i mgul rgyan	n/a
Volume 291	ર્ફ્ને સ્રાય ત્રવે મેં સ્ક્રેંય Blo mun sel ba'i go snon	n/a
Volume 292	বের্থার্থান্ব্রার্ভ্রাব্রবা 'Das log gi tshul bshad	n/a
Volume 293	अूर श्रेत अर्देत स्या में कु य तर श्रे भे या सुर सेंत्। sNang srid mdzod phug gi rtsa ba dang spyi yi gsung pod	n/a
Volume 294	fittle on dpe gdong- ভ্রুম্মা শ্ব্রুমা মান্ত্রমা আরু দ্বামা বিষয়	232 + extra chapter s
Volume 295	र्ह्माश केंद्र माश्रेर मुँ घर आ rDzogs chen gser gyi thur ma	260
Volume 296	र् र्वायं युर्वि क्षेत्र अर्देश क्षेत्रे (dbal phur nag po'i skong mdos skor) र्वायं युर्वि क्षेत्र अर्देश विषयं युर्वे क्षेत्र अर्देश विषयं युर्वे क्षेत्र अर्देश विषयं प्रति क्षेत्र क्षेत्र विषयं युर्वे क्षेत्र क	246

Volume 297  (ja) rgyal kun spyi gzugs dran p nam mkha' rje'i  কুমান্ত্রমান্তর্বার্ত্রমান্ত্রমান্তর্বার্ত্রমান্তর্বার্ত্রমান্তর্বার্ত্রমান্তর্বার্ত্রমান্তর্বার্ত্রমান্তর্বার্ত্রমান্তর্বার্ত্রমান্ত্র্বার্ত্রমান্ত্র্বার্ত্রমান্ত্রমান্তর্বার্ত্রমান্ত্রমান্তর্বার্ত্রমান্ত্র্বার্ত্রমান্ত্র্বার্ত্রমান্ত্র্বার্ত্রমান্ত্র্বার্ত্রমান্ত্র্বির্ত্রমান্ত্র্বার্ত্রমান্ত্র্বার্ত্রমান্ত্র্বার্ত্রমান্ত্র্বার্ত্বর্বির্ত্র্বির্ত্র্বির্ত			1
Yolume 297  ক্রমণ্ডমন্ত্র মান্তর বার্ত্তর বার্ত্তরাইন করা  rNam thar g.yung drung gsang ba'i mdzod chen (vol. Ja)/ gsang ba'i mkha' 'gro bcu gcig rol ba'i le'u  / মি ক্রমণ্ডমন্ত্র মান্তর মা		्रिट्र क्रियःगुरु:श्रुंग्वा <u>च</u> यार्यः इतः यस्यः स्रायदः हेवे।	
য়েন্দ্ৰ হাল্য ব্ৰহ্ম ব্ৰহ্ম হাল্য			
rNam thar g.yung drung gsang ba'i mdzod chen (vol. Ja)/ gsang ba'i mkha' 'gro bcu gcig rol ba'i le'u  Volume 298  (kha) rgyal kun spyi gzugs dran p nam mkha' rje'i ফুর্ম্মর্ম্মর্ম্মর্মর্মর্ম্মর্ম্মর্ম্মর্	Volume 297	र्देश.घर.योलीट.र्टेट.योशट.यदु.शहूर.कुरी	297
Ja)/ gsang ba'i mkha' 'gro bcu gcig rol ba'i le'u  (kha) rgyal kun spyi gzugs dran p nam mkha' rje'i ঝুর ম'ন্থ মনম শুন মন্ত্রম্ম দা  sTon pa lha babs zhing bkod bstan pa  Volume 299  বিষয়েশ্ব মন্ত্রম্ব মন্তর্মান বিশ্বমান বিশ্		মাপ্সম্মের প্রাম্ব বর্ষ্ মহ মাহমা হ্রমার্থ মের এব	
Volume 298  (kha) rgyal kun spyi gzugs dran p nam mkha' rje'i রুর্ম'র্মুর্মরমান্ত্রির্মান্তর্মর্ম্মা  sTon pa lha babs zhing bkod bstan pa  Volume 299  Volume 300  Volume 300  Volume 300  Volume 300  মান্ত্রমান্তর্মান			
ত্তি মূর্মান্থ্যন্ত্রমান্ত্রমান্তর বিশ্ব নার্থার বা sTon pa lha babs zhing bkod bstan pa  Volume 299  বিষয়ের মুর্বর বুর্বা  dBal phur srung bzlog  আনমান্ত্রনামান্তর বুর্বা মান্তর মান্তর বুর্বা ম		्रियो क्रियः गुरु क्रीं या <u>च</u> यारा द्वरा या त्र या या या विद्वरी	
Volume 299  \[ \begin{array} Tan' सুন মুন মুন মুন মুন মুন মুন মুন মুন মুন ম	Volume 298		292
Volume 300  dBal phur srung bzlog  মানমান্ত্রনামান্তরিকামান্তরিক		sTon pa lha babs zhing bkod bstan pa	
Volume 300  dBal phur srung bzlog  মানমান্ত্রনামান্তরিকামান্তরিক	Volume 200	<u> </u>	2/2
Wolume 300 mkhas grub 'jigs med nam mkha'i rnam thar ঝুনমাই মানমানুনানই বামামান্ত ইনামান ইনামান নুনানান হৈ বামান কৈ দিনে (ka)  Volume 301 হিনামান কৈ মিনামান কি লাকিল (ka)  Volume 301 rDzogs pa chen po gser gyi yang zhun (version dbu chen)/ sngon 'gro dbus phyogs  (ক কুমানুন শ্বীনান্ত্ৰনামান কি লাকিল কি লাকিল বিশ্বাসনান্ত্ৰী বামান কি লাকিল কি লাকিল বামান কি লাকিল কি লাকিল কি লাকিল বামান কি লাকিল কি লাকিল কি লাকিল কি লাকিল বামান কি লাকিল কি	Volume 299		n/a
Volume 300  য়্বাম ট্রামেম ব্রাম বইবাম মান্ত্রির মান্তরি কুমারম ব্রাম বর্ম মান্তরি কুমারম ব্রাম বর্ম মান্তরি কুমারম ব্রাম বর্মারম ব্রাম মান্তর বর্মারম ব্রাম বর্মারম ব		মানম'র্ম্বান'রেট্রনাম'য়৾৲ৢয়মানর'য়ৣয়'য়য়	
Volume 301       हूँ ज्ञाश्चर के सं ज्ञाश्चर ज्ञा अंत्र त्या प्रकार के सं ज्ञाश्चर ज्ञा अप्य हुन प्रकार के सं ज्ञाश्चर ज्ञा अप्य हुन प्रकार के स्वाश्चर के सं ज्ञाश्चर के सं ज्ञाश्यर के सं ज्ञाश्चर के सं ज्ञाश्यर के सं ज्ञाश्चर के सं ज्ञाश्चर के सं ज्ञाश्चर के सं ज्ञाश्चर के सं ज्ञाश्यर के सं ज्ञाश्चर के सं ज्ञाश्यर के सं ज्	Volume 300		273
Volume 301 rDzogs pa chen po gser gyi yang zhun (version dbu chen)/ sngon 'gro dbus phyogs			
rDzogs pa chen po gser gyi yang zhun (version dbu chen)/ sngon 'gro dbus phyogs  बिक्यागुर श्रुग्ग्राच्यार द्वर या बर्ग्गाय हैये।  इसाध्य ग्राप् द्वर ग्राप्य प्रदेश हैं है है।  Volume 302  (cha) rgyal kun spyi gzugs dran pa nam mkha' rje'i/ rnam thar g.yung drung gsang ba'i mdzod chen  कें ग्राप्य द्वर प्रया ग्री सेवर या प्रदेश राज्यार प्रदेश		र्हूयाश्वासः केषः संग्याश्वासः मुद्दारा अर्थेषः दर्मा न्यूषः सुवाशा	
মুমাঘ্মানান্দ্ৰ বিষয় ব	Volume 301		261
Volume 302 (cha) rgyal kun spyi gzugs dran pa nam mkha' rje'i/ rnam thar g.yung drung gsang ba'i mdzod chen ক্র'ন্সেং স্থান্ত্রী শ্লীর অমাস্বাহন সমুহা		्रिक क्रियागीय श्रीमां चयारा स्वरास्त्र शायत हिंदी	
rnam thar g.yung drung gsang ba'i mdzod chen हैं नायर प्रयाभी देव यस प्रयास मुद्रा	Volume 302	<b>इ</b> अ:घरःग्रा <u>ण्</u> ट:तुट:ग्राक्ट:पदे:अर्हेट्:केक्।	
		rnam thar g.yung drung gsang ba'i mdzod chen	296

Volume 303	(nga) Khams brgyad gtan la phab pa (dum bu bzhi pa)	n/a
Volume 304	ধুম্'ঘর্ত্ত ধুনা'বঙ্গি' ঝ নি	245
Volume 305	बर्ने केंग वर्ने नित्रा मिने र अर्देन। mdo chog 'dod dgu gter mdzod बर्ने केंग्रिन अर्देन मिने कि केंग्रिन अर्देन केंग्रिन केंग्	257
Volume 306	र्म क्रियागुम् क्रुंग्वाच्यायाद्वर्ग्याद्वर्याः क्रियायायाः हृति। क्रियागुम् क्रुंग्वाच्यायाद्वर्ग्याद्वर्याः क्रियायायाः हृति। क्रियायायायायायायायायायायायायायायायायायाया	293
Volume 307	(ca) rgyal kun spyi gzugs dran pa nam mkha' rje'i क्रुआचर न्याप्य द्वारा प्राप्य प्र	295
Volume 308	क्रेंद्रपट हूं शेश गुँ शुद्द र्ज्जेय श्रीट गुँग श्रुद्द र्ज्जेय श्रीट गुँग श्रुद्द र्ज्जेय श्रीट गुँग श्रुद्द र्ज्जेय श्रीट गुँग श्	250

Volume 309	(nga) rgyal kun spyi gzugs dran pa nam mkha' rje'i क्रुअ: श्चरः गाण्यः दुरः गाण्यः प्रदेश हैं हैं हैं ज्ञान्यः प्रदेश हैं	294
Volume 310	(ca dang a) Khams brgyad gtan la phab pa (dum bu drug pa)	n/a
Volume 311	িশ ক্রিমাশ্রমন্ত্রী সাত্রসাথ হর মারমান্তর দ্বী। (ka) rgyal kun spyi gzugs dran pa nam mkha' rje'i কুমান্তম স্বাধ্য হু নামন নেই মার্চিন্টির। rNam thar g.yung drung gsang ba'i mdzod chen	291
Volume 312	्रिया च्या पुराष्ट्रमा आ (ka) 'bum dum drug ma	n/a
Volume 313	रियो वर्ष प्रश्निमा व्याप्त प्त प्रश्निमा व्याप्त प्रस्त प्रस्	n/a
Volume 314	आप्रभः मुचायदेषाभः भेदः ब्रथः आप्रयः क्रूथः घरः। mkhas grub 'jigs med nam mkha'i rnam thar क्रुप्तसः क्रें खायसः मुचायदेषाभः भेदः ब्रथः आप्रयः क्रुथः घरः द्वारः क्रुथः क्रः द्वारः क्रुथः क्रियः व्याप्तः क्रियः या प्रियः व्याप्तः क्रियः या प्रियः विश्वः क्रियः विश्वः विश्वः med nam mkha'i rnam thar dbyar skyes rnga dbyangs dad pa'i rma bya rnam par rtse ba'i gsung pod gnyis pa (II)	274

Volume 315	ি জ ্রি অ'শ্যুর'য়্বী'শান্ত্রশাষ্ট্রর'র বিষয় সামন ক্রিই।  (a) rgyal kun spyi gzugs dran pa nam mkha' rje'i কুম'লম'নাআম'ন্ত্রমানামানে নেই মার্লিইন ক্রিবা  র্বান্ত্রমান্ত্রমান্ত্রীর'য়্বীর'য়্বিঅ'মার্লিইনা  rNam thar g.yung drung gsang ba'i mdzod chen	298
Volume 316	हे'অম' ফ্র্রা'নন্ত্রি। Nye lam sde bzhi	253
Volume 317	হ্রমমামাস্ক্রহান্ত্র Byams ma smad cha (867 pages)	266
Volume 318	র্মুন নাম্ম্য বেদ্রুলাঝ নর্ডম নত্তর প্রনম থেনা থের। sTong gsum 'khrugs bcos bca' thabs lag len	264
Volume 319	ি ব্ৰাষ্ট্ৰং নাম্বাৰেন্ত নিৰ্ভিশ কু আ বৃত্তী নিৰ্ভিশ নাম্বাৰ নিৰ্ভিশ কু আ বৃত্তী নিৰ্ভিশ নাম্বাৰ নিৰ্ভিশ নিৰ্ভিশ নাম্বাৰ নিৰ্ভিশ নিৰ্	277
Volume 320	'Bum dum drug ma (nga) (Manuscript en couleur, inséré dans le vol. 322.)	n/a
Volume 321	र्वश्यस्य रहाय। dBal phur ram pa	n/a
Volume 322	বন্ম'র্ম'র্ম 'Bum dum drug	n/a
Volume 323	รุสฺ หฺฉิ ัสฺ ัฐฺ รู้สฺ รังกุญ Dran pa'i bla sgrub sogs	n/a

Volume 324	? रेगा'वहेंब'म्यायर'नवेंद्रश्चुन'केब'क'र्कर'येवु'म्यारथ'नउथा। रेगा'वहेंब'भू'गाथुय'न्वेंद्रथ'यनुषा Rig'dzin sku gsum dgongs'dus.	281 ?
(Volume 325) <sup>1</sup>	र्मर केंद्र वर्म प्राप्त प्राप्त क्रिया क्षेत्र वर्म प्राप्त क्षेत्र	247

This is a list of texts in Karmay's catalogue, but not found in this edition :

278, 279, 280, 282, 283, 284, 285, 286, 287, 288, 289, 290

 $<sup>^{\</sup>rm 1}$  There is no 325 in original list, this number was added for our library at Serenity Ridge.

Karmay volume#	Title	Sereni- ty Ridge' Volume #
234	प्रगायः पहेन् 'यशुर 'शुं 'रगार 'कपा bka' brten 'gyur gyi dkar chag रगार कपाय दें 'याध्य 'र्जु र र्ज्य 'श्रिस्या प्रगाय हेन हें गाय स्था dKar chags de mKhan po g. Yung drung tshul khrims bka' rten rdzogs so	264
235	बैदिवे श्रुव र्भेर। zhi khro'i sgrub skor द्वारापी नुरा रेवा यहें दे सावद य्वे श्रुश्चिष् हेर्र योवे नुवासुर र्स्द व्युक्ष र्थेद य्वे श्री Bla ma yi dam rig 'dzin mkha' 'gro spyi sgrub	262
236	রুশাম্মানন্মন্ত্রমার্মিনের্ক্রম্মানা rtsa gsum bder 'dus stong rgyung sgrub pa first title p.1 : শামানার্মানার্ম্রামান্ত্রমার্মান্রমান্র	237
237	নাপ্র অ্বাঝার্র নি ক্রমানা gshen lugs khro bo rgyas pa নাখ্য ব্রু জিন্মা ক্রিমানা g.Yung drung yongs rdzogs (gshen lugs khro bo)	265
238	নামমান্যমানমান্যমান ক্রিনিয়া gSas mkhar gsang ba sgo dgu	235
n/a		

240	รุสณาชุร तस्त्रे दा स्तु ता त्या या गायु सा गायु से निका gsum gyi zin bris skor और इस द्वारा स्वार में किया अपने के स्त्री दा स्वार	257
241	্ব্ৰথ ইন্থ্ৰিন্দ্ৰন্দ্ৰন্ধ্ৰ্য ইন্। dBal mo dra thab dmar nag pod	250
242	নী নির্মান ge khod stod cha ন্ব্ব্রেথ লাশন ন্র্যান্তবা bDud 'dul gsang ba drag chen	234
243	ধুম্মেন্ত্ৰ বৈশ্বীঝামা Phur pa'i 'grel pa	247
244	ร्रम्थः कुर्सि श्रुम् म्यूम्य ये द्रा dBal phur zhi khro sman gsum pod	241
245	ধুম্মের ধ্রুবা মঞ্জিম ম মি মি বিশিষ্ট্র মাধ্য Phur pa'i phyag bzhes me ri bkod legs	304
246	रिनयायर द्यायेते ऑस्ट अर्देश ऑस्ट्रें (dbal phur nag po'i skong mdos skor) द्ययायर प्रभूट अर्देश dBal phur bskang mdos	296
247	र्यट केंद्र यत्र अप। dbang chen 'bum pa र्यट केंद्र यत्र अप अप या विकास के प्रमान के	325

248	ন্ত্ৰম্থ'ম'র্মুব্'ক্রা Byams ma stod cha (1070 pages)	245
249	र्बेट क्रुट क्षुत क्षेट यथा यथा र या यथा क्षुत्र के वाका मुहित क्ष्या अविद्या के skor las bsad pa lus sbyin sogs kyi skor क्ष्या यह या	248
250	कें द्वर हं वेश गु शुर र्त्त्व क्षेत्र गु मश्दर रेंद्।  Tshe dbang dzwa this kyi srung zlog skor gyi gsung pod कें द्वर हं वेश रेवाश खूदे शुर व शे वहेवाश गुर वर ।  शे वहेवाश गुर वर ।  Tshe dbang dzwa this rigs lnga'i srung ba mi 'jigs gur khang	308
251	নামন:মূনাম:এম:ন্ত্রী:এছ্না:র্ক্রনা নামন:মূনাম:এম:ইমা gSang sngags lam gyi 'jug chog/ gsang sngags lam rim	246
252	ক্র'ন্ন্-'র্ন্ইম'র্ম্ন্র্না Tshe dbang dzwa this stod cha ক্র'ন্ন্-'র্নার্ন্র্মা Tshe dbang drag khros (stod cha)	267
253	કે <sup>.</sup> વ્યસ <sup>્</sup> શ્રે <sup>.</sup> ત્રહ્ <mark>ષે</mark> Nye lam sde bzhi	316
254	হুঝ'ব্বা'শহ্ব'র্শ্রহ'অব্মা rNam dag padma klong yangs	240
255	र्भूतः क्रुतः क्र्यूतः क्र्यूतः व्यव्याव्याः क्रितः क्रुतः क्र्यूतः क्रयूतः क्र्यूतः क्रयूतः क्र्यूतः क्रयूतः क्र्यूतः	244

256	नार्डें अर्केना नुमार्केश र्भेन। gtso mchog dgra chos skor नुमानर्केश प्यतः नुमासार मुनामी वसीमाश्रीमा dGra bcom yang dag mthar thug gi 'grigs yig	253
257	बर्ने केंग वर्ने निया मिने स्था mdo chog 'dod dgu gter mdzod बर्मे केंन्स मिने प्रति केंद्र मिने कि प्रति कि प्रति केंद्र मिने कि प्रत	305
258	श्चार्यस्थायः भ्रांत्रेन् प्रस्थायः भ्रांत्रेन्। smra seng blo 'phel lha rgod bcas kyi sgrub pod भ्रांतेन् श्चार्या Lha rgod sgrub pa	260
259	ર્જે 'ત્વદ' મેંત્ર' ખુવા આ Tshe dbang bod yul ma	261
260	र्हे्याश्राकेष याश्री श्रम् आ। rDzogs chen gser gyi thur ma	295
261	र्ह्माश्रास केंद्र से नाश्रीस चुी भार बुद्दा र्थेद्र त्य चे प्रत्य स्थाप प्रत्य प्रत्	301
262	नक् न्याने व याने र न्याने व र व र व र व र व र व र व र व र व र व	263

r		, ,
263	यर्ने श्रे यो त्रे ता वर्षे र या	
	mdo sde me tog 'phreng ba	243
	दस्याश्रासदीयाद्रशास्त्रेद्रयो अर्केन्या अर्केन्या	
	'Phags pa'i gnas brten gyi mchod pa mdo sde	
264	ब्रूट्र-यांश्रम्भायां व्याचार्यम्भायां व्याचार्यम्भा	318
201	sTong gsum 'khrugs bcos bca' thabs lag len	010
	नर्भेर् हेंग्य र् ग्रेंट क्ये bstod tshogs (klong rgyas)	
	p.1 क्रमां महिन्द्वायां चार्याचे नाम mkhyen rgyal ba	
265	gshen rab la	251
	<u>ब</u> ्रह्म	
	Klong rgyas	
266	चुम्रम् सः श्रूर् का	317
200	Byams ma smad cha (867 pages)	31/
	याशर.र्जयाश.ग्री.कैल.स्.स.कैंट. मुयो.स.स्.पि.चैयो.योश्वर.शक्त्यो.शवम.वेयोक्षित.	
267	र्थे द्भुत्वते हुत् देश तुःवा	249
	gSang sngags kyi rgyal po pha rgyud rig pa'i khu byug gsang mchog mthar thug rgyal po rtsa ba'i rgyud ces bya ba	
	श्चनः <u>इ</u> न:दन:द <sup>ं</sup> र्क्ना:दुन	
268	snyan rgyud dran pa chog drug	236
200	इब्र.स.चाबर श्रीचा	
	Dran pa gsang sgrub	
269	यभिवायाहिर देवु द्यारा	255
	gShen gter dre'u dmar	200
270	₹ল. ৼয়৵. বৃধ. শ্রী. বরী হ. মাধ৵. প্র্যাকা	
	rgyal rabs bon gyi 'byung gnas sogs	256
	₹ल.रचश.रट:चर्मेथ.उर्चैट.।	
	rGyal rabs dang bsTan 'byung	

271	સુતા સું તે તે તે તે તો માર વિદ્યા sPrul sku blo ldan snying po'i gsung 'bum	238
272	प्रभूत गाहिस श्चीर प्रते श्चीस र प्रस्था हुस श्चीस र प्राप्त हुस श्चीस	258
273	মানমান্ত্রবিশ্বমান্ত্রির্মান্ত্রবিশ্বমান্ত্রির্মান্তর্বিশ্বমান্ত্রির্মান্তর্বিশ্বমান্ত্রির্মান্	300
274	মানমান্ত্র বেইলামান্তর ক্রমানার কুরারহা mkhas grub 'jigs med nam mkha'i rnam thar ঝুনমাই মানমান্ত্র বেইলামান্তর ক্রমানার কুরারহার ঝুমাই ব্রহমান দ্বামান্তর ক্রমানার কুরার্থি বিশ্বামান্তর ক্রমানার কুরারহার ক্রমানার ক্রম	314
275	रमुद्दश्चरम् विश्व त्रे विश्व त्र क्षेत्र क्ष	269

		1
	गुव सूर्य सेस्य दिया केंद्र में विंद्र सुर्य सर्दे हु न्यायाय पदे दूस सर्देर	
276	नर्भुकार्ट् अधर क्षेट गो नर् न् क्रे लेका गुःन।	254
	Kun spangs sems dpa' chen po khod spungs mdo rgyud grags pa'i rnam thar mdor bsdus ngo mthar snying gi bdud rtsi zhes bya ba	
	र् रहाः क्रूंबः वाश्वरः वव्ययः वेंबः क्रेंबः क्रूबः रहीः क्रांवाबः रे	
277	(dbra ston gsung 'bum bon chos rnam dbye sogs) र्वेद केंद्र मुंद्र अपर द्वेर केंद्रें केंद्र अपर देंद्र मुंद्र अहेंद्र अहेंद्र अहेंद्र केंद्र केंद्र केंद्र	319
	Bon chos kyi rnam par dbye ba so so smos pa nor bu ke ta ka'i phreng mdzes zhes bya ba (2 volumes: I-pp.1-582;583-1390)	
	्रियो र यहवामा दीर वार्षिय हैये वार्षर हैंदे र द्यार महित हैंदि र द्यार महित स्वर्ध स्वर्थ स्वर्थ स्वर्थ स्वर्थ	
278	·æंरुवाःवार्देरःवीः <b>श्</b> वःश्लेरे	n/a
	(ka) ('jigs byed gshin rje'i gsang rgyud dug mtsho khol ma'i las rim khro chu dug gdong gi sgrub skor)	
	्रियो रियल. कुर. दर्विया. योश्वश. कुश. तर्यु. पश्चीर प्रसीत्र तर्या स्थित हो सीय. सी	
279	र.झ.र्.चिकास.र्येष.क्षेत्र.योहेर.लाहूर.	n/a
	(ga) dbal chen 'brug gsas chem pa'i bsnyen bsgrubs las sbyor gyi sgrub skor me ri 'khyil pa rin chen gter mdzod	
	्रिष्ट्रियायाचित्रायानुः सुर्यायायारायाः व्यायाः ग्रीः वर्ष्ट्रयाः यायायः वर्ष्ट्वरायाः	
280	यःश्रे:५गुदे:श्रुद:श्रेद:	n/a
	(kha) bder gshegs rwi spungs gsang ba thugs kyi brnag pa bka' brgyad yi dam sde dgu'i sgrub skor	
281 ?	रैया'यहेंद्र'याश्रद्र'चये सुवाकेद्र'क कंद येयु वाद्रश्राचड्या	
	(rig 'dzin gsang ba'i sgrub chen cha tshang le'u grangs bcas)	324
	देवा वहें अंभु वार्य अर्थे दर्श दर्श	
	Rigʻdzin sku gsum dgongsʻdus.	

282	रिं हे अर्क्स्वान्त्रमः न्यां यसम्बद्धाः क्षेत्र क्षे	n/a
283	कि र्शामी विविध्य स्थित है निष्य हिंदि स्थानी विविध्य है निष्य है	n/a
284	(ja) gsang chen rol pa zang thal sgrub gzhung cha lag	n/a
285	रित्रो सार्थाप्य स्त्रीद विद्यासवे स्त्रुव स्त्रीय प्रदेश स्त्रा स्त्रीय प्रदेश स्त्रीय स्त्र	n/a
286	रित्र विद्युक्ष केंद्र विद्युक्य केंद्र विद्युक्य केंद्र विद्युक्य केंद्र विद्युक्य केंद्य	n/a
287	ি হা শুর নারনের ক্রমেরারেই ক্রমের হিন্দুর নানুর ক্রমেরার বিষ্ণুর প্রাথমির হিন্দুর নানুর ক্রমেরার হিন্দুর বিষ্ণুর হিন্দুর হিন্	n/a
288	र् र् गुरु प्रचर रहे आया विक्षेत्र प्रचे क्षेत्र प्रचे क्षेत्र प्रचे क्षेत्र प्रचे क्षेत्र प्रचे क्षेत्र प्रचे कि lta ba'i rgyud	n/a
289	र् चे चुस्रश्रास्य प्राप्त क्षेत्र सकेंद्र स्व प्राप्त है वास्राय गुर् सेव्य केंवास्य प्राप्त केंद्र वास्त्र क	n/a

_	T	,
290	्रियो पर्ने राम्येग्वया दे सुर्था वायर प्रम्याया मुन्याया प्रम्याया प्रम्यायाया प्रम्याया प्रम्यायाया प्रम्यायाया प्रम्याया प्याया प्रम्याया प्रम्यायाया प्रम्यायाया प्रम्याया प्रम्यायाया प्रम्याया प्रम्याया प्रम्याया प्रम्याया प्रम्याय	n/a
291	्रिया त्रुवा ह्या व्याप्त ह्या व्याप्त व्याप्	311
292	িন ক্রিমাশ্রম্থ্রী সাত্রবাশ হর মারমামানম ক্রিমী  (kha) rgyal kun spyi gzugs dran pa nam mkha' rje'i  ब्रेंस মাঝু ননমান্ত্রী নাম্ব্রামা  sTon pa lha babs zhing bkod bstan pa	298
293	्रिया त्रिक्ष गाँव क्षेत्र गाँव प्रधान प्रधान है वि (ga) rgyal kun spyi gzugs dran pa nam mkha' rje'i क्रिया चर्या प्रधान प्रधा	306
294	रि. क्रियागुम क्रियाच्याय द्वराय त्वस्याय हिये।  (nga) rgyal kun spyi gzugs dran pa nam mkha' rje'i क्रियाय प्रमाय द्वराया स्वयाया क्रियाय प्रमाय प्रमाय प्रमाय स्वयाया क्रियाय प्रमाय प्रमाय स्वयाया क्रियाय प्रमाय प्रमाय स्वयाया  rNam thar g.yung drung gsang ba'i mdzod chen	309

		ı
295	(ca) rgyal kun spyi gzugs dran pa nam mkha' rje'i कूअः वर माणुद दुदः माश्वर प्रार्थे हिंदि केव यशा क्रिंगावश माश्वर प्रार्थे प्रार्थे हिंदि हिंदे ।	307
	rNam thar g.yung drung gsang ba'i mdzod chen las : skye gnas gnyis pa sgrib pa sbyang tshul	
296	ি ক্র ন্যান ক্রী না ব্রবাশ ন্ত্র না ব্রবাশ নির্বাশন করি ।  কুমান্সন না আন নুন না নামন নারী মার্চির ক্রিবা  (cha) rgyal kun spyi gzugs dran pa nam mkha' rje'i/ rnam thar g.yung drung gsang ba'i mdzod chen ক্রী না আন নে না	302
297	(ja) rgyal kun spyi gzugs dran pa nam mkha' rje'i क्रुअ: घर पाप्पर पुरान्य पाप्पर प्रदेश क्रिया प्राप्पर प्रदेश क्रिया	297
298	(a) rgyal kun spyi gzugs dran pa nam mkha' rje'i क्रुआचर न्याप्य हुर न्याया प्रति केंद्रा विकास क्रिका निकास	315
299	মানের বের্না ক্রু আর্ক্র ি ক্রু রাঘন ৈ । mKha 'gro rgya mtsho('i rnam thar)	252



## Revue d'Etudes Tibétaines

#### Déjà parus

#### Numéro 1 — Octobre 2002

#### Pierre Arènes

"Herméneutique des *Tantra* : les "Six extrêmes (ou possibilités alternatives)" (*saṭkoṭi* ; *mtha'* drug). A propos d'un exemple de prégnance des modèles exégétiques des *sūtra*", p. 4-43.

#### Jean-Luc Achard

- "La Base et ses sept interprétations dans la tradition rDzogs chen", p. 44-60.
- "La liste des Tantras du *rNying ma'i rgyud 'bum* selon l'édition établie par Kun mkhyen 'Jigs med gling pa", p. 62-89.



### Numéro 2 — Avril 2003 — Numéro spécial Lha srin sde brgyad

### **Pascale Dollfus**

"De quelques histoires de *klu* et de *btsan*", p. 4-39.

#### Françoise Pommaret

"Etres soumis, Etres protecteurs : Padmasambhava et les Huit Catégories de Dieux et Démons au Bhoutan", p. 40-66.

#### Samten Karmay

"Une note sur l'origine du concept des huit catégories d'esprits", p. 67-80.

#### **Brigitte Steinmann**

"Les *Lha srin sde brgyad* et le problème de leur catégorisation — Une interprétation", p. 81-91.



#### *Numéro 3 — Juin 2003*

#### **Anne Chayet**

"A propos des toponymes de l'épopée de Gesar", p. 4-29.

#### **Brigitte Steinmann**

"La naissance de Lhasin Devge Dolma : une genèse affective du social", p. 30-42.

#### Jean-Luc Achard

"Rig 'dzin Tshe dbang mchog grub (1761-1829) et la constitution du rNying ma rgyud 'bum de sDe dge", p. 43-89.



#### Numéro 4 — Octobre 2003

#### Pierre Arènes

" De l'utilité de l'herméneutique des Tantra bouddhiques à propos d'un exposé de l'appareil des "Sept Ornements" par un doxologue érudit dge lugs pa dBal mang dKon mchog rgyal mtshan (1764-1863)", p. 4-60.

#### Dan Martin

"Bon Bibliography : An Annotated List of Recent Publications", p. 61-77.

#### Jean-Luc Achard

"Contribution aux nombrables de la tradition Bon po: L'Appendice de bsTan 'dzin Rin chen rgyal mtshan à la Sphère de Cristal des Dieux et des Démons de Shar rdza rin po che ", p. 78-146.



#### Numéro 5 — Avril 2004

#### **Brigitte Steinmann**

"The Lost Paradise of the Tamang shaman — Origins and Fall", p. 4-34.

#### **Anne Chayet**

"A propos d'un premier inventaire des monastères bon po du Tibet et de l'Himalaya. Notes de lecture", p. 35-56.

#### Jean-Luc Achard

"bsTan gnyis gling pa (1480-1535) et la Révélation du Yang tig ye shes mthong grol", p. 57-96.



#### Numéro 6 — Octobre 2004

#### Zeff Bjerken

"Exorcising the Illusion of Bon "Shamans": A Critical Genealogy of Shamanism in Tibetan Religions", p. 4-59.

#### Françoise Pommaret

"Rituels aux divinités locales de Kheng 'Bu li (Bhoutan central)", p. 60-77.

#### Nathan Hill

Compte rendu de : Paul G. Hackett. *A Tibetan Verb Lexicon: Verbs Classes and Syntactic Frames.* 2003, p. 78-98.



#### Numéro 7 — Avril 2005

#### **Cathy Cantwell**

"The Earth Ritual: Subjugation and Transformation of the Environment", p. 4-21.

#### Françoise Robin

"Tagore et le Tibet", p. 22-40.

#### Santiago Lazcano

"Ethnohistoric Notes on the Ancient Tibetan Kingdom of sPo bo and its Influence on the Eastern Himalayas", p. 41-63.

#### Jean-Luc Achard

"Le mode d'émergence du Réel — les manifestations de la Base (*gzhi snang*) selon les conceptions de la Grande Perfection", p. 64-96.



#### *Numéro 8 — Octobre 2005*

#### Ester Bianchi

"Sådhana della divinità solitaria Yamåntaka-Vajrabhairava — Traduzione e glossario della version cinese di Nenghai (Parte I)", p. 4-39.

#### Daniel Scheiddeger

"Lamps in the Leaping Over", p. 40-64.

#### Oriol Aguillar

"Los linajes de transmisión de Nyag bla Padma bdud 'dul ", p. 65-83.

#### Ferran Mestanza

"La première somme philosophique du bouddhisme tibétain. Origines littéraires, philosophiques et mythologiques des "Neuf étatpes de la Voie" (*theg pa rim pa dgu*)", p. 84-103.



#### Numéro 9 — Décembre 2005

#### **Anne Chayet**

"Pour servir à la numérisation des manuscrits tibétains de Dunhuang conservés à la Bibliothèque Nationale : un fichier de Jacques Bacot et autres documents", p. 4-105.



#### Numéro 10 — Avril 2006

#### Ester Bianchi

Sådhana della divinità solitaria Yamåntaka-Vajrabhairava — Traduzione e glossario della version cinese di Nenghai (Parte II), pp. 4-43.

#### Brvan Cuevas

Some Reflections on the Periodization of Tibetan History, pp. 44-55

#### Cathy Cantwell& Rob Mayer

Two Proposals for Critically Editing the Texts of the *rNying ma'i rGyud 'bum*, pp. 56-70

#### **Anne Chayet**

Pour servir à la numérisation des manuscrits tibétains de Dunhuang conservés à la Bibliothèque Nationale : II. Un fichier de Marcelle Lalou, pp. 71-88

#### Nathan W. Hill

The Old Tibetan Chronicle — Chapter I, pp. 89-101



# Numéro 11 — Juin 2006 — The sGang steng-b rNying ma'i rGyud 'bum manuscript from Bhutan

#### Cathy Cantwell & Rob Mayer

Introduction, pp. 4-15.

Cathy Cantwell, Rob Mayer, Michael Kowalewky & Jean-Luc Achard The Catalogue section, pp. 16-141.



#### *Numéro* 12 — *Mars* 2007

#### **Guillaume Jacques**

Le nom des *nakṣatrāṇi* en tibétain, pp. 4-10.

#### Oriol Aguillar

La Roca Blanca de Lhang lhang — Un santuario en Nyag rong, pp. 11-23

#### Daniel Scheiddeger

Different Sets of Channels in the Instructions Series of Rdzogs chen, pp. 24-38

#### **Brigitte Steinmann**

De la cosmologie tibétaine au mythe de l'Etat — Historiographie rnyingmapa tamang (Népal), pp. 39-70.

#### Thubten Gyalcen Lama

- *Tamang jātibāre sangkshipta śabda citra* « Traité sur l'origine de la caste tamang » (trad. Brigitte Steinmann), pp. 71-102.
- Book List of Tibetan History for Tamang Study, pp. 103-105.

#### Shen-yu Lin

The Tibetan Image of Confucius, pp. 105-129.



#### Numéro 13 — Février 2008

#### **Guillaume Jacques**

Deux noms tangoutes dans une légende tibétaine, pp. 4-10.

#### **Etienne Bock**

Coiffe de pandit, pp. 11-43.

#### Richard W. Whitecross

Transgressing the Law: Karma, Theft and Its Punishment, pp. 45-74.

#### Jean-Luc Achard

L'irruption de la nescience — la notion d'errance saṃsārique dans le rDzogs chen, pp. 75-108.



# Numéro 14 — Octobre 2008 — Tibetan Studies in Honor of Samten G. Karmay — Part I. Historical, Cultural and Linguistic Studies — Edited by Françoise Pommaret and Jean-Luc Achard

#### Préface

Françoise Pommaret, pp. iii-v.

#### **David Snellgrove**

How Samten came to Europe, pp. 1-6.

#### Françoise Pommaret

"The Messed Up Books" (*Pecha trok wa la*). A personal recollection of Samten G. Karmay and the O rgyan chos gling catalogue (Bhutan), pp. 7-11.

#### Dan Martin

Veil of Kashmir — Poetry of Travel and Travail in Zhangzhungpa's 15th-Century Kāvya Reworking of the Biography of the Great Translator Rinchen Zangpo (958-1055 CE), pp. 13-56.

#### Helga Uebach

From Red Tally to Yellow Paper — The official introduction of paper in Tibetan administration in 744/745, pp. 57-69.

#### **Anne Chayet**

A propos de l'usage des termes "nyin" et "srib" dans le *mDo smad chos 'byung*, pp. 71-79.

#### Janet Gyatso

Spelling Mistakes, Philology, and Feminist Criticism: Women and Boys in Tibetan Medicine, pp. 81-98.

#### Yasuhiko Nagano

A preliminary note to the Gyarong color terms, pp. 99-106.

#### **Amy Heller**

Observations on an 11<sup>th</sup> century Tibetan inscription on a statue of Avalokiteśvara, pp. 107-116.

#### Lara Maconi

Au-delà du débat linguistique : comment définir la littérature tibétaine d'expression chinoise ? "Spécificités nationales" et "spécificités regionales", pp. 117-155.

#### Tashi Tsering

sMar khams 'bom rnam snang ngam/ lha 'dus rnam snang gi skor la cung zad gleng ba, pp. 157-195



# Numéro 15 — Novembre 2008 — Tibetan Studies in Honor of Samten G. Karmay — Part II. Buddhist & Bon po Studies — Edited by Françoise Pommaret and Jean-Luc Achard

#### Anne-Marie Blondeau

— Contribution à l'étude des huit classes de dieux-démons (*lha srin sde brgyad*), p. 197

— Le Réseau des mille dieux-démons : mythes et classifications, pp. 199-250.

#### Tenzin Samphel

Les *bKa' brgyad* — Sources canoniques et tradition de Nyang ral Nyi ma 'od zer, pp. 251-274.

#### **Matthew Kapstein**

The Sun of the Heart and the Bai-ro-rgyud-'bum, pp. 275-288.

#### Cathy Cantwell & Rob Mayer

Enduring myths: *smrang, rabs* and ritual in the Dunhuang texts on Padmasambhava, pp. 289-312.

#### **Kunzang Choden**

The Malevolent Spirits of sTang Valley (Bumthang) — A Bhutanese account, pp. 313-330.

#### **Peter Schwieger**

Tuvinian images of demons from Tibet, pp. 331-336.

#### Hildegard Diemberger

The Buddhist princess and the woolly turban: non-Buddhist others in a 15<sup>th</sup> century biography, pp. 337-356.

#### Tandin Dorji

The Cult of Radrap (Ra dgra), "nep" of Wangdue Phodrang (Bhutan), pp. 357-369.

#### Donatella Rossi

*mKha' 'gro dbang mo'i rnam thar,* The Biography of the *gTer ston ma* bDe chen chos kyi dbang mo (1868-1927?), pp. 371-378.

#### Roberto Vitali

A tentative classification of the *bya ru can* kings of Zhang zhung, pp. 379-419.

#### Henk Blezer

sTon pa gShen rab: six Marriages and many more funerals, pp. 421-480.

#### **Charles Ramble**

A nineteenth-century Bonpo pilgrim in Western Tibet and Nepal: Episodes from the life of dKar ru grub dbang bsTan 'dzin rin chen, pp. 481-501

#### Jean-Luc Achard

Le Corps d'Arc-en-Ciel ('ja' lus) de Shardza Rinpoche illustrant la perfection de la Voie rDzogs chen, pp. 503-532.

#### **Tsering Thar**

Bonpo Tantrics in Kokonor Area, pp. 533-552.



#### *Numéro* 16 — *Avril* 2009

#### Ratka Jurkovic

Prayer to Ta pi hri tsa — A short exposition of the Base, the Path and the Fruit in Bon Dzogchen teachings, pp. 4-42.

#### Daniel Scheidegger

The First Four Themes of Klong chen pa's *Tshig don bcu gcig pa*, pp. 43-74.

#### Hiroyuki Suzuki

Deux remarques à propos du développement du *rabtags* en tibétain parlé, p. 75-82.

Compte-rendu

#### Fabienne Jagou

Gray Tuttle, *Tibetan Buddhists in the Making of Modern China*, New York, Columbia University Press, 2005, p. 83-94.

Annonces de parution, p. 95.



#### To Foreign Readers — Subscribing and contributing to the RET.

The subscription to the *Revue d'Etudes Tibétaines* (RET) is **FREE**. If you are not on our mailing list yet, please send an email to: <u>jeanluc.achard@sfr.fr</u> with the key-word "subscribe" in the subject heading of your email. You will be informed at least twice a year (usually October and April) of new issues appearing on the web.

If you wish to send an article to the RET, please feel free to do so in French, Tibetan, English, Chinese, German, Italian or Spanish. Articles are not limited in length but should be of standard academic levels. Articles should be sent preferably though email (<a href="mailto:jeanluc.achard@sfr.fr">jeanluc.achard@sfr.fr</a>) or on a CD to the following address: Revue d'Etudes Tibétaines, Jean-Luc Achard, Editor, 22 avenue du Président Wilson, 75016 Paris, France.